
**INTERNATIONAL
HELSINKI
FEDERATION FOR
HUMAN RIGHTS**

HONORARY CHAIRMAN
Yuri Orlov

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
Aaron Rhodes

DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
Brigitte Dufour

ADVISORY BOARD (CHAIR)
Karl von Schwarzenberg

EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE
Sonja Biserko
Holly Cartner
Bjørn Engesland
Krassimir Kanev
Andrzej Rzeplinski

PRESIDENT
Ludmilla Alexeyeva

VICE PRESIDENT
Ulrich Fischer

TREASURER
Stein-Ivar Aarsæther

Wickenburggasse 14/7, A-1080 Vienna, Austria; Tel +43 -1-408 88 22; Fax 408 88 22-50
e-mail: office@ihf-hr.org – internet: <http://www.ihf-hr.org>
Bank account: Bank Austria Creditanstalt 0221-00283/00, BLZ 12 000

**Chechnya: Enforced “Disappearances”,
Extrajudicial Killings and Unlawful
Detentions – An Update**

**International Helsinki Federation
for Human Rights (IHf)**

4 August 2004

The IHF has consultative status with the United Nations and the Council of Europe.

MEMBER AND COOPERATING* COMMITTEES IN:

Albania – Austria – Azerbaijan – Belarus – Bosnia-Herzegovina – Bulgaria – Canada – Croatia – Czech Republic – Denmark – Finland – France – Georgia*
Germany – Greece – Hungary – Italy – Kazakhstan – Kosovo – Kyrgyzstan – Latvia – Lithuania – Macedonia – Moldova – Montenegro – Netherlands
Norway – Poland – Romania – Russia – Serbia – Slovakia – Slovenia – Sweden – Switzerland – Ukraine* – United Kingdom – United States – Uzbekistan*

COOPERATING ORGANIZATIONS:

The European Roma Rights Center – Human Rights Without Frontiers – Mental Disabilities Advocacy Center

PURL: <https://www.legal-tools.org/doc/396b7b/>

The International Helsinki Federation for Human Rights (IHF) is a non-governmental organization that seeks to promote compliance with the human rights provisions of the Helsinki Final Act and its follow-up documents. In addition to supporting and providing liaison among 42 Helsinki committees and cooperating organizations, the IHF has direct links with human rights activists in countries where no Helsinki committees exist. It has consultative status with the United Nations and the Council of Europe.

The IHF represents member and cooperating committees in Abania, Austria, Azerbaijan, Belarus, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Bulgaria, Canada, Croatia, Czech Republic, Denmark, Finland, France, Georgia, Germany, Greece, Hungary, Italy, Kazakhstan, Kosovo, Kyrgyzstan, Latvia, Lithuania, Macedonia, Moldova, Montenegro, Netherlands, Norway, Poland, Romania, Russia, Serbia, Slovakia, Slovenia, Sweden, Switzerland, Ukraine, United Kingdom, United States and Uzbekistan. Other cooperating organizations include the European Roma Rights Centre (Budapest), Human Rights without Frontiers (Brussels) and the Mental Disabilities Advocacy Center (Budapest).

President:	Ludmilla Alexeyeva
Vice President:	Ulrich Fischer
Executive Director:	Aaron Rhodes
Deputy Executive Director/Legal Counsel:	Brigitte Dufour
Chief Editor:	Paula Tscherne-Lempiäinen

International Helsinki Federation for Human Rights
Wickenburggasse 14/7, A-1080 Vienna, Austria
Tel: (+43-1) 408 88 22 Fax: (+43-1) 408 88 22-50
Email: office@ihf-hr.org
Internet: www.ihf-hr.org
Bank account: Bank Austria Creditanstalt, 0221-00283/00 BLZ 11 000

? 2004 by the International Helsinki Federation for Human Rights and IHF Research Foundation. All rights reserved.

Foreword

As part of a long-term effort to document the human rights situation in Chechnya and adjoining regions, the International Helsinki Federation for Human Rights (IHF) herewith submits information on a number of cases, including disappearances and violent civilian deaths. The most recent information was gathered in the course of IHF fact-finding missions in Chechnya and Ingushetia on 7 – 13 June and 25 June – 13 July 2004.

These cases are only particular illustrations of a large-scale panorama of human rights abuses, but the details of every case cannot be properly documented. International and Russian mass media, for the most part, does not record events in most parts of the region and cannot work toward transparency that would help make a safer environment for inhabitants. The role of intergovernmental institutions remains marginal and limited to mild criticism of Russian conduct in the region. The IHF is unaware of any effective measures taken by the Russian authorities to address the climate of impunity for human rights violations related to the conflict.

Therefore, the work of nongovernmental organizations – local, national, and international – remains essential. According to Memorial, which systematically monitors the situation in approximately one third of Chechnya's territory, 194 people “disappeared” in Chechnya in the first half of 2004; the fate and whereabouts of 82 of these persons remains unknown. At least 67 civilians died as a result of the armed conflict in the same period.

