Name of legal analyst: Michaela Latini		Date Table completed: 30 May 2008
Contact details: michaela.latini@milieu	ı.be	
Country	ITALY	

List of transposing national legislation (including legal reference and abbreviations used in TOC)

D.Lgs n. 30/07: Decreto Legislativo 6 febbraio 2007, n. 30 "Attuazione della direttiva 2004/38/CE relativa al diritto dei cittadini dell'Unione e dei loro familiari di circolare e di soggiornare liberamente nel territorio degli Stati membri", pubblicato nella Gazzetta Ufficiale n. 72 del 27 marzo 2007. Legislative Decree of 6 February 2007, n. 30 on the transposition of Directive 2004/38/EC concerning the right of citizens of the Union and their family member to move and reside freely within the territory of the Member States", published in the Official Journal (O.J.) n. 72 of 27 March 2007.

D.Lgs n. 286/98: Decreto Legislativo 25 luglio 1998, n. 286 "Testo unico delle disposizioni concernenti la disciplina dell'immigrazione e norme sulla condizione dello straniero", pubblicato nella Gazzetta Ufficiale n. 191 del 18 agosto 1998 - Supplemento Ordinario n. 139. Legislative Decree of 25 July 1998, n. 286 on Laws on the regulation of immigration and provisions on the conditions of the foreigner national, published in the O.J. n. 191 of 18 August 1998, Supplemento Ordinario, n. 139.

Law 28 May 2007, n. 68: Legge 28 maggio 2007, n. 68 "Disciplina dei soggiorni di breve durata degli stranieri per visite, affari, turismo e studio ", pubblicata nella Gazzetta Ufficiale, Serie generale, n. 126, del 1 giugno 2007. Law 68/2007 on the residence for short periods of foreigner nationals for visits, business tourism and study, published in the O.J. n. 126, of June 2007.

D.Lgs n. 32/08: Decreto legislativo 28 febbraio 2008, n. 32 "Modifiche e integrazioni al decreto legislativo 6 febbraio 2007, n. 30, recante attuazione della direttiva 2004/38/CE relativa al diritto dei cittadini dell'Unione e loro familiari di circolare e di soggiornare liberamente nel territorio degli Stati membri", pubblicato nella Gazzetta Ufficiale n. 52 del 1 marzo 2008. Legislative Decree of 28 February 2008 amending and supplementing Legislative Decree of 6 February 2007, n. 30 transposing Directive 2004/38/EC concerning the right of citizens of the Union and their family member to move and reside freely within the territory of the Member States, published in the O.J. n. 52 of 1 March 2008.

Law Decree 92/2008: Decreto legge 23 maggio 2008, n. 92 Misure urgenti in materia di sicurezza pubblica., pubblicato sulla Gazzetta Ufficiale del 26 maggio 2008 - in vigore dal giorno successivo. Law Decree 23 May 2008, n.92, Measures on public security, published in the O.J. n. 122 of 26/5/08, entered into force the following day that is the 27 May 2008. [Law n.125/2008 has converted Law Decree 92/08 with amendments].

Law n.3/2003: Legge 16 gennaio 2003, n. 3 Disposizioni ordinamentali in materia di pubblica amministrazione, pubblicata nella *Gazzetta Ufficiale* n. 15 del 20 Gennaio 2003 - Supplemento Ordinario n. 5. Law of 16 January 2003, n. 3 on Provisions in the field of public administration, published in the O.J. n. 15 of 20 January 2003, SO n. 5.

RD n. 773/31: Regio decreto 18 giugno 1931, n. 773 Approvazione del testo unico delle leggi di pubblica sicurezza, pubblicato nel Supplemento Ordinario, alla Gazzetta Ufficiale, n. 146 del 26 giugno 1931. RD 18 June 1931 n. 773 on the approval of the Laws in the field of public administration, published in the O.J. n. 146 of 26 June 1931

Law n. 1185/67: Legge 21 novembre 1967, n. 1185: Norme sui passaporti, pubblicata nella Gazzetta Uffciale n. 314 del 18 dicembre. Law of 21 November 1967 n. 1185, provisions on passports published in the O.J. n. 314 of 18 December

Law of 24 December 1954, n. 1228; Legge 24 December 1954, n. 1228, "Legge anagrafica" - Law of 24 December 1954 n. 1228, "Anagrafic Law"

Presidential Decree (PD) n. 223/89: Decreto del Presidente della Repubblica 30 maggio 1989, n. 223 Regolamento anagrafico della popolazione residente, pubblicato nella Gazzetta Ufficiale del 8 giugno 1989 n. 132. Presidential Decree of 30 may 1989 n. 223 on the new registry of the resident population, published in the OJ of 8 June 1989, n. 132.

Presidential Decree n. 445/2000: Decreto del Presidente della Repubblica del 28 Dicembre 2000 n. 445, Testo Unico delle disposizioni legislative e regolamentari in materia di documentazione amministrativa, pubblicato nella Gazzetta Ufficiale n. 42 del 20 febbraio 2001 Supplemento Ordinario n. 30. Presidential Decree of 28 Decembre 2000, n. 44, Laws on legislative and statutory provisions in the subject of administrative documentation, published in the O.J. n. 42 of 20 February 2001, Supplemento Ordinario n. 30

D.Lgs n. 181/2000: Decreto Legislativo 21 aprile 2000, n. 181 "Disposizioni per agevolare l'incontro fra domanda ed offerta di lavoro, in attuazione dell'articolo 45, comma 1, lettera a), della legge 17 maggio 1999, n. 144", pubblicato nella *Gazzetta Ufficiale* n. 154 del 4 luglio 2000. Legislative Decree of 21 April 2000, n. 181 on provisions facilitating the meeting between supply and demand work, implementing Article 45, paragraph 1, letter a) of Law on May 17, 1999, n. 144, published in the O.J. n. 154 of 14 July 2000.

D.Lgs n. 297/2002: Decreto Legislativo 19 dicembre 2002, n. 297 "Disposizioni modificative e correttive del decreto legislativo 21 aprile 2000, n. 181, recante norme per agevolare l'incontro tra domanda e offerta di lavoro, in attuazione dell'articolo 45, comma 1, lettera a) della legge 17 maggio 1999, n. 144", pubblicato nella *Gazzetta Ufficiale* n. 11 del 15 gennaio 2003. Legislative Decree of 19 December 2002, n. 297, on provisions amending and correcting legislative decree of April 21, 2000, n. 181 on provisions facilitating the meeting between supply and demand work, implementing Article 45, paragraph 1, letter a) of Law on May 17, 1999, n. 144, published in the O.J. n. 11 of 15 January 2003.

Law 152/75: Legge 22 maggio 1975, n. 152, Disposizioni a tutela dell'ordine pubblico, pubblicata nella Gazzetta Ufficiale n. 136 del 24/05/1975. Law 22 May 1975, n. 152, Provisions against Mafia, published in the O.J. n. 136 of 24/05/1975

Law 69/05: Legge 22 aprile 2005, n. 69 "Disposizioni per conformare il diritto interno alla decisione quadro 2002/584/GAI del Consiglio, del 13 giugno 2002, relativa al mandato d'arresto europeo e alle procedure di consegna tra Stati membri", pubblicata nella Gazzetta Ufficiale n. 98 del 29 aprile 2005. Law 22 April 2005, n. 69, provisions to transpose Council Framework Decision 2002/584/JHA of the of 13 June 2002, on the European arrest warrant and the surrender procedures between Member States, published in the O.J. n. 98 of 29/4/2005.

Criminal Procedural Code (CPP): Codice di procedura penale, D.P.R. 22 settembre 1988, n. 447(CPP), Criminal Procedural Code, approved by Decree of the President of the Republic on 22 September 1988, n. 447

Criminal Code (CP): Codice penale, R. D. n. 1398 del 19 ottobre 1930 - Pubblicato in s. o. Gazzetta Ufficiale, n. 253 del 28-10-1930 (CP). Criminal Code approved by Decree n. 1398 of 19 October 1930, published in the O.J. n. 253 del 28-10-1930

Law 1423/56: Legge 27 dicembre 1956, n. 1423 - Misure di prevenzione nei confronti delle persone pericolose per la sicurezza e per la pubblica moralità, pubblicata nella gazzetta ufficiale 31 dicembre 1965, n. 327. Law of 27 December 1956, n. 1423 Prevention measures against persons dangerous for public security and morality, published in the O.J. of 31/12/1965, n. 327.

Law 575/65: Legge 31 maggio 1965, n. 575 - Disposizioni contro la mafia, pubblicata nella gazzetta ufficiale 5 giugno 1975, n. 138. Law 31 May 1965 n. 575, Provisions against Mafia, published in the O.J. of 5/6/1975, n. 138

Law 645/52: Legge 20 giugno 1952,n. 645 "Norme di attuazione della XII disposizione transitoria e finale

(comma primo) della Costituzione", pubblicata nella gazzetta ufficiale n. 143 del 23 giugno 1952. Law 20 June 1952, n. 645, Provisions transposing the XII temporary and final provision (first paragraph) of the Constitution, published in the O.J. n. 143 of 23/6/1952

Law 895/67: Legge 2 ottobre 1967, n. 895 - Disposizioni per il controllo delle armi, pubblicata nella gazzetta ufficiale, 12 ottobre 1967, n. 255. Law of 2 October 1967, n. 895 , Provisions on the control of weapons, published in the O.J. n. 255 of 12/10/67

Law 497/74: Legge 14 ottobre 1974, n. 497 - Nuove norme contro la criminalità, pubblicata nella gazzetta ufficiale 22 ottobre 1974, n. 275. Law 14 October 1974, n. 497, Provisions against criminality, published in the O.J of 22/10/1974, n. 275

Italian Constitution: Deliberazione dell'Assemblea Costituente del 22 dicembre 1947; promulgazione del Capo Provvisorio dello Stato del 27 dicembre 1947; pubblicazione sulla Gazzetta Ufficiale edizione straordinaria n. 298 del 27 dicembre 1947; entrata in vigore il 1° gennaio 1948. Italian Constitution, published in the extraordinary edition of the Italian O.J. n. 298 of 27 December 1947 and entered into force on 1 January 1948.