The situation in Chechnya continues to present the gravest challenge to human rights standards in the entire OSCE region, and as such remains a priority for the IHF and its affiliated Helsinki Committees.

Cases – An Update

a) The cases of *Musa Bakharchiev*, TAC Chernorechye / Grozny (Forced “Disappearance”, 3 June 2003), *Badruddi Bakharchiev*, Grozny (Forced “Disappearance”, 24 April 2004), and *Mairbek Bakharchiev*, Voykovo/Grozny (Forced “Disappearance”, 28 April 2004)

On 3 June 2003, at about 2 pm, unidentified people abducted Musa Bakharchiev (1978) from his temporary accommodation center in Chernorechye, Zavodsky district of Grozny. On June 30, the Procuratura of the Zavodsky district in Grozny initiated criminal case #30099 under Article 126-1 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation.

At about 2 pm Musa was seen in the yard by his mother, who was passing on the way to work, as well as by the person in charge of the TAC. A short time later Musa was no longer there. Someone informed the mother that he is most likely in Khankala. Nothing else is known since then.

08.07.2003 outgoing number 25/3497. Head of Criminal Police of the Grozny Zavodsky ROVD¹ Lieutenant Colonel Bergoiev G. to high inspector of the Grozny Zavodsky district, F^t class lawyer I.N. Klindukhov. In response to your inquiry (02.07.03 outgoing number N16-94 ?-03) about citizen Bakharchiev, abducted from his current TAC on Ashkhabadskaya street, Chernorechye, city of Grozny. We have conducted an operational investigation, but it was not possible to identify people responsible for this crime. Person in charge of the TAC reports only positive things about I.M. Bakharchiev. According to the victim's father, there is no

¹ ROVD = Regional / District Department of the Ministry of Internal Affairs (militia).

blood revenge on him. We will inform you if we receive any additional information that might be of interest to you.

Musa Bakharchiev was detained by federal forces once before, on August 11, 2001, and was released four months later. His father reports:

“We were refugees in Karabulak, Ingushetia. In 2001 we returned home. At first we lived on Guriev street, in my brother-in-law’s apartment, because our house was destroyed. We moved to this TAC in June of 2002.

On August 11, 2001, my son went to the wedding of his friend Umar Baisaev. He stayed late and ended up spending the night there, because, as you understand, it’s better not to walk the streets after dark. At 5 am armed masked people broke into the apartment where they were sleeping and took them away. They had come on a UAZ truck. My son says that he was almost immediately abused. He was shifted between Zavodsky, Leninsky and Oktyabrsky ROVDs. No one told me this, I found it out myself. A criminal case was initiated against him. We hired a lawyer. But what can a lawyer do under such circumstances? My son was released after four months. But his friend was convicted. His friend was forced to sign all papers against himself. They told him that they will disgrace him if he doesn’t sign. He signed. My son came out injured all over, with traces of torture. Now I can say it: we paid a large sum for him. I borrowed the money. Half of this debt is still hanging on me.”

An excerpt from the December 2001 decision to stop criminal prosecution of Musa Bakharchiev.

During the investigation of this case, it was determined that in December of 1999 U. Baisaev joined an illegal armed formation, illegally acquired automatic weapons and ammunition, and participated in armed raids against the Russian Federation military during the winter of 2000. In May 2001 he organized terrorist acts in public areas of Chernorechye, Grozny.

During Baisaev’s detainment, Bakharchiev M.Sh. was found in the apartment and also was detained. Baisaev confessed to having committed the crimes he was accused of. He confirmed his testimony while taking part in surveying the crime locations. He clarified that Bakharchiev did not commit any crimes together with him, had not known about them, and during the detainment was in the apartment by accident, as they had participated in a wedding that day and Bakharchiev stayed overnight because of late time.

Musa Bakharchiev’s father further reports:

“On April 24 this year my brother Badruddi Bakharchiev was detained. He is 37. He worked in the management of housing and utilities on the 56th section of the Oktyabrsky district of Grozny. People in masks came on a passenger car without license plates – a Zhiguli of 9^h or 6^h model. It was in the morning, beginning of the work day. They took him directly from work. Two men in masks emerged from the car, and one of them asked the other: “Which one?” The other pointed at my brother, and they took him away. There are witnesses to this, because it happened at work.

Four days later my cousin, Mairbek Bakharchiev, also about 37 years old, was abducted from Voykovo, Grozny. He stood talking with his relative when a 9^h model of Zhiguli without license plates stopped near them. Then it was almost the same story: two people in masks approached, only this time one of them put a gun to Mairbek’s head. He asked the other: “Which one?” The other pointed at Mairbek, they put him in the car and left.

They spoke Russian with an accent. That’s all. Nothing since then. Both have disappeared. In the middle of the day people are taken away, and the prosecutor’s office says it knows nothing.

If a person is guilty, let them say what he is suspected of and where he is held. But have you heard from any family who was informed of this?

We all see what is happening. Money is being made here on dead bodies. I will not give even a penny. Not for my son, not for my brother, not for my cousin. I wouldn't give even if I had it. That has led to people making money like this. If one or two persons refused to pay, they would understand that it won't last."

b) The case of Temur Khambulatov, Naursky region, 18 March 2004: Unlawful detention, torture and extrajudicial execution

At about 3 am on 18 March 2004, armed camouflaged people in masks unlawfully detained Temur Khambulatov (born 1980) at his house at 8/2 Dzerzhinskogo street, Saveljevskaja village, Naursky region. The men approached his house on a UAZ truck and two armed military vehicles. They knocked down the doors of the house, grabbed Temur and took him away. When his mother asked where he is going, they told her that they are from FSB and that they are taking her son to the ROVD police station.

At about 9 am on 19 March, Amnat Khambulatova, Temur's mother, found out that her son is no longer alive. Her account:

In the morning of 19 March I went to the ROVD. I asked a policeman: "Was a man with such a surname brought here?" He was avoiding eye contact. So he was brought there... I went to the procurator, Kirill Serkov. He told me: "Yes, he was here. He died yesterday. He fell off a chair." I didn't understand what he was saying. What chair, electric? He repeated: "There is not a single scratch on him. He was brought in for questioning, felt ill, fell to the floor and died."

When he said about the scratches, I believed him. I wanted to take my son's body, but he told me that it was sent to Mozdok for an expertise. I hired two cars and went there that same day. Serkov told me: "You don't need any papers, they will give you the body." They didn't. They asked for documents to confirm that this is my son. I left the hired cars in Mozdok and went back for documents. All in the same day. I asked the expert Legotkin: "How did my son die?" He answered: "There are bruises, but no one dies from bruises."

Excerpt from conclusion of the judicial-medical expertise:

On 18.03.2004, in the course of ORM operation 'Vikhr-antiterror', citizen Khambulatov T.R. was detained and brought to the Naursky ROVD by the OBON² #231, UFSB of the Naursky region, and GSB VOGO MVD RF. A self-made explosive device was found on his person and confiscated. During the interrogation in the ROVD Khambulatov T.R. fell to the floor and died without regaining consciousness.

According to the results of the expertise conducted by Pavel Legotkin, blunt injuries of the head and body were detected, but this was classified as "light damage to health". Death was allegedly caused by the young man's heart disease.

According to Amnat Khambulatova, however, it is obvious that her son was brutally murdered. This is confirmed by marks of canine teeth on his buttocks, multiple fractures of the arms, legs, fingers and skull, as well as open wounds.

² OBON = Special Battalion of the Interior Ministry

The Naursky region is considered to be a relatively stable area of Chechnya, so the murder of Khambulatov provoked a public outcry. On 23 March, the first anniversary of the Chechen Constitution Day, Temur's neighbors staged an unsanctioned protest meeting and blocked the federal road near their village. Representatives of power organs arrived and promised to take care of the case. The Prosecutor's Office of the Naursky region initiated criminal case #40560.

The following document demonstrates that, having understood that the evidence of torture cannot be concealed, FSB attempted to come up with a vindication and accused Khambulatov of manufacturing and possessing an explosive device. The investigation, however, does not possess a protocol of confiscation with signatures of witnesses.

20 March 2004. Outgoing number 16/244. Head of department of UFSB in the Chechen Republic colonel Khumarov V.Kh. to head of OVD of Naursky region police major Skljarov S.N. On 18.03.04 department of UFSB in the Chechen Republic, together with Naursky ROVD and OBON #231 of the Ministry of Interior Affairs of RF, conducted a special operation aimed at Khambulatov T.R., from 8/2 Dzerzhinskogo street, Saveljevskaja village.

Personnel of FSB special division detained Khambulatov T.R., and police captain Tereshin V.V. and sergeant Vetrov V.N., of the Naursky ROVD, searched the household premises. The search uncovered a self-made explosive device prepared for a terrorist act.

During the transportation of Khambulatov T.R. on a UAZ car to a police station, the detained tried to grab an officer's gun and jumped out the back door of the truck. During the chase and capture, citizen Khambulatov was subjected to a number of weakening punches on the torso and returned to the car. At 4:00 citizen Khambulatov arrived to the Naursky ROVD and was transferred into its competence.

On 25 June Temur's mother received a letter from the Prosecutor's Office of the Chechen Republic, numbered N27-40-510-04 and signed by advisor of justice Panenkov A.A.:

Your request for information, addressed to General Prosecutor of the RF, has been considered in the Prosecutor's Office together with materials of the criminal case which tries to uncover the circumstances of bodily damage and death of your son, Khambulatov T.R.

The investigation concluded that the operation during which Khambulatov T.R. was detained and brought to the ROVD of the Naursky region was conducted by forces of UFSB in the Chechen Republic and personnel of the MIA of the RF. Two employees of Naursky ROVD also participated in the mission.