Circolare del Ministero dell'Interno n. 19 del 6 aprile 2007: Attuazione della Direttiva 2004/38/CE del Parlamento Europeo e del Consiglio del 29 Aprile 2004 relativa al diritto dei cittadini dell'unione e dei loro familiari di circolare e di soggiornare liberamente nel territorio degli Stati Membri, che modifica il regolamento CEE 1612/68ed abroga le Direttive 64/221/CEE, 68/360/CEE, 72/194/CEE, 73/194/CEE, 75/34/CEE, 75/35 (CE), 90/364/CEE, 90/365/CEE e 93/96/CEE. Circular of Ministry of the Interior n. 19 of 6 April 2007: on the transposition of Directive 2004/38/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council of 29 April 2004 concerning the right of Union citizens and their family member to move and reside freely within the territory of the Member States, that modifies Regulation EEC n. 1612/68 and repeals Directives 64/221/EEC, 68/360/EEC, 72/194/EEC, 73/194/EEC, 75/34/EEC; 75/34 (EC), 90/364/EEC, 90/365/EEC e 93/96/EEC.

Circolare del Ministero dell'Interno del 10 aprile 2007: Decreto Legislativo 6 febbraio 2007 n. 30 Attuazione della Direttiva 2004/38/CE relativa al diritto dei cittadini dell'unione e dei loro familiari di circolare e di soggiornare liberamente nel territorio degli Stati Membri". Circular of the Ministry of Interior of 10 April 2007 Legislative Decree 6 February 2007 n. 30 on the transposition of Directive 2004/38/EU concerning the right of Union citizens and their family member to move and reside freely within the territory of the Member States.

Circolare del Ministero dell'Interno del 18 luglio 2007: Decreto Legislativo 6 febbraio 2007. Diritto di libera circolazione e soggiorno dei cittadini dell'Unione e dei loro familiari Circular of the Ministry of Interior of 18 July 2007: Legislative Decree of 6 February 2007 n. 30. Right of free movement and residence of Union citizens and their family members.

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Circolare del Ministero dell'Interno n. 45 del 8 agosto 2007: Decreto Legislativo n.. 30/07. Diritto di libera circolazione e soggiorno dei cittadini dell'Unione europea. Circular of the Ministry of Interior n. 45 of 8 August 2007. Legislative Decree of 6 February 2007 n. 30. Right of free movement and residence of Union citizens.

Circolare del Ministero dell'Interno n. 54 del 8 ottobre 2007 Applicazione dell'imposta di bollo sulle attestazioni rilasciate ai cittadini dell'Unione Europea ai sensi del Decreto Legislativo n. 30/07: Circular n. 54 of 8 October 2007 on the Application of charges on the acts released to Union citizens according to D.Lgs. 30/07.

Other abbreviations

- CA: competent authorities
- Art.: Article
- O.J.: Official Journal
- D.Lgs: Legislative Decree
- PD: Presidential Decree
- CP: Criminal Code (Codice Penale)
- CPP: Criminal Procedural Code Codice di Procedura Penale)

Analyzad	logiclation	in	conformity?	(aliab	00.0	nnra	nrinta)
Anaryseu	registation	Ш	comornity.	(CHCK	as a	ւրիւտ	priate)

YES _____ NO ____ Incomplete or/and Incorrect G | I

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord? (y/n)	Comments/Problems
Chapter I	GENERAL PROVISIONS					
Art. 2.1	Definitions For the purposes of this Directive: 1) "Union citizen" means any person having the nationality of a Member State;	Art. 2.1 a) D.Lgs n. 30/07 In this regard also Circular of the Ministry of Interior of 18 July 2007	Art. 2 (Definizioni) Ai fini del presente decreto legislativo, si intende per: a) «cittadino dell'Unione»: qualsiasi persona avente la cittadinanza di uno Stato membro;	Art. 2 (Definitions) For the purposes of this Decree: a) "Union citizen" means any person having the nationality of a Member State;	Y	Effective transposition The definition as such is literally transposed by the Italian Decree; however, the mentioned Circular specifies that also citizens of Norway, Island, Lichtenstein and of Switzerland and the Republic of San Marino are considered as Union citizen, with reference to the transposing Decree.
Art. 2.2 (a)	2) "Family member" means: (a) the spouse;	Art. 2.1 b) 1) D.Lgs n. 30/07 In this regard also Circular of the Ministry of Interior n. 19 of 6 April 2007	b) «familiare»: 1) il coniuge;	b) "Family member" means: 1) the spouse;	Y	Literal transposition
Art. 2.2 (b)	(b) the partner with whom the Union citizen has contracted a registered partnership, on the basis of the legislation of a Member State, if the legislation of the host Member State treats registered partnerships as equivalent to marriage and in accordance with the conditions laid down in the relevant legislation of the host Member State;	Art. 2.1 b) 2) D.Lgs n. 30/07	2) il partner che abbia contratto con il cittadino dell'Unione un'unione registrata sulla base della legislazione di uno Stato membro, qualora la legislazione dello Stato membro ospitante equipari l'unione registrata al matrimonio e nel rispetto delle condizioni previste dalla pertinente legislazione dello Stato membro ospitante;	2) the partner with whom the Union citizen has contracted a registered partnership, on the basis of the legislation of a Member State, if the legislation of the host Member State treats registered partnerships as equivalent to marriage and in accordance with the conditions laid down in the relevant legislation of the host Member State;	Y	Literal transposition However, despite the fact that Italy has literally transposed this definition, the concept of registered partnership does not currently exist in Italy. Therefore "registered partnership" is not equivalent to marriage. So it has finally been decided to transpose the definitions of partner (Art. 2.1 b) 2.1 b) 3 and 2.1 b) 4) but then in the body of the Directive, the concrete rights that should be recognised to partners are not transposed/recognised (for instance Art. 8.5 b), 10.2 b), 13.1, 13.2 b), 13.2 c) of the Directive).

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY 4/130

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of	Translation into English of national	Fully in accord?	Comments/Problems
			Member State)	provision	(y/n)	This is because "partners with whom an EU citizen has made a registered partnership" are not recognised as "family member".
Art. 2.2 (c)	(c) the direct descendants who are under the age of 21 or are dependants and those of the spouse or partner as defined in point (b);	Art. 2.1 b) 3) D.Lgs n. 30/07	3) i discendenti diretti di età inferiore a 21 anni o a carico e quelli del coniuge o partner di cui alla lettera b);	3) the direct descendants who are under the age of 21 or are dependants and those of the spouse or partner as defined in point b);	Y	Literal transposition (for "partners" see comment in correspondence of Article 2.2. (b) of the Directive)
Art. 2.2 (d)	(d) the dependent direct relatives in the ascending line and those of the spouse or partner as defined in point (b);	Art. 2.1 b) 4) D.Lgs n. 30/07	4) gli ascendenti diretti a carico e quelli del coniuge o partner di cui alla lettera b);	4) the dependent direct relatives in the ascending line and those of the spouse or partner as defined in point b);	Y	Literal transposition (for "partners" see comment in correspondence of Article 2.2. (b) of the Directive)
Art. 2.3	3) "Host Member State" means the Member State to which a Union citizen moves in order to exercise his/her right of free movement and residence.	Art. 2.1 c) D.Lgs n. 30/07	c) «Stato membro ospitante»: lo Stato membro nel quale il cittadino dell'Unione si reca al fine di esercitare il diritto di libera circolazione o di soggiorno.	c) "Host Member State" means the Member State to which a Union citizen moves in order to exercise his/her right of free movement and residence.	Y	Literal transposition
Art. 3.1	Beneficiaries This Directive shall apply to all Union citizens who move to or reside in a Member State other than that of which they are a national, and to their family members as defined in point 2 of Article 2 who accompany or join them.	Art. 3.1 D.Lgs n. 30/07	Art. 3 (Aventi diritto) 1. Il presente decreto legislativo si applica a qualsiasi cittadino dell'Unione che si rechi o soggiorni in uno Stato membro diverso da quello di cui ha la cittadinanza, nonché ai suoi familiari ai sensi dell'articolo 2, comma 1, lettera b), che accompagnino o raggiungano il cittadino medesimo.	Art. 3 (Beneficiaries) This Legislative Decree shall apply to all Union citizens who move to or reside in a Member State other than that of which they are a national, and to their family members as defined in paragraph 1 b) of Article 2 who accompany or join them.	Y	Literal transposition
Art. 3.2 (a)	Without prejudice to any right to free movement and residence the persons concerned may have in their own right, the host Member State shall, in accordance with its national legislation, facilitate entry and residence for the following persons: (a) any other family members, irrespective of their nationality, not falling under the definition in point 2 of Article 2 who, in the country from which	Art. 3.2 a) D.Lgs n. 30/07 In this regard Circular of the Ministry of Interior of 18 July 2007	2. Senza pregiudizio del diritto personale di libera circolazione e di soggiorno dell'interessato, lo Stato membro ospitante, conformemente alla sua legislazione nazionale, agevola l'ingresso e il soggiorno delle seguenti persone: a) ogni altro familiare, qualunque sia la sua cittadinanza, non definito all'articolo 2, comma	2. Without prejudice to any right to free movement and residence the persons concerned may have in their own right, the host Member State shall, in accordance with its national legislation, facilitate entry and residence for the following persons: a) any other family members, irrespective of their nationality,	Y	Literal transposition The Circular refers to the documents that are requested for the registration (pag. 3) See below Article 8. See also CS for some implementation aspects. The Host Member State should be understood as Italy in this context.