High assistant of the military prosecutor of m/u 20111 has decided to reject initiation of criminal case in relation to the first two groups of participants of the operation. As of today, no decision has been reached about the Naursky ROVD employees. The investigation continues. The dates have been extended to 18.07.04.

Appendix: Excerpt from article "Security to the people" (Terskaya Pravda, April 5 2004, #26-27)

An extensive conference of active representatives of the region took place in the Naursky region administration. Participants included leaders of villages and towns administrations, as well as directors and chairs of organizations, institutions and government properties. The head of the region's administration Nazarenko V.A. chaired the conference. Results of the last presidential elections in Naursky region were discussed in the meeting. A.P. Lugansky, leader of the regional election commission, took the floor. He praised the activity of the residents. 96,2% of the registered voters took part in the election of the President of the RF.

One of the next issues to be raised was the socio-political situation that had developed after the murder of T. Khambulatov from Saveljevskaja village. First assistant to the head of administration, S. Ajubov, reported that Nazarenko firmly intends to bring to justice all those who are guilty, regardless of their ranks and positions. He pointed out that nobody is challenging the operational services' right to search and detain suspected persons. But what was the need to do this in the middle of the night, using armed military vehicles, distressing senior citizens and children, when the suspect was not hiding from anyone and was not trying to resist? He should have simply received a letter summoning him to an appropriate institution. The law does not empower anyone to beat a detained person, not to mention torturing him.

At the same time Ajubov voiced disagreement with the people who blocked the federal interstate in protest. "In a human way, it is understandable," he shared. "It's a cry of the soul, a gesture of desperation, an attempt to draw attention to this event. But one should not fight crime with illegal methods."

The discussion heated up. Atmosphere grew tense. It turned out that even before the tragic event, the region's security was far from solid. The head of administration of Mekenskaja village, N.N. Vasiljeva, stated that at night, power structure representatives enter the villagers' houses, batter and rob them. The offenders don't stop at anything, taking even TV remote controls and simple cups. The villagers are frightened, they don't believe anything can stop the assaults. "I have reported this more than once, but it continues," finished Vasiljeva.

The head of administration of Rubezhnoje village, M. Hadzhieva, observed that four people were abducted from the village some time ago – young men born in 1982-83. No one knows what could have happened to them, had a large crowd of villagers not gone to the ROVD building in the regional center. "The boys were released, but in what condition! Their legs, arms, bodies were torn by dogs. We tried to get an expertise about this event, but the expert firmly refused to do it."

A. Beljaikin, head of village Ischerskaja, confirms that such situations are common nowadays. He declared that in his village, the amount of unmotivated violence towards civilians by people who allegedly represent the security structures has exceeded all imaginable borders. Abductions, robberies and hooliganism are growing in number.

A number of other administration heads voiced their concern about security in the region. They complained that when a person is detained, no one informs him about it. At the same time, they can enter the ROVD only after receiving special passes.

c) The case of *Said-Magomed Aliev*, Grozny, 14 April 2004: Unlawful detention, torture and extrajudicial execution

At about 9 pm on April 14, 2004, armed camouflaged people in masks detained Said-Magomed Aliev, born 1981, who lived at 10 Bogdana Khmel'nitskogo street in Grozny. Aliev was employed as a guard in the Czech "People in Need Foundation" (PINF). That night he stood with a young woman near a temporary accommodation center (TAC) located at 133 Bogdana Khmel'nitskogo street among high apartment buildings. Suddenly two gray UAZ cars with tinted windows approached them. Armed people jumped out, grabbed Aliev and drove him away in an unknown direction.

Frightened, the young women hid in the entryway of the closest building. She refuses to share any information, but she did tell Aliev's relatives that the abductors spoke Russian.

On April 21, 2004, on Dudaev boulevard in the Lenin district of Grozny, a shepherd found a body of a young man with traces of bullet wounds and without documents. Due to the PINF emblem on his coat, it was possible to identify Said-Magomed Aliev.

From an interview with the victim's brother:

I will tell you everything. After what happened, what have we got to fear? We were all born and grew up in the city. There were 8 people in the family, 5 brothers and 3 sisters. Said-Magomed was the youngest. When the war started, for a long time we did not leave. We did not leave because of him. He ran away and joined the boyeviki [fighters] in the beginning of the war. We found him and brought him home. He ran away again. On January 8, 2000, when the city was heavily bombed and it was no longer possible to stay, we left. We lived in Znamenka (Northern Chechnya) in a tent camp. He was leaving the city with the boyeviki via a mine field, was wounded in the leg and ended up in a hospital in Alkhan-Yurt. From there the federals took all the wounded to Chernokozovo. In March 2000 he was amnestied; at home we still have a paper about it. He came back home, and in 2001 we returned to Grozny all together. A part of our family lives here in the TAC, but Said -Magomed lived in an apartment with our father, not far from here. He got a job. He liked working, he was loved and respected among the staff. He was no longer interested in those old things.