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord?	Comments/Problems
	they have come, are dependants or members of the household of the Union citizen having the primary right of residence, or where serious health grounds strictly require the personal care of the family member by the Union citizen;		1, lettera b), se e' a carico o convive, nel paese di provenienza, con il cittadino dell'Unione titolare del diritto di soggiorno a titolo principale o se gravi motivi di salute impongono che il cittadino dell'Unione lo assista personalmente;	not falling under the definition in paragraph 1 b) of Article 2 who, in the country from which they have come, are dependants or members of the household of the Union citizen having the primary right of residence, or where serious health grounds strictly require the personal care of the family member by the Union citizen;		
Art. 3.2 (b)	(b) the partner with whom the Union citizen has a durable relationship, duly attested.	Art. 3.2 b) D.Lgs n. 30/07 In this regard Circular of the Ministry of Interior of 18 July 2007	b) il partner con cui il cittadino dell'Unione abbia una relazione stabile debitamente attestata dallo Stato del cittadino dell'Unione.	b) the partner with whom the Union citizen has a durable relationship, duly attested by the State of the Union citizen.	N, Incorrect	Almost literal transposition. But overall incorrect transposition since more stringent. The sentence "by the State of the Union citizen" has been added by the transposing Decree and this does change the meaning of the provision since it limits the means of proof for the couple. The means of proof that attest the relationship could also come from the State where they were residing (not necessarily the home MS). There could be also other possible ways of attesting a relationship.
	The host Member State shall undertake an extensive examination of the personal circumstances and shall justify any denial of entry or residence to these people.	Art. 3.3 D.Lgs n. 30/07	3. Lo Stato membro ospitante effettua un esame approfondito della situazione personale e giustifica l'eventuale rifiuto del loro ingresso o soggiorno.	3. The host Member State shall undertake an extensive examination of the personal circumstances and shall justify any denial of entry or residence to these people.	Y	Literal transposition Host MS should be understood as Italy.
Chapter II	RIGHT OF EXIT AND ENTRY					
Art. 4.1	Right of Exit Without prejudice to the provisions on travel documents applicable to national border controls, all Union citizens with a	Art. 4.1 D.Lgs n. 30/07	Art. 4 (Diritto di circolazione nell'ambito dell'Unione europea) 1. Ferme le disposizioni relative ai controlli dei documenti di	Art. 4 (Right to move within the European Union) 1. Without prejudice to the provisions on travel documents applicable to national border	Y	Effective transposition In Italy identity cards and Passports are valid for expatriation, not so the driver licence that is an identity

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord? (y/n)	Comments/Problems
	valid identity card or passport and their family members who are not nationals of a Member State and who hold a valid passport shall have the right to leave the territory of a Member State to travel to another Member State.		viaggio alla frontiera, il cittadino dell'Unione in possesso di documento d'identità valido per l'espatrio, secondo la legislazione dello Stato membro, ed i suoi familiari non aventi la cittadinanza di uno Stato membro, ma in possesso di un passaporto valido, hanno il diritto di lasciare il territorio nazionale per recarsi in un altro Stato dell'Unione.	controls, the Union citizen with a valid identity document/card which is valid for expatriation, according the legislation of the Member State, and their family members who are not nationals of a Member State but who hold a valid passport shall have the right to leave the national territory to travel to another Member State.		document but is not valid for expatriation. Thus the reference in the Italian act.
		Art. 4.2 D.Lgs n. 30/07	2. Per i soggetti di cui al comma 1, minori degli anni diciotto, ovvero interdetti o inabilitati, il diritto di circolazione e' esercitato secondo le modalità stabilite dalla legislazione dello Stato di cui hanno la cittadinanza.	2. The persons mentioned in paragraph 1, who are minors or civilly-disabled or incapacitated persons, exercise their right to move according to the procedures set out by the legislation of the State of nationality.		The transposing decree contains an additional provision that does not impinge on the correct transposition of Article 4.1 of the Directive. Probably Italy refers to the fact that minors or civilly-disabled or incapacitated might be for example accompanied by an older but only if this is provided for in the State of nationality.
Art. 4.2	No exit visa or equivalent formality may be imposed on the persons to whom paragraph 1 applies.				Y	Effective transposition This provision can be considered as transposed referring to Art. 4.1 of D.Lgs n. 30/07 (that requires Union citizens and his/her family members to only have an identity document in order to leave the territory, so, no further limitation/requirements. A contrario, no exit visa is required.
Art. 4.3	Member States shall, acting in accordance with their laws, issue to their own nationals, and renew, an identity card or passport stating their nationality.	Art. 5 Law, n. 1185/67	Il passaporto è rilasciato, rinnovato,[] dal Ministro per gli affari esteri e per sua delega: a) in Italia: dai questori e, in casi eccezionali, dagli ispettori di frontiera per gli italiani all'estero; b) all'estero: dai rappresentanti	The passport is issued, renewed, [] by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and upon its delegation a) in Italy by the <i>questori</i> and, in exceptional cases, by borders Inspectors fro Italians leaving abroad; b) abroad: by the diplomatic and	Y	Correct transposition

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	
			Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
			diplomatici e consolari.	consular representations		
		A-+ 2 DD 772/21		The Main shall select as		
		Art. 3 RD n. 773/31	•	The Major shall release an identity card that is conform to		
			Il sindaco è tenuto a rilasciare alle	the model established by the		
			persone di età superiore agli anni quindici aventi nel Comune la	Ministry of Interior, to the		
			loro residenza o la loro dimora,	persons who have more than 15		
			quando ne facciano richiesta, una	years having the residence or		
			carta di identità conforme al	their dimora in the Commune		
			modello stabilito dal Ministero	and who request it.		
			dell'interno.			
			[]	The identity card has is valid for		
				five years []		
			La carta di identità ha durata di	ive years []		
A . 4 4	The passport shall be valid at least for all	Art. 17 Law, n. 1185/67 as	cinque anni [] [] Il passaporto ordinario è	[] The ordinary passport is	Y	Correct transposition
Art.4.4	Member States and for countries through	amended by Art. 24.2 a) Law n.	valido per dieci anni. []	valid for ten years. []	1	Correct transposition
	which the holder must pass when	3/03	varido per dicer anni. []	value for ten years. []		
	travelling between Member States.		Il passaporto è valido per tutti i	The passport is valid for all		
	Where the law of a Member State does	Art 2 Law, n. 1185/67	Paesi i cui Governi sono	States which Governments are		
	not provide for identity cards to be		riconosciuti dal Governo italiano,	recognised by the Italian		
	issued, the period of validity of any		salvo le limitazioni previste dalla	Government, except restrictions		
	passport on being issued or renewed shall		presente legge. A domanda	foreseen by this law. Upon		
	be not less than five years.		dell'interessato il passaporto può	request of the interested person, the passport may be valid,		
			essere reso valido, mediante	through specification of the		
			l'indicazione delle località di destinazione, per i Paesi i cui	destination locality, for States		
			Governi non sono riconosciuti.	the Governments of which are		
				not recognised.		
Art. 5.1	Right on Entry	Art. 5.1 D.Lgs n. 30/07	Art. 5 (Diritto di ingresso)	Art. 5 (Right on Entry)	Y	Effective transposition
	Without prejudice to the provisions on	In this regard Circular of the	1. Ferme le disposizioni relative ai controlli dei documenti di	1. Without prejudice to the provisions on travel documents		
	travel documents applicable to national	Ministry of Interior of 10 April	viaggio alla frontiera, il cittadino	applicable to border controls,		Despite the reference to Member
	border controls, Member States shall	2007	dell'Unione in possesso di	Member States shall grant Union		States, Italy does not want to regulate
	grant Union citizens leave to enter their		documento d'identità valido per	citizens leave to enter their		what other MS have to do. It wants to
	territory with a valid identity card or		l'espatrio, secondo la legislazione	territory with a valid identity		recognise the validity of the
	passport and shall grant family members		dello Stato membro, ed i suoi	document/card which is valid for		document if this is valid for the MS
	who are not nationals of a Member State		familiari non aventi la	expatriation, according the		of nationality.
	leave to enter their territory with a valid		cittadinanza di uno Stato membro,	legislation of the Member State,		
	passport.		ma in possesso di un passaporto valido, sono ammessi nel	and shall grant family members who are not nationals of a		
<u> </u>			vando, sono ammessi nei	who are not haddhars of a		

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord? (y/n)	Comments/Problems
			territorio nazionale.	Member State leave to enter their territory with a valid passport.		
	No entry visa or equivalent formality may be imposed on Union citizens.				Y	Effective transposition This provision can be considered as transposed referring to Art. 5.1 of D.Lgs n. 30/07 (that requires Union citizens and his/her family members to only have an identity document in order to enter the territory, so, no further limitation/requirements).
Art. 5.2	2. Family members who are not nationals of a Member State shall only be required to have an entry visa in accordance with Regulation (EC) No 539/2001 or, where appropriate, with national law. For the purposes of this Directive, possession of the valid residence card referred to in Article 10 shall exempt such family members from the visa requirement.	Art. 5.2 D.Lgs n. 30/07 In this regard Circular of the Ministry of Interior of 10 April 2007	2. I familiari non aventi la cittadinanza di uno Stato membro sono assoggettati all'obbligo del visto d'ingresso, nei casi in cui e' richiesto. Il possesso della carta di soggiorno di cui all'articolo 10 in corso di validità esonera dall'obbligo di munirsi del visto.	2. Family members who are not nationals of a Member State shall only be required to have an entry visa, when requested. The possession of the valid residence card referred to in Article 10 shall exempt such family members from the visa requirement.	Y	Effective transposition The national provision omits to refer to "Regulation (EC) No 539/2001 or, where appropriate, with national law", stating in general "when requested". It would have been more appropriate/precise to mention the Regulation, but this cannot be considered as a conformity problem that affects the substance of the provision since the Regulation is directly applicable. The sentence "For the purposes of this Directive," is omitted but in this context this is not a conformity problem either. Reference to Article 10 seems to cover any residence card and not only residence cards issued by Italy.
	Member States shall grant such persons every facility to obtain the necessary visas. Such visas shall be issued free of charge as soon as possible and on the basis of an accelerated procedure.	Art. 5.3 D.Lgs n. 30/07	3. I visti di cui al comma 2 sono rilasciati gratuitamente e con priorità rispetto alle altre richieste.	3. Visas referred to in paragraph 2 [of Art. 5 of the Decree] are to be issued free of charge as soon as possible and on the basis of an accelerated procedure.	Y	Effective transposition Still pending answer form the Ministry of External Affairs on whether in practice the procedures is dealt with priority.