That evening he had a date with a girl. They were standing in a well-lit area. Two UAZ cars pulled up to them, threw him into the car and left. They shouted to the girl: "Scream and I will shoot you!" She was in shock. She doesn't remember if there were registration plates on the cars. Five days later his body was found...

Right after he was abducted we turned to the ROVD police station of Grozny's Leninsky district, to the prosecutor's office. The shepherd found his body by accident. His clothes were near the pithole. He had no clothes on. He had been shot in the temple. The eyesocket bone was knocked out. Most likely, he was shot from a pistol. We should have arranged for an expertise, but we were in shock. We buried him quickly. I helped the mullah wash his body, but I didn't see anything... Later the mullah, who washed him with me, told me that there were needle holes under his nails, that his legs were injured and that black bruises were on his chest and back.

The prosecutor's office tells our father than there is no clue to help start off an investigation. The prosecutors themselves complain that they don't have complete access to all places where the detained are held. And they are also afraid.

I have no version. There is no blood revenge on us. The prosecutor's office says that it was watching him; that means that they could not have taken him. So who and why?...

d) The case of *Zelimkhan Isaev*, Urus-Martan, 9 May 2004: Unlawful detention, killing by torture

On May 9 2004, at about 9 pm, representatives of the Russian Federation power structures unlawfully detained Zelimkhan Isaev (born 1979) from his house at 17 Sverdlova street, Gojchu village, Urus-Martanovsky region. About 15 people arrived on two UAZ cars, one of them a minibus commonly called a 'pill'. Isaev's relatives who live nearby tried to enter his house, but were stopped by armed persons. In a few minutes Zelimkhan was driven away in an unknown direction.

That night Isaev's relatives went to the Urus-Martan police station, but were told that he had been neither detained by that particular structure nor brought there. On the afternoon of May 10 the relatives found out through some connections that Zelimkhan had been transferred from FSB to the Urus-Martan ROVD, and that he is in poor condition.

His brothers Isa and Khamzat immediately went to the ROVD, where they ran into an acquaintance, FSB investigator Dmitry Churikov. "It would have been better to send him a summons than to do this," they told him. He answered: "It is not my fault." Churikov also said that Zelimkhan had tried to escape, force was applied, and his ribs were broken.

In the afternoon of the same day, a search was performed in Isaev's house. A search warrant was presented to the relatives, but only one witness was invited. When nothing illegal was found during the search, the searchers faked finding a hand-grenade which they themselves had brought. Three people saw this, including two Isaev brothers, Timur and Khamzat, who were in the house at the time. They produced a written report of the incident.

On May 11 local police called a doctor to Zelimkhan. Only on May 12 a lawyer hired by the family, Lidia Timirgaeva, was allowed to see him. After visiting her client in the ROVD, Timirgaeva announced that he needs urgent medical care, and that in such a condition he will not be able to testify.

From May 12 to 16 Isaev stayed in the Urus-Martan regional hospital, under the guard of the Chechen police. Starting on May 12 relatives could visit Zelimkhan in the hospital. They managed to take a few photographs of the traces of torture on his body. Zelimkhan was also able to tell his brothers what happened to him. He talked a bit every day, few days in a row. Once he spoke with the lawyer and two Chechen policemen in the room.

According to him, right after the abduction a cellophane bag was put on his head and his hands were handcuffed. He was placed on the floor of the car, with feet and guns on top of him, and driven to Urus-Martan. In the commandant's office he was taken up to the 3rd floor, where he was requested to "say it all" while still in cellophane.

When he answered that he had nothing to say, he was told to sign some papers. He still had a bag on his head and could not see what he was signing. So he refused. The investigator retorted: "Now guys will come and solve this." Turning a music box to full volume, the investigator then left the room. After this Zelimkhan was beaten with feet and sticks, tortured with burning cigarettes and electricity. Electrical cords were inserted into his body, including his genitals. He did not see who did it, because he still had the bag on his head. This went on all night.

Trying to stop the tormentors, Zelimkhan told them that his brother is a lieutenant colonel in the Russian Army, but they grew more cruel after this. They asked him how he feeds his family. When he answered that he buys and sells scrap metal for a living, he was beaten again. That night a foul-smelling liquid was poured down his throat. In the morning of May 10 Isaev gave up and signed a whole stack of documents.

On May 16 Zelimkhan began to cough up blood. Local doctors told him that they cannot help him, that he needs an artificial kidney, and offered to take him to a regional hospital of the neighbouring Ingushetia. Doctors from military commandant's office examined him, and the investigator endorsed a transfer to Ingushetia. The investigator ordered Chechen policemen to accompany Zelimkhan, but they understood that he was dying and refused to take responsibility.