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord? (y/n)	Comments/Problems
						COM would like to interpret it as "as soon as possible, as close to 5 working days as possible".
Art. 5.3	3. The host Member State shall not place an entry or exit stamp in the passport of family members who are not nationals of a Member State provided that they present the residence card provided for in Article 10.	Art. 5.4 D.Lgs n. 30/07	4. Nei casi in cui e' esibita la carta di soggiorno di cui all'articolo 10 non sono apposti timbri di ingresso o di uscita nel passaporto del familiare non avente la cittadinanza di uno Stato membro dell'Unione europea.	4. The host Member State shall not place an entry or exit stamp in the passport of family members who are not nationals of a Member State provided that they present the residence card provided for in Article 10.	Y	Effective transposition The wording of the national Decree is slightly different but does not change the meaning of the provision. As above, Italy refers to any residence card, in addition Article 10 of Regulation 562/2006 (the Schenegn borders code) also contains this obligation and it is directly applicable.
Art. 5.4	4. Where a Union citizen, or a family member who is not a national of a Member State, does not have the necessary travel documents or, if required, the necessary visas, the Member State concerned shall, before turning them back, give such persons every reasonable opportunity to obtain the necessary documents or have them brought to them within a reasonable period of time or to corroborate or prove by other means that they are covered by the right of free movement and residence.	Art. 5.5 D.Lgs n. 30/07	5. Il respingimento nei confronti di un cittadino dell'Unione o di un suo familiare non avente la cittadinanza di uno Stato membro, sprovvisto dei documenti di viaggio o del visto di ingresso, non e' disposto se l'interessato, entro ventiquattro ore dalla richiesta, fa pervenire i documenti necessari ovvero dimostra con altra idonea documentazione, secondo la legge nazionale, la qualifica di titolare del diritto di libera circolazione.	5. A Union citizen or a family member who is not a national of a Member State and who does not have the necessary travel documents or, if required, the necessary visa, cannot be turned back if he/she brings the necessary documents or if he/she corroborates by other suitable means according the national law, that they are covered by the right of free movement and residence, within 24 hours form the request.	N, Incorrect	Incorrect transposition The wording of the national Decree is slightly different in particular it does not guarantee that reasonable opportunities are given and a reasonable period of time. It leaves too much discretion to the authorities.
Art.5.5	5. The Member State may require the person concerned to report his/ her presence within its territory within a reasonable and non-discriminatory period of time. Failure to comply with this requirement may make the person concerned liable to proportionate and non-discriminatory sanctions.	Art. 1.2 Law 28 May 2007, n. 68	2. Al momento dell'ingresso o, in caso di provenienza da Paesi dell'area Schengen, entro otto giorni dall'ingresso, lo straniero dichiara la sua presenza, rispettivamente all'autorità di frontiera o al questore della provincia in cui si trova, secondo le modalità stabilite con decreto del Ministro dell'interno.	2. When entering or, if coming from a Schengen area country, within 8 days, from the entry in the national territory, the foreign national declares his/her presence, respectively to the border authority or the <i>Questore</i> of the Province where the person concerned is, according the procedures set by a Ministry of Interior' decree.	N, Incorrect	Incorrect transposition Italy has used this option. In the case referred to in Art. 1.2, if the foreign national comes from a third country she/he needs to declare the presence immediately when entering; if the foreign national comes from a Schengen area country then he/she has 8 days to declare his/her presence in the national territory. The sanctions that apply in

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of	Translation into English of national	Fully in accord?	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
		Art. 1.3 Law 28 May 2007, n. 68	3. In caso di inosservanza degli obblighi di cui al comma 2, salvo che il ritardo sia dipeso da forza maggiore, lo straniero è espulso ai sensi dell'articolo 13 del citato testo unico di cui al decreto legislativo 25 luglio 1998, n. 286, e successive modificazioni. []	3. Failing to comply with the requirement of paragraph 2, except when the delay depends on force majeure, the foreign person is expelled according to Art. 13 of D.Lgs, n. 286 of 1998 and its further amendments. [] {Art. 13 of the Laws on the regulation of immigration and provisions on the conditions of the foreigner national, deals with "administrative expulsion"}		case of failure to comply with the provision, cannot be considered as "proportionate and non-discriminatory" as the Directive requires, since Law n. 68/2007 foresees the expulsion of the person concerned [since it refers to art. 18 of D.Lgs, n. 286 of 1998] (Law 68/2007 applies to country visits of less than 3 months. For visits of longer than 3 months, the law foresees different conditions and requirements).
		and new Art. 5 bis as added by Art. 1.1 a) D.Lgs n. 32/08	In ragione della prevista durata del suo soggiorno, il cittadino dell'Unione o il suo familiare puo' presentarsi ad un ufficio di polizia per dichiarare la propria presenza nel territorio nazionale, secondo le modalita' stabilite con decreto del Ministro dell'interno da adottare entro trenta giorni dalla data di entrata in vigore della presente disposizione. Qualora non sia stata effettuata tale dichiarazione di presenza, si presume, salvo prova contraria, che il soggiorno si sia protratto da oltre tre mesi;	According to the length of his/her stay, the Union citizen or his/her family member, may go to a police office in order to declare his/her presence in the national territory, according to the procedures established by a decree of the Ministry of Interior that needs to be adopted within 30 days from the date as of which this provision has entered into force. If the declaration of presence is not made, it is presumed, until proof of the contrary, that the period of residence is extended of more than three months;		This provision has been added by the new D.Lgs n. 32/08 and is ambiguous since it is not clear the situation in which the provision shall apply. The provision seems to say that for periods of residence of longer than 3 months there is no obligation to declare the presence in the territory since, in case of no declaration it is presumed that the periods of residence is longer than 3 months. In this case, however, if the Union citizen or family member does not fulfil the conditions refereed to in Art. 7 of D.Lgs n. 30/07 it seems that he/she could be expelled according to Art. 21 of the same Decree. [also refer to Article 15(1) of the Directive for more details]. Moreover, the Ministry of Interior should issue soon a decree specifying the procedures on how to report the presence in the Italian territory. On

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Order of the President of the Council of Ministers on May 30, 2008 (Order No. 3676) Provisions urgent civil protection to address the state of emergency in relation to settlements of nomadic communities in the region Lazio. Order of the President of the Council of Ministers on May 30, 2008 (Order No. 3677) Provisions urgent civil protection to address the state of emergency in relation to settlements of nomadic communities in the region Lombardy Order of the President of the Council of Ministers on May 30, 2008 (Order No. 3678) Provisions urgent civil protection to address the state of emergency in relation to settlements of nomadic communities in the region Lombardy Order of the President of the Council of Ministers on May 30, 2008 (Order No. 3678) Provisions urgent civil protection to address the state of emergency in relation to settlements of nomadic communities in the region Campania. Chapter III Art. 6.1 Right of residence up to three months I bing editions chall have the sight of	of national accord? provision (y/n)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Art
III Art. 6.1 Right of residence up to three months Art. 6.1 D.Lgs n. 30/07 Art. 6 (Diritto di sog	the 27 June 2008, officials at the Ministry of Internal Affairs have reported that this Decree s has not yet issued. In this context the Ordinanze issued by the President of the Council of Ministers do not comply with this particular provision because they give the special Commissioners appointed by the said Ordinanze, a series of powers concerning nomads camps/settlements that are not compatible with the Directive. See CS for a more detailed comment on this.		Council of Ministers on May 30, 2008 (Order No. 3676) Provisions urgent civil protection to address the state of emergency in relation to settlements of nomadic communities in the region Lazio. Order of the President of the Council of Ministers on May 30, 2008 (Order No. 3677) Provisions urgent civil protection to address the state of emergency in relation to settlements of nomadic communities in the region Lombardy Order of the President of the Council of Ministers on May 30, 2008 (Order No. 3678) Provisions urgent civil protection to address the state of emergency in relation to settlements of nomadic communities in the region to settlements of nomadic communities in relation to settlements of nomadic communities in the region		
				RIGHT OF RESIDENCE	
residence on the territory of another Member State for a period of up to three months without any conditions or any 1. I cittadini dell'Unio diritto di soggiornare in nazionale per un proportione in proportion	to three months) Inno il I. Union citizens shall have the right of residence on the national territory for a period of up to (Not for jobseeker s) s)	Art. 6 (Diritto di soggiorno fino a tre mesi) 1. I cittadini dell'Unione hanno il diritto di soggiornare nel territorio nazionale per un periodo non superiore a tre mesi senza alcuna	Art. 6.1 D.Lgs n. 30/07	1. Union citizens shall have the right of residence on the territory of another Member State for a period of up to three months without any conditions or any	Art. 6.1