From the account of Lechi Isaev, Zelimkhan's brother:

“Police called back the guards. I, our sister, lawyer Timirgaeva and a doctor took Zelimkhan to Nazran. There, the doctors pulled up a cart. He got up in order to get on it, but fell down. Blood poured from his mouth onto this cart. A lot of blood. Doctors took him away.

Our sister and I stayed in the hospital for the night; others left. After some time a shocked doctor ran out to us: “This person is dying! He was tortured in a way none of us in Nazran have seen before. Where are the guards, if he is such a terrorist?”

On May 16 at 11:30 pm doctors told us that Zelimkhan is dead.”

e) The case of Alikhan Suleimanov, Grozny, 6 June 2004: Second unlawful detention within five months

Alikhan Suleimanov (1980, resident of Grozny, 3a Vyborgskaya street) was detained by unidentified men in camouflage uniforms and masks in the afternoon of 6 June 2004 in the Chernorechye region (Grozny). It was the second time in five months that Alikhan had been detained (see below). On 6 June, Alikhan with his two friends had travelled by car to a local river. Armed persons wearing masks and camouflage uniforms approached them in three cars. All except two spoke Russian without an accent. They asked Alikhan and his friends for their identity papers, which Alikhan did not have. Subsequently Alikhan and his friend’s car were taken away, while his friends were allowed to leave. Some time later the owner of the car learned through an acquaintance that his car was parked at the Zavodskoy regional department of internal affairs (ROVD) in Grozny. The authorities returned the car to him after a number of inquiries. However, they did not explain why the car was parked outside the ROVD building and reportedly stated “somebody just brought it and parked it there”.

Comments made by Suleimanov’s neighbor:

“He is a sick boy, he has epilepsy. I feel sorry for him. He is very weak. Sometimes people who fought in the first war are detained. In this case there is no connection to the war at all. Maybe they thought that because his mother sells things at the market, they have money? But this is a very poor family. They moved to this house after they lost everything in Vedeno in 1995 during the first war. All the neighbors helped them. The boy had only been free for 6 days before he was taken again.”

Comments made by Shadaev Shakhid, Suleimanov’s stepfather:

“He was taken for the first time on 25 January 2004 sometime in the afternoon. He was sitting with his brother and another relative in the kitchen when they arrived in two cars and two BTRs (armored personnel carriers). Those who entered the house spoke Russian with an accent. They were Chechens. They grabbed him and dragged him outside without even letting him put on his shoes. I tried to intervene, shouting: “Aren't you Chechens? Let him at least put on his shoes!” They answered very rudely: “Get lost, you bitch! We are the Chechens, not you!”

This took place in January, when it was cold and damp outside. They beat him with their rifle butts and shoved him into the car.

I was also taken by Russians once, but I was allowed not only to put on my shoes, but also to take warm clothes with me.

We were not allowed to leave the house. Our neighbors, however, managed to write down one BTR’s license plate number. As a result of this, we were able to find out through an acquaintance that Alikhan was kept in the OMON building in the Zavodskoy region of Grozny [headed by Rustam Alkhanov]. We found it out only on the third day. However, they denied that he was there for an entire week, and only then did they state: “Yes, he is with us. We have to

check him and only then can we release him.” He was released after four months, and came out extremely exhausted. But who comes out of there healthy? We performed an X-ray, which revealed that he had pneumonia, but we didn't have any money for the treatment. The most important thing, however, was the fact that when they released him they did not return his passport. I think they just lost it. Upon leaving he asked for his document: “How can I survive without a passport? I'll be detained!” But they answered: “If you are detained, tell them our number and they will contact us and we will release you. Stay calm. You are innocent, everything is OK.”

Right after Alikhan Suleimanov was detained his mother rushed to the OMON. They suggested that he might be in ORB 2.³ However, she was refused entry there.

The family was kept unaware about his whereabouts, and only learned from unofficial sources that he was in ORB 2 after all. The officials of ORB 2 first denied it, and it took a week for them to confirm that he was there. According to his mother, he refused to obey an order requiring him to confess to murdering Dzhabrail Yamadaev from Vedeno.

f) The case of Adam Chuchaev, TAC Okruzhnaya/Grozny, 12 June 2004: Unlawful detention

Adam Chuchaev, resident of the temporary accommodation center (TAC) for internally displaced persons (IDPs) in the Okruzhnaya settlement (Grozny) “disappeared” for four days after he was detained in the afternoon of 12 June 2004 by unidentified armed and masked men.

Chuchaev's family had been living in Ingushetia, in the tent camp “Sputnik”, since the beginning of the war, and had returned to Grozny in March 2004.

The armed men arrived in two cars, *UAZ* and *Zhiguli*. They stopped Chuchaev near the entrance to the TAC when he was returning home, pushed him into the car and drove away. Later, several of the men who had taken him returned and, without showing any documents, searched the house. They seized all his photo-albums with pictures of his friends and relatives.

On 10 June, when the ‘Satsita’ camp was being closed down, the head of the department of migration issues of the Chechen Republic Asu Dudurkaev stated that living conditions in the TAC were normal and that an active resettlement process was underway. “People asked us to maintain security, so we have guards there.” But neither the guards nor the commandant of the TAC tried to intervene and stop the perpetrators of Adam Chuchaev's “disappearance”.

Chuchaev was released on 16 June after one of his relatives, employee of a Chechen power agency, interfered. Chuchaev had been brought to ORB 2 and was beaten in the first day of detention. In an arbitrary way they demanded that he take responsibility for some terrorist acts.

g) The cases of Ajndi Mazaev, Sernovodsk, 15/16 June 2004: Extrajudicial killing. The cases of Magomed Nakaev, Rusman Paraulidze and Aslan Idigov, Sernovodsk, 15/16 June 2004: Forced “disappearances”

In the night of 16 June 2004 In Sernovodsk, Ajndi Mazaev (born 1987) was murdered, and three other people “disappeared”: Magomed Nakaev (1982), Rusman Paraulidze (1987) and Aslan Idigov (1982).

³ ORB 2 is the former RUBOP (the regional Ministry of Interior department for the fight against organized crime).

On June 15, 2004, about 11 pm, Mazaev, Nakaev and Paraulidze were standing near former recreation center. Two cars suddenly approached them. Armed people grabbed Nakaev and Paraulidze and drove them away; Mazaev managed to escape. He reported the incident to Nakaev's uncle, who in turn reported it to his neighbour, investigator Shamaev. Shamaev asked that they wait until morning, because he could not contact the ROVD in the middle of the night. After this Mazaev went home.

Excerpts from the interview with his father:

He came home at about midnight. Usually he returned earlier, so I asked him why he was so late. He did not answer and went to bed. I didn't even turn on the light, so I don't know if he was beaten or not. I had almost fallen asleep again when I heard knocking. I asked: "Who is it?" and was answered: "Neighbours." But I had already understood from the voices that it was no neighbours. I opened the door and saw one of them already aiming his gun at me.

They entered and demanded that I turn on the lights. There were three of them, without masks. They spoke Chechen. Everything happened in Chechen. I turned on the light. My wife and daughter awakened. The small one got scared when she saw them with guns. They woke up my son and asked him: "You are the one who escaped?". He answered: "Yes". They continued: "You think that if you ran away, you have survived?" He answered: "What could I do, you beat me up and put me on the ground, I fell!" All of this went on for 2-3 minutes, and they led him outside. I wanted to ask them, who they are and where they are going, but one of them tried to hit me with his leg. I thought, ok, they will check him and bring him back. My wife felt that since they were Chechens, it was not so dangerous. It was about 2:35 am. After 15-20 minutes we heard shots, but we didn't think that they fired at him. There was simply nothing to shoot him for. I stood near the house, and when dawn broke, I walked and my wife walked with me. We saw black form on the road. I understood everything and said: "He had been shot." She ran to him, cried...

I would give you his photo, but my wife hid it. They come at night, take away photographs. I wish I could ask them, like a man, just me and they: why did they kill a young boy? Next day we spoke to police and they reported everything to the prosecutor's office of the Achkoy-Martan region. Investigators came and started a criminal case. They found bullet shells. When they cut open his sweater, they found a 5,45 mm bullet in his chest. I don't remember their faces. They stood sideways. I was half asleep, everything happened so fast. I didn't know that they are taking him to kill him.

They came on foot, without cars. Later I found out that he was in the yard of the recreation center with two friends. The friends were taken away, and he was hit and managed to run away. Now it is not possible to find out the details. Then another boy, Idigov, was abducted from the village. These three boys were probably beaten, so they showed where we live. They wouldn't have found my son otherwise, we live on the outskirts of the village.

I had told him: "This house is yours. If you want, keep building it." I wish I could leave now, so I don't see this house again. I'm tired. He was a small boy during the first war, and I got him out of there. Was running after him. Now I failed to shield him...

That night, at about 3 am, Aslan Idigov (1982) also "disappeared" from his house on 34 Krupskaja Street. The men arrived on two cars of model UAZ-469, with "police" written on the sides. Registration numbers were A0221 and A0225(6). Idigov's mother was beaten when she tried to stop them. The perpetrators spoke Chechen.

The families of the “disappeared” young men have turned to the prosecutor’s office of the Achkoy-Martan region, to the ROVD of Sunzhensky region, the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Republic, and the Office of the Military Prosecutor of the Republic.

On 26 June 2004, parents and relatives once again went to the city to look for their boys. This time they headed for Khankala, because they had received some unofficial information that the boys are there. Moreover, they were orally promised that they can pick up their children. In Khankala they were refused because some officials were not present. On the way back, at about 3 pm on the exit from Grozny, they got into a car accident. All three people in the car – Alkhazur Elzhurkaev (Nakaev’s father) and Roza and Nazu Paraulidze (Paraulidze’s mother and aunt) – died on the spot.