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord?	Comments/Problems
	hold a valid identity card or passport.		condizione o formalità, salvo il possesso di un documento d'identità valido per l'espatrio secondo la legislazione dello Stato di cui hanno la cittadinanza.	conditions or any formalities other than the requirement to hold a valid identity document/card which is valid for expatriation according to the legislation of the State of nationality.		
		Art. 1.1 Law 28 May 2007, n. 68	1. Ai sensi dell'articolo 4, comma 4, e dell'articolo 5, comma 3, del testo unico delle disposizioni concernenti la disciplina dell'immigrazione e norme sulla condizione dello straniero, di cui al decreto legislativo 25 luglio 1998, n. 286, e successive modificazioni, per l'ingresso in Italia per visite, affari, turismo e studio non è richiesto il permesso di soggiorno qualora la durata del soggiorno stesso sia non superiore a tre mesi. In tali casi si applicano le disposizioni di cui all'articolo 4, comma 2, del medesimo testo unico e il termine di durata per cui è consentito il soggiorno è quello indicato nel visto di ingresso, se richiesto.	5.3 of D.Lgs, n. 286 of 1998 and its further amendments, in order to enter in Italy for visits,		Effective transposition Law 28 May 2007, n. 68 that has been issued in order to transpose the EU provision on EU foreign nationals does not only refer to EU nationals but also to third country nationals. The difference with D.Lgs n. 30/07 is that Law is more specific and one could say Lex specialis/generalis.
Art. 6.2	2. The provisions of paragraph 1 shall also apply to family members in possession of a valid passport who are not nationals of a Member State, accompanying or joining the Union citizen.	Art. 6.2 D.Lgs n. 30/07	2. Le disposizioni del comma 1 si applicano anche ai familiari non aventi la cittadinanza di uno Stato membro che accompagnano o raggiungono il cittadino dell'Unione, in possesso di un passaporto in corso di validità, che hanno fatto ingresso nel territorio nazionale ai sensi dell'articolo 5, comma 2.	shall also apply to family members who are not nationals of a Member State, in possession	N, Incorrect	Incorrect transposition The Italian provision adds in the end of Art. 6.2: "[] family members who are not nationals of a Member State [] who have entered the national territory according to Article 5.2" This renders the transposition as incorrect since as per the Directive the family member who are not national of a MS and who wants to reside for up to 3 months only needs a valid passport. This is not the same

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of Member State)	national provision	accord? (y/n)	
				•		for Italy since the family member who is not a national of a MS also in cases of residences of up to 3 months needs a visa in cases provided for in Art. 5.2 (Art. 5.2 of the Directive) in any case family members who are not nationals of a Member State have to comply with the provision of Article 5.2 in order to enter the national territory.
						(Also see CS for a more detailed analysis of the non conformity problem in relation to new Article 61.11 <i>bis</i> of the CP creating an aggravating circumstance for persons committing a crime who are illegally in the territory of Italy).
Art.7.1 (a)	Right of residence for more than three months All Union citizens shall have the right of residence on the territory of another Member State for a period of longer than three months if they: (a) are workers or self-employed persons in the host Member State; or	Art. 7.1 a) D.Lgs n. 30/07 In this regard also Circular of the Ministry of Interior of 6 and of 10 April 2007	Art. 7 (Diritto di soggiorno per un periodo superiore a tre mesi) 1. Il cittadino dell'Unione ha diritto di soggiornare nel territorio nazionale per un periodo superiore a tre mesi quando: a) e' lavoratore subordinato o autonomo nello Stato;	Art. 7 (Right of residence for more than three months) The Union citizen shall have the right of residence on the national territory for a period of longer than three months if they: a) is a worker or self-employed person in the State;	Y	Almost literal transposition The Italian Decree uses the term "the Union citizen" and not "all Union citizens"; this does not affect the correct transposition of this particular provision since the meaning is the same.
Art.7.1 (b)	(b) have sufficient resources for themselves and their family members not to become a burden on the social assistance system of the host Member State during their period of residence and have comprehensive sickness insurance cover in the host Member State; or	Art. 7.1 b) D.Lgs n. 30/07	b) dispone per sé stesso e per i propri familiari di risorse economiche sufficienti, per non diventare un onere a carico dell'assistenza sociale dello Stato durante il periodo di soggiorno, e di un'assicurazione sanitaria o di altro titolo idoneo comunque denominato che copra tutti i rischi nel territorio nazionale;	b) have sufficient resources for themselves and their family members not to become a burden on the social assistance system of the State during their period of residence and have comprehensive sickness insurance cover, or any other suitable instrument whichever called in the national territory;	Y	Almost literal transposition The Italian Decree does not specify "host" Member State. This is implied by the transposing provision that is therefore in compliance with the Directive. Art. 7.1 a) D.Lgs n. 30/07 will be amended if the draft Legislative decree amending and supplementing D.Lgs n. 30/07 is finally adopted. A new par is added after par. b),

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord?	Comments/Problems
				•		namely b)bis.
Art.7.1 (c)	(c) - are enrolled at a private or public establishment, accredited or financed by the host Member State on the basis of its legislation or administrative practice, for the principal purpose of following a course of study, including vocational training; and	Art. 7.1 c) D.Lgs n. 30/07	c) e' iscritto presso un istituto pubblico o privato riconosciuto per seguirvi come attività principale un corso di studi o di formazione professionale e []	c) is enrolled at a private or public establishment, for the principal purpose of following a course of study, or vocational training and []	Y	Effective transposition The sentence "or financed by the host Member State on the basis of its legislation or administrative practice" is omitted in the national provision. This however does not represent a gap since, referring to "[] or public establishment" this implies that the establishment is at least financed by the State.
	- have comprehensive sickness insurance cover in the host Member State and assure the relevant national authority, by means of a declaration or by such equivalent means as they may choose, that they have sufficient resources for themselves and their family members not to become a burden on the social assistance system of the host Member State during their period of residence; or	Art. 7.1 c) D.Lgs n. 30/07 Also Circular of the Ministry of Interior of 18 July 2007	[] dispone, per sé stesso e per i propri familiari, di risorse economiche sufficienti, per non diventare un onere a carico dell'assistenza sociale dello Stato durante il suo periodo di soggiorno, da attestare attraverso una dichiarazione o con altra idonea documentazione, e di un'assicurazione sanitaria o di altro titolo idoneo che copra tutti i rischi nel territorio nazionale;	[] that he/she has sufficient resources for him/herself and his/her family members not to become a burden on the social assistance system of State during their period of residence, to prove by means of a declaration or by such equivalent means as they may choose, and have comprehensive sickness insurance cover or any other suitable instrument that covers all the risks on the national territory;	Y	Almost literal transposition Circular 18 July specifies that Union citizens (and their dependant family members) who reside in Italy for professional trainings or for study reasons shall show that they have a comprehensive sickness insurance cover.
Art.7.1 (d)	(d) are family members accompanying or joining a Union citizen who satisfies the conditions referred to in points (a), (b) or (c).	Art. 7.1 d) D.Lgs n. 30/07	d) e' familiare, come definito dall'articolo 2, che accompagna o raggiunge un cittadino dell'Unione che ha diritto di soggiornare ai sensi delle lettere a), b) o c).	d) is a family member, as defined in Art. 2, accompanying or joining a Union citizen who has the right to reside according to points (a), (b) or (c).	Y	Effective transposition The national provision adds "as defined in Art. 2", to the definition of family member which does not affect conformity.
Art. 7.2	2. The right of residence provided for in paragraph 1 shall extend to family members who are not nationals of a Member State, accompanying or joining the Union citizen in the host Member State, provided that such Union citizen satisfies the conditions referred to in paragraph 1(a), (b) or (c).	Art. 7.2 D.Lgs n. 30/07	2. Il diritto di soggiorno di cui al comma 1 e' esteso ai familiari non aventi la cittadinanza di uno Stato membro quando accompagnano o raggiungono nel territorio nazionale il cittadino dell'Unione, purché questi risponda alle condizioni di cui al comma 1, lettere <i>a</i>), <i>b</i>) o <i>c</i>).	2. The right of residence provided for in paragraph 1 shall extend to family members who are not nationals of a Member State, accompanying or joining the Union citizen in the national territory, provided that such Union citizen satisfies the conditions referred to in	Y	Literal transposition

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of Member State)	national provision	accord? (y/n)	
			Wiember State)	paragraph 1 a), b) or c).	(y/II)	
Art. 7.3	3. For the purposes of paragraph 1(a), a Union citizen who is no longer a worker	Art. 7.3 a) D.Lgs n. 30/07	3. Il cittadino dell'Unione, già lavoratore subordinato o	3. The Union citizen who was already a worker or self-	N, Incorrect	Incorrect transposition
(a)	or self-employed person shall retain the status of worker or self-employed person in the following circumstances: (a) he/she is temporarily unable to work as the result of an illness or accident;	In this regard also Circular of the Ministry of Interior n. 19 of 6 April 2007 (page 9)	autonomo sul territorio nazionale, conserva il diritto al soggiorno di cui al comma 1, lettera <i>a</i>) quando: a) e' temporaneamente inabile al lavoro a seguito di una malattia o di un infortunio;	employed person in the national territory, shall retain the right of residence as referred to in paragraph 1 a) when: a) he/she is temporarily unable to work as the result of an illness or accident;	niconect	The provision may appear to be effectively transposed; there is however a substantial difference since according to the transposing Decree the EU citizen shall retain the right of residence according to paragraph 1 a) [that is about the right of residence as a worker] while the Directive specifies that in such cases the EU citizen shall retain his/her status of worker or self-employed person. If it is not possible to presume that the retention of the right of residence
Art. 7.3	(b) he/she is in duly recorded	Art. 7.3 b) D.Lgs n. 30/07	b) e' in stato di disoccupazione	b) he/she is in duly recorded	Y	presumes the retention of the status of worker (or self-employed) then transposition is incorrect. Effective transposition
(b)	involuntary unemployment after having been employed for more than one year and has registered as a jobseeker with the relevant employment office;		involontaria debitamente comprovata dopo aver esercitato un'attività lavorativa per oltre un anno nel territorio nazionale ed e' iscritto presso il Centro per l'impiego, ovvero ha reso la dichiarazione, di cui all'articolo 2, comma 1, del decreto legislativo 21 aprile 2000, n. 181, così come sostituito dall'articolo 3 del decreto legislativo 19 dicembre 2002, n. 297, che attesti l'immediata disponibilità allo svolgimento di attività lavorativa;	involuntary unemployment after having been employed for more than one year in the national territory and has registered as a jobseeker with the <i>Centro per l'impiego</i> (employment office), or has made the statement, as referred to in article 2 paragraph 1 of Legislative Decree 21 April 2000, n. 181, as replaced by article 3 of Legislative Decree 19 December 2002, n. 297, that shows the immediate availability to work;		Legislative Decree 21 April 2000, n. 181 concerns provisions on facilitation the meeting of the job requests and offers. Its Article 2.1, as amended, requires to proof the unemployment status by going before the competent service and declaring the activity previously done and the immediate availability to start working. The second part of the provision also refers to job-seekers. The Italian legislation specifies "registered as a jobseeker in the
		Art. 2.1 Legislative Decree 21 April 2000, n. 181, as replaced by Art 3 of Legislative Decree 19 December 2002, n. 297	[Art. 2.1 D.Lg. 181/00 as amended: La condizione di cui all'articolo 1, comma 2, lettera c), [on the state unemployment] deve	, 1 0 1		national territory"; as confirmed by the <i>Big Refon</i> t report, the employment for more than one year is meant the period of employment in

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord? (y/n)	Comments/Problems
			essere comprovata dalla presentazione dell'interessato presso il servizio competente nel cui ambito territoriale si trovi il domicilio del medesimo, accompagnata da una dichiarazione, ai sensi del decreto del Presidente della Repubblica 28 dicembre 2000, n. 445, che attesti l'eventuale attività lavorativa precedentemente svolta, nonché l'immediata disponibilità allo svolgimento di attività lavorativa]	unemployment] must be proven by appearance of the interested person to the competent department in whose territory the said person has his/her domicile; it is also required a declaration, according to Presidential Decree 28 December 2000 n. 445, certifying any work previously performed and the immediate availability for the performance of work]		the host Member (in this case in Italy). Therefore transposition is correct. –national territory here is Italy.
Art. 7.3 (c)	(c) he/she is in duly recorded involuntary unemployment after completing a fixed-term employment contract of less than a year or after having become involuntarily unemployed during the first twelve months and has registered as a job-seeker with the relevant employment office. In this case, the status of worker shall be retained for no less than six months;	Art. 7.3 c) D.Lgs n. 30/07	c) e' in stato di disoccupazione involontaria debitamente comprovata al termine di un contratto di lavoro di durata determinata inferiore ad un anno, ovvero si e' trovato in tale stato durante i primi dodici mesi di soggiorno nel territorio nazionale, e' iscritto presso il Centro per l'impiego ovvero ha reso la dichiarazione, di cui all'articolo 2, comma 1, del decreto legislativo 21 aprile 2000, n. 181, così come sostituito dall'articolo 3 del decreto legislativo 19 dicembre 2002, n. 297, che attesti l'immediata disponibilità allo svolgimento di attività lavorativa. In tale caso, l'interessato conserva la qualità di lavoratore subordinato per un periodo di un anno:	completing a fixed-term employment contract of less than a year or after having become involuntarily unemployed during the first twelve months in the national territory and has registered as a job-seeker with the <i>Centro per l'impiego</i> or has made the statement, as referred to in article 2 paragraph 1 of Legislative Decree 21 April	Y	Effective transposition The Italian provision specifies that the status of worker shall be retained for one year. This is in conformity with the Directive that states "no less than six months". The provision is even more favourable.
Art.7.3 (d)	(d) he/she embarks on vocational training. Unless he/she is involuntarily	Art. 7.3 d) D.Lgs n. 30/07	anno; d) segue un corso di formazione professionale. Salvo il caso di di disconneggione involentario le	training. Unless he/she is	Y	Literal transposition
	unemployed, the retention of the status of worker shall require the training to be		disoccupazione involontaria, la conservazione della qualità di			

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord? (y/n)	Comments/Problems
	related to the previous employment.		lavoratore subordinato presuppone che esista un collegamento tra l'attività professionale precedentemente svolta e il corso di formazione seguito.	shall require the training to be related to the previous employment.		
Art. 7.4	4. By way of derogation from paragraphs 1(d) and 2 above, only the spouse, the registered partner provided for in Article 2(2)(b) and dependent children shall have the right of residence as family members of a Union citizen meeting the conditions under 1(c) above. Article 3(2) shall apply to his/her dependent direct relatives in the ascending lines and those of his/her spouse or registered partner.				Y, More favourabl e	More favourable transposition The fact that such provision has not been transposed, means that in Italy there are no derogations to paragraph 1 d) and to paragraph 2; Therefore all family members of a Union citizen who is a student have the right of residence in Italy. This makes the Italian act more favourable.
Art. 8.1	Administrative formalities for Union citizens 1. Without prejudice to Article 5(5), for periods of residence longer than three months, the host Member State may require Union citizens to register with the relevant authorities.	Art. 9.1 D.Lgs n. 30/07 In this regard also Circular of the Ministry of Interior of 6 April 2007 Also Circular n. 45 of 8 August 2007 and Circular of the Ministry of Interior of 18 July 2007: The Circular mentions the different cases of registration: for minors who are not accompanied, for religious grounds, for work reasons.	Art. 9 (Formalità amministrative per i cittadini dell'Unione ed i loro familiari) 1. Al cittadino dell'Unione che intende soggiornare in Italia, ai sensi dell'articolo 7 per un periodo superiore a tre mesi, si applica la legge 24 dicembre 1954 n. 1228, ed il nuovo regolamento anagrafico della popolazione residente, approvato con decreto del Presidente della Repubblica 30 maggio 1989, n. 223.	Art. 9 (Administrative formalities for Union citizens and their families) 1. Law of 24 December 1954, n. 1228 and the new registry of the resident population, approved by Presidential Decree of 30 May 1989, n. 223, shall apply to the Union citizen who intends to reside in Italy for longer than three months, according to Article 7.	Y	Effective transposition Article 7 (the reference to this article is redundant but pertinent since in fact concerns the right of residence for more than three months that is the case referred here by Article 8(1) of the Directive. The Italian provision refers to Law n. 1228 on the register of births, death and marriages and other relevant positions, of resident population and to Decree n. 223 on the new registry of the resident population (the mentioned acts also apply to Italian citizens). Law of 1128 and Presidential Decree of 30 May 1989, n. 223 do not contain specific provisions for EU citizens. Their provisions also apply to Italians citizens.

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
		Art. 36 Presidential Decree of 30 May 1989, n. 223	[Articolo 36 Presidential Decree of 30 May 1989, n. 223 Ricorsi in materia di certificazioni anagrafiche. 1. Avverso il rifiuto opposto dall'ufficiale di anagrafe al rilascio dei certificati anagrafici e in caso di errori contenuti in essi, l'interessato può produrre ricorso al prefetto.	[Article 36 Presidential Decree of 30 May 1989, n. 223 Appeals regarding certification registries. 1. Against the refusal by an official of the registry to issue personal details certificates and in case of errors in them, the interested person may file an appeal to the prefetto.	(у/п)	According to Presidential Decree of 30 May 1989, n. 223 and Law of 24 December 1954, n. 1228 the persons concerned are entitled to appeal before the <i>Prefetto</i> if the application is dismissed for lack of requirements foreseen by the two mentioned acts.
		Art. 5 Law of 24 December 1954, n. 1228	Art. 5 Law of 24 December 1954, n. 1228 L'ufficiale d'anagrafe che sia venuto a conoscenza di fatti che comportino la istituzione o la mutazione di posizioni anagrafiche, per i quali non siano state rese le prescritte dichiarazioni, deve invitare gli interessati a renderle. In caso di mancata dichiarazione, l'ufficiale di anagrafe provvede di ufficio, notificando all'interessato il provvedimento stesso. Contro il provvedimento d'ufficio è ammesso ricorso al prefetto.]	Art. 5 Law of 24 December 1954, n. 1228 The official of the registry (personal details registry) who becomes aware of facts that lead to the establishment or change of registry's positions, for which the required declarations have not been made, shall invite the interested persons to make such declarations. In case of non-declaration, the official of the registry shall, acting ex officio, notify the person concerned the measure itself. Against the measure taken ex officio it is possible to file an appeal to the prefetto.]		
		Order of the President of the Council of Ministers on May 30, 2008 (Order No. 3676) Provisions urgent civil protection to address the state of emergency in relation to settlements of nomadic communities in the region Lazio.				In this context the Ordinanze issued by the President of the Council of Ministers do not comply with this particular provision because they give the special Commissioners appointed by the said Ordiananze, a series of powers concerning nomads camps/settlements that are not compatible with the Directive.

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord?	Comments/Problems
		Order of the President of the Council of Ministers on May 30, 2008 (Order No. 3677) Provisions urgent civil protection to address the state of emergency in relation to settlements of nomadic communities in the region Lombardy Order of the President of the Council of Ministers on May 30, 2008 (Order No. 3678) Provisions urgent civil protection to address the state of emergency in relation to settlements of nomadic communities in the region				In particular he/she is supposed to identify illegal camps and to do a census of the persons, also minors, living in such settlements. See CS for a more detailed comment on this.
Art. 8.2	2. The deadline for registration may not be less than three months from the date of arrival. A registration certificate shall be issued immediately, stating the name and address of the person registering and the date of the registration. Failure to comply with the registration requirement may render the person concerned liable to proportionate and non-discriminatory sanctions.	Campania Art. 9.2 D.Lgs n. 30/07 Also Circular n. 45 of 8 August 2007	2. Fermo quanto previsto dal comma 1, l'iscrizione e' comunque richiesta trascorsi tre mesi dall'ingresso ed e' rilasciata immediatamente una attestazione contenente l'indicazione del nome e della dimora del richiedente, nonché la data della richiesta.	2. Without prejudice to what stated in paragraph 1, the registration is in any case required after three months from the date of arrival and a registration certificate is issued immediately, sta The deadline for registration may not be less than three months from the date of arrival. A registration certificate shall be issued immediately, stating the name and address of the person registering and the date of the registration. Failure to comply with the registration requirement may render the person concerned liable to proportionate and non-discriminatory sanctions.ting the name and address of the person registering and the date of the request of registration.	Y	Effective transposition The Italian provision refers to the date of the request of registration; while the Directive refers to the date of registration but this does not impinge on the substance of the provision. (See also comment under Art. 8.5 c) of the Directive) Moreover, the Directive requires to state the "address" of the person that in Italian would be "domicilio". The transposing provision says: "dimora", which is technically not the same. The Italian system makes a difference between these terms. In particular "dimora" is the place where a person is even only for a short period, <i>i.e.</i> , when he/she is in a hotel during holidays. "Domicilio" is the principal/main seat of his/her