Magomed Nakaev, Rusman Paraulidze and Aslan Idigov remain “disappeared” as of 30 July 2004.

h) The cases of *Albert Basaev, Zajndi and Adam Nakaev, Sernovodsk, 19 June 2004: Unlawful detentions*

In Sernovodsk, in the early morning of 19 June 2004, a special operation was performed by an OMON special police unit from Grozny, jointly with one or more military units. About 50 cars entered the village and headed for the center, to Kutralov and Sheripov streets, as well as to the outskirts to the area of the former recreation center, streets Kurortnaja and Sanatarnaja. They acted rude, humiliating and beating the citizens, performing unsanctioned searches. For example, they entered the house of the Salamov family and began to beat the two brothers, Mamed (1984) and Adam (1986). When Zara Junusova, their mother, tried to defend them, she was also beaten. Afterwards the boys were led outside, to a car with darkened windows. The man inside the car said: “It’s not them. These are students.” After this the Salamov brothers were released.

A similar thing happened in the house of the Basaev family, where Albert Basaev (1981) was unlawfully detained and taken away on an Ural truck. When Tamara, his mother, tried to stop it, she was beaten.

That same day Zajndi (1979) and Adam (1984) Nakaev were beaten and taken away on an Ural truck with their hands tied. After some time, near the Assa recreation center, the car stopped and Zajndi was tossed out. The cars then proceeded across the Sunzhensky range.

Zajndi ran home, took his car and followed the automobiles that were taking away his brother. Along the way he talked to salespeople at road-side markets and found out that the cars headed to Grozny. Later Zajndi reported that both Russians and Chechens were among the men who carried out the abduction. They asked the boys about the Wahhabis in the village, but did not listen to the answers. The most shocking thing to Zajndi was that during this questioning, the Chechens who sat nearby in the truck were telling jokes to each other and laughing.

After these abductions, villagers staged a protest and closed off interstate Rostov-Baku in the area of the Sernovodsk crossroads. At about 11, Aliamkin, the vice prosecutor of the Achkoy-Martan region, and Tepsaev, the vice minister of the social security department of the Interior Ministry, approached them and promised that the four missing persons (from 15 and 19 June) will be returned.

In the afternoon, Albert Basaev and Adam Nakaev indeed came home. But the search for the men abducted on 15-16 June had to continue.

i) The case of *Magomed Bukayev*, TAC Chernorechje/Grozny, 20 June 2004: Forced “disappearance”

On 20 June 2004 about 10 pm in Grozny (Chernorechye village, Vinorgsky st), unidentified people in masks abducted a TAC resident, Magomed Bukayev (1981), second-year student of the Oil Institute.

Magomed was sitting on a bench in a TAC yard with his friends when four armed people in masks attacked them, put the young people on the ground and shot at the area around them. After that, they captured Magomed, brought him to the car waiting at the gates (white Volga) and drove him in an unknown direction. Bukayev’s mother witnessed the abduction from the balcony, but she did not have enough time to run up to the abductors’ car.

The Bukayevs fled Chechnya before the second Chechen campaign had started, and stayed at the Bart TAC in Ingushetia. They came back to the republic in June 2002.

Magomed is disabled from the childhood: he cannot move the left hand. His parents immediately addressed the militia, informed all the check posts about the incident, but the car with abductors was not found.

j) The case of *Tamerlan Salsanov*, Sernovodsk, 29 June 2004: Unlawful detention

In Sernovodsk, on 29 June 2004 at about 11 pm, Tamerlan Salsanov (born 1977) was unlawfully detained. He had lived at 12 Nagi Asuev St.

About 10 camouflaged armed people in masks approached on the house on two white automobiles without license plates. They seized Salsanov, who was watching TV, without explaining anything or showing any documents. He was dragged into one of the cars and taken away in an unknown direction. His wife, who was home at the time, reports that the abductors spoke Chechen.

Right after the incident, Salsanov’s wife ran to the relatives who live nearby. Together, they approached the region’s administration head, as well as the ROVD of Sunzhensky region. Fortunately, the family had relatives employed in power structures of the Chechen republic, and this affected the further course of events.

The police ordered its checkpoints to stop two white Zhiguli (model 7). Prefect Salman Gazmagomadov, together with local police, chased the abductors. Traffic policemen and OMON fighters stopped the two white cars at a traffic control post at the entry to the Chernorechye district of Grozny.

That same day Memorial staff members visited the ROVD of Sunzhensky region. There they found out that the abductors had presented documents of the Chechen PPS MVD (Post-Patrolling Service of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Chechen Republic). They said that they were carrying out a special operation in detaining Tamerlan Salsanov, who was suspected of assisting and financing the boyeviki. The ROVD was not informed of this operation allegedly in order to prevent possible information leakage. The head of the ROVD called the superiors of the men, who confirmed that they were carrying out orders.

When a group of human rights defenders tried to meet him, he refused. On June 30 in the afternoon Salsanov returned home.