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
				F	(,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,	business and interests, that is of the
						economical, financial and property
						activities. However, "dimora" is the
						minimum requirement that a foreign
						national shall have and communicate
						to the authorities. In this regard, until
						the person concerned is not
						registered, his/her address is a
						"dimora" and only after registration
						at the appropriate Office of <i>anagrafe</i> (personal details registry), one can
						refer to residence. In this regard it is
						not possible to assess the provision as
						incorrect. The aim of the Italian
						provision is to facilitate other
						Member States' citizens: it is
						important for them to communicate
						the address where they can be found.
						Therefore there is no incorrectness
						but only a way of facilitating the
						registration for foreign citizens.
						Residence is the place where the
						person usually lives.
						person usually lives.
						Circular n. 45 of 8 August 2007
						explains that the certificate stating the
						name and address of the person
						registering and the date of the request
						of registration does not constitute a
						document that authorises the
						residence but has the aim at showing
						Union citizen's compliance with the
						obligation regarding the registration according to the procedures described
						in the Decree (it is clear that the
						person has the right to reside and that
						is why the certificate does not
						authorise residence).
						·
						Art. 9.2 D.Lgs n. 30/07 will be

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord?	Comments/Problems
			nzemset suite	provision	(3/11)	replaced if the draft Legislative decree amending and supplementing D.Lgs n. 30/07 is finally adopted.
		Art. 11 Law of 24 December 1954, n. 1228 as amended	Per le persone residenti nei territori dello Stato in seguito ad immigrazione dall'estero, che non hanno provveduto a curare la propria iscrizione e quella delle persone sottoposte alla loro patria potestà o tutela nell'anagrafe del Comune dove dimorano abitualmente [[], nonché per chiunque consegue l'iscrizione contemporanea nell'anagrafe di più Comuni, si applica la sanzione amministrativa da lire 100.000 a lire 500.000 (after amendement llaw decree 55/83: 1.000.000 to lire 5.000.000)	For the persons residing in the territory of the State, following immigration from abroad, who have not made the registration - for themselves nor for the persons subject to their parental authority or "protection"-guardianship (tutela) - in the registry of births, death etc in the Commune where they habitually dimorano (where they have their address) [], as well as for any person making at the same time the registration in the registry of births, death etc of more than one Commune, the administrative sanction of from 100.000 to lire 500.000 (after amendment by law decree 55/83: 1.000.000 to lire 5.000.000)		According to Law of 24 December 1954, n. 1228 in case of non registration of the persons residing in the national territory coming from abroad the sanctions administrative (fine): from 100.000 a lire 500.000 shall apply. (after amendment 55/83: 1.000.000 – approximately € 516,00 to lire 5.000.000 – approximately € 250,00. We assume that the sanction appear to be proportional and non-discriminatory, since it also apply to Italian citizens).
Art. 8.3	3. For the registration certificate to be issued, Member States may only require that — Union citizens to whom point (a) of Article 7(1) applies present a valid identity card or passport, a confirmation of engagement from the employer or a certificate of employment, or proof that they are self-employed persons,	Art. 9.3 a) D.Lgs n. 30/07 In this regard also Circular of the Ministry of Interior n. 45 of 8 August 2007	3. Oltre a quanto previsto per i cittadini italiani dalla normativa di cui al comma 1, per l'iscrizione anagrafica di cui al comma 2, il cittadino dell'Unione deve produrre la documentazione attestante: a) l'attività lavorativa, subordinata o autonoma, esercitata se l'iscrizione e' richiesta ai sensi dell'articolo 7, comma 1, lettera a);	3. Besides what provided for in paragraph 1 for Italian citizens, for the registration stated in paragraph 2, Union citizens shall present the documentation proving: a) that they are workers or self-employed persons if the registration is required according Article 7.1 a);	Y	Article 7.1 a) referred to in the national provision corresponds to point (a) of Article 7(1) of the Directive. The Italian Decree does not expressly states the requirement of "present a valid identity card or passport,", however, it refers to "what provided for in paragraph 1 for Italian citizens", i.e., to Law of 24 December 1954, n. 1228 Presidential Decree of 30 May 1989, n. 223. This latter in its Article 6.3, requires that

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord? (y/n)	Comments/Problems
		Art. 6.3 Presidential Decree of 30 May 1989, n. 223	6.3 Le persone che rendono le dichiarazioni anagrafiche debbono comprovare la propria identità mediante l'esibizione di un documento di riconoscimento.	6.3 The persons making a registration shall proof their identity showing an identity document.		the persons making a registration shall proof their identity showing an identity document. Therefore, the Directive's provision is effectively transposed.
						The Italian Decree fails to refer to "a confirmation of engagement from the employer"; this however does not affect the correct transposition since the Directive gives the alternative between the "confirmation of engagement" or a "certificate of employment []" The Italian provision is therefore more general as compared to the specific certificates mentioned in the Directive.
						The mentioned Circular explains which are the documents proving that they are workers (show the last pay roll, or receipt of the payment of INPS' contribute) or self-employed persons (certificate of registration in the Chamber of Commerce or TVA registration). These are examples.
	— Union citizens to whom point (b) of Article 7(1) applies present a valid identity card or passport and provide proof that they satisfy the conditions laid down therein,	Art. 9.3 b) D.Lgs n. 30/07 In this regard also Circular of the Ministry of Interior n. 19 of 6 April 2007	b) la disponibilità di risorse economiche sufficienti per se' e per i propri familiari, secondo i criteri di cui all'articolo 29, comma 3, lettera b), del testo unico delle disposizioni concernenti la disciplina dell'immigrazione e norme sulla condizione dello straniero, di cui al decreto legislativo 25 luglio 1998, n. 286, nonché la titolarità di una assicurazione sanitaria ovvero di altro titolo comunque denominato idoneo a coprire tutti i	b) sufficient resources for themselves and their family members, according to the criteria set out in Article 29.3 b) of the laws (testo unico) on immigration and the provisions on the conditions of the foreigners covered by Legislative Decree 25 July 1998, n. 286, and a sickness insurance or any other suitable instrument whichever called, that covers all the risks in the national territory, when the registration is required	N, Incorrect	Incorrect transposition The transposing Decree repeats the criteria corresponding to point (b) of Article 7(1) of the Directive. The requirement to present a valid identity card or passport is fulfilled by the introduction to this transposing provision (see <i>supra</i> comment on Article 9.3 a) of the Italian provision). Article 29.3 b) of Legislative Decree

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of Member State)	national provision	accord? (y/n)	
			rischi nel territorio nazionale, se l'iscrizione e' richiesta ai sensi dell'articolo 7, comma 1, lettera b);	according Article 7.1 b);		286/1998 requires a foreign person who wants to rejoin his/her family member the EU citizen has to provide evidence of having an annual salary deriving from legal sources, not lower than the annual amount of the social allowance, if only one member rejoins; double of that amount, if two or three family members rejoin, three time the annual amount if four or more members rejoin. In order to determine the annual salary of the person making the request, even the annual salary of the cohabitants is taken into account.
						In order to quantify the economic resources Italy uses the parameter of the amount of the social allowance//assistance. In this regard Circular of the Ministry of Interior of 6 April 2007 gives specific information quantifying the amount that is considered as "sufficient resources". In this regard this provision and the following ones are to be considered as incorrectly transposed. For more details, refer to Article 8(4)
	— Union citizens to whom point (c) of Article 7(1) applies present a valid identity card or passport, provide proof of enrolment at an accredited establishment and of comprehensive sickness insurance cover and the declaration or equivalent means referred to in point (c) of Article 7(1). Member	Art. 9.3 c) D.Lgs n. 30/07 In this regard also Circular of the Ministry of Interior n. 19 of 6 April 2007	c) l'iscrizione presso un istituto pubblico o privato riconosciuto dalla vigente normativa e la titolarità di un'assicurazione sanitaria ovvero di altro titolo comunque denominato idoneo a coprire tutti i rischi, nonché la disponibilità di risorse	c) to be enrolled at a public or private establishment accredited by the existing legislation and a sickness insurance or any other suitable instrument whichever called, covering all the risks, and sufficient resources for themselves and their family	N, Incorrect	of the Directive. Incorrect transposition The transposing Decree repeats the criteria corresponding to point (b) of Article 7(1) of the Directive. The requirement to present a valid identity card or passport is fulfilled
	States may not require this declaration to refer to any specific amount of resources.		economiche sufficienti per se' e per i propri familiari, secondo i	members, according to the criteria set out in Article 29.3 b)		by the introduction to this transposing provision (see <i>supra</i> comment on

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of Member State)	national		
					accord? (y/n)	Article 9.3 a) of the Italian provision). The sentence "or financed by the host Member State on the basis of its legislation or administrative practice" is omitted in the national provision. This however does not represent a gap since, referring to "[] or public establishment" this implies that the establishment is at least financed by the State. Article 29.3 b) of Legislative Decree 286/1998 sets the criteria that have to be taken into account when making the declaration referred to in point (c) of Article 7(1). The Directive says
						that "Member States may not require this declaration to refer to any specific amount of resources"; Article 29.3 b) of Legislative Decree 286/1998 refers to specific amounts setting the limits under which the resources shall not go, i.e., the amount of the social allowance/assistance. So in the declaration, students have to declare a fixed amount as well. However, the competent authorities that have been contacted have specified that students can make a self certification of the resources. (See also comment above referred to the previous provision). Art. 9.3 c) D.Lgs n. 30/07 will be amended if the draft Legislative decree amending and supplementing D.Lgs n. 30/07 is finally adopted.

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
1410	Creation of the fitties of the Breedige	provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	
		r	Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
	4. Member States may not lay down a	Art. 9.4 D.Lgs n. 30/07	4. Il cittadino dell'Unione può	4. Union citizens may show to	N,	Incorrect transposition and
	fixed amount which they regard as		dimostrare di disporre, per se' e	have sufficient resources for	Incorrect	ambiguous
	'sufficient resources', but they must take	In this regard also Circular of the	per i propri familiari, di risorse	themselves and their family		
	into account the personal situation of the	Ministry of Interior n. 19 of 6	economiche sufficienti a non	members, not to become a		Articles 46 and 47 of the mentioned
	person concerned. In all cases this amount shall not be higher than the	April 2007	gravare sul sistema di assistenza	burden on the public assistance		Presidential Decree refer to
	threshold below which nationals of the		pubblica, anche attraverso la dichiarazione di cui agli articoli	system, also giving a declaration as referred to in Articles 46 and		substitutive declarations (Dichiarazioni sostitutive) and to
	host Member State become eligible for		46 e 47 del testo unico delle	47 of the laws and regulations		certification of the affidavit
	social assistance, or, where this criterion		disposizioni legislative e	(testo unico) on administrative		(certificato dell'atto di notorieta).
	is not applicable, higher than the		regolamentari in materia di	documentation referred to in		Basically Union citizens self declare
	minimum social security pension paid by		documentazione amministrativa di	Presidential Decree of 28		the resources.
	the host Member State.		cui al decreto del Presidente della	December 2000 n. 445.		
			Repubblica 28 dicembre 2000, n.			(So Art. Article 29.3 b) of Legislative
			445.			Decree 286/1998 sets the criteria that
						have to be taken into account when
		And 46 Describeration Described	(D	[B		making the declaration r referred to
		Art. 46 Presidential Decree of 28 December 2000 n. 445	[Presidential Decree of 28 December 2000 n. 445.	[Presidential Decree of 28 December 2000 n. 445.		in point (c) of Article 7(1), while Articles 46 and 47 mentioned above
		28 December 2000 n. 443	Articolo 46 (R)	Article 46 (R)		only refer to how to declare a certain
			Dichiarazioni sostitutive di	Statements replacing the		staus or situation)
			certificazioni	certifications		States of Situation,
			1. Sono comprovati con	1.		Overall, the provision is not correctly
			dichiarazioni, anche	The following states, personal		transposed. The Italian transposing
			contestuali all'istanza,	qualities and facts are supported		Decree previously states (see
			sottoscritte	with statements, also contextual		previous provisions) that the amount
			dall'interessato e	to the application, signed by the		of the "sufficient resources" shall not
			prodotte in sostituzione delle normali	interested person and produced by replacing the normal		be lower than the annual amount of the social allowance/assistance.
			certificazioni i seguenti	certification:		Moreover, Circular of the Ministry of
			stati, qualità personali e	a- Date and place of birth;		Interior of 6 April 2007, as
			fatti:	b- residence;		previously said, fixes a certain
			a- data e il luogo di nascita;	c- nationality;		amount that is considered as
			b- residenza;	d- enjoyment of civil and		sufficient for the citizen and his/her
			c- cittadinanza;	political rights;		family member to reside in the
			d- godimento dei diritti civili e	e- status of unmarried, married,		national territory. This is not in line
			politici;	widowed or free;		with what clarified by the Big Refont
			e- stato di celibe, coniugato,	f- family status;		report that explains that Article 8(4)
			vedovo o stato libero;	g-existence in life; h- birth of a child, death of		"provides certain criteria which may provide guidance but no fixed
			f- stato di famiglia; g- esistenza in vita;	spouse, or descendant or		amount might be imposed in the
			h- nascita del figlio, decesso del	ascendant;		legislation, implementing regulations
L		<u>l</u>	n- nasciia aei jigiio, aecesso dei	имсениин,	<u> </u>	registation, implementing regulations

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	
		, ,	Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
			coniuge, dell'ascendente o	i- entry in the registers, in lists		may however set some indicative
			discendente;	kept by public administrations;		amount, subject to the precision that
			i- iscrizione in albi, in elenchi	l- membership in professional		it is only indicative".
			tenuti da pubbliche	associations;		
			amministrazioni;	m- educational qualifications,		However, what stated in the
			l-appartenenza a ordini	exams,		mentioned Circular is not clear at all.
			professionali;	n- professional qualification		On the one hand it seems to impose a
			m- titolo di studio, esami	possessed, title of specialization,		fix amount but then, tit refers to a
			sostenuti;	certification, training, and		table with salaries threshold that is
			n-qualifica professionale	upgrade of technical skills;		given as an example. Moreover,
			posseduta, titolo di	o- economic or income situation		Circular of 18 July 2007, clearly
			specializzazione, di abilitazione,	also for the purpose of granting		states, referring to Circular n. 19 of 6
			di formazione, di aggiornamento e	benefits of any kind provided by		April 2007, that precise information
			di qualificazione tecnica;	special laws;		are given as to the entity of such
			o- situazione reddituale o	p- performance of specific taxes		resources that the concerned person
			economica anche ai fini della	obligations with an indication of		shall have and declare. From the text
			concessione dei benefici di	the amount paid;		of the law, it seems that if the person
			qualsiasi tipo previsti da leggi	q- possession and number of tax		does not meet the quantities, then
			speciali; p- assolvimento di specifici	code, VAT and any data existing in the archive of the tax registry;		he/she will not be registered. In case he/she might appeal according to art.
			obblighi contributivi con	r- unemployment status;		8 of the Decree. The question
			l'indicazione dell'ammontare	s- retired and category of		regarding whether if a person does
			corrisposto;	retirement;		not meet those quantities there would
			q- possesso e numero del codice	t- being a student;		be an assessment of the personal
			fiscale, della partita IVA e di	u- being a student, u- being a legal representative of		circumstances has been double
			qualsiasi dato presente	natural or legal persons,		checked with the national competent
			nell'archivio dell'anagrafe	guardian, curator and other		authorities that have reported that the
			tributaria;	similar:		personal circumstances of the person
			r- stato di disoccupazione;	v- register with associations or		concerned are not taken into account.
			s- qualità di pensionato e	social formations of any kind;		This means that his/her request is
			categoria di pensione;	z- all situations relating to the		automatically rejected and this is not
			t- qualità di studente;	fulfilment of military service		in compliance with the Directive.
			u- qualità di legale	obligations, including those		in complaince with the Birective.
			rappresentante di persone fisiche	certified in the new entry sheet;		The incomes of other family
			o giuridiche, di tutore, di curatore	aa- to not have prior criminal		members are also taking into account:
			e simili;	convictions and not to be		if only one member rejoins; double of
			v- iscrizione presso associazioni o	recipient of measures		that amount, if two or three family
			formazioni sociali di qualsiasi	concerning the implementation		members rejoin, three time the annual
			tipo;	of security measures and		amount if four or more members
			z- tutte le situazioni relative	preventive measures, civil		rejoin. In order to determine the
			all'adempimento degli obblighi	decisions and administrative		annual salary of the person making

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	
			Member State)	provision measures recorded in police	(y/n)	the means the county of
			militari, ivi comprese quelle attestate nel foglio matricolare	records under existing		the request, even the annual salary of the cohabitants is taken into account.
			dello stato di servizio;	legislation;		the conditions is taken into account.
			aaa- di non aver riportato	bbb- not to be aware of being		
			condanne penali e di non essere	subjected to criminal		
			destinatario di provvedimenti che	proceedings;		
			riguardano l'applicazione di	bbb-bis) not being the entity		Art. 9.4 D.Lgs n. 30/07 will be
			misure di sicurezza e di misure di	recipient of a judicial decision		amended if the draft Legislative
			prevenzione, di decisioni civili e di provvedimenti amministrativi	applying administrative sanctions provided for in		decree amending and supplementing D.Lgs n. 30/07 is finally adopted.
			iscritti nel casellario giudiziale ai	Legislative Decree 8 June 2001,		D.Lgs n. 30/07 is finally adopted.
			sensi della vigente normativa;	n. 231;		
			bbbb- di non essere a conoscenza	cccc- quality of dependence;		
			di essere sottoposto a	ddddd- all the data that are		
			procedimenti penali;	known by the interested person		
			bbbb-bis) di non essere l'ente	contained in the registers of		
			destinatario di provvedimenti giudiziari che applicano le	marital status; eeeeee- that they are not in a stat		
			sanzioni amministrative di cui al	e of liquidation or bankruptcy		
			decreto legislativo 8 giugno 2001,	and that have applied for an		
			n. 231;	agreement		
			cccc-qualità di vivenza a carico;			
			ddddd- tutti i dati a diretta	Update		
			conoscenza dell'interessato	Il D.P.R. 14 November 2002, n.		
			contenuti nei registri dello stato civile:	313 has stated that these		
			eeeeee- di non trovarsi in stato di	amendments produce "effect as of the 45 th day starting to count		
			liquidazione o di fallimento e di	from the date of publication in		
			non aver presentato domanda di	the Official Journal".		
			concordato. (R)	33		
			Aggiornamento			
			Il D.P.R. 14 novembre 2002, n.			
			313 ha disposto che la presente			
			modifica "ha effetto a decorrere dal quarantacinquesimo giorno a			
			partire dalla data di			
			pubblicazione del suddetto			
			decreto nella Gazzetta Ufficiale".			
		Art. 47 Presidential Decree of	A (* 1 47 (P)	Article 47 (R)		
		28 December 2000 n. 445	Articolo 47 (R) Dichiarazioni sostitutive dell'atto	(22)		

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national 	accord?	
			Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
			di notorietà 1. L'atto di notorietà	Statements replacing the affidavit		
			concernente stati, qualità	agjiaavii 1. The affidavit		
			personali o fatti che siano a	concerning states, personal		
			diretta conoscenza	qualities or facts that are		
			dell'interessato è sostituito da	directly known by the interested		
			dichiarazione resa e sottoscritta	person is replaced by a		
			dal medesimo con la osservanza	declaration made and signed		
			delle modalità di cui all'articolo	complying with the procedures		
			38. (R)	laid down in Article 38.		
			2. La dichiarazione resa	2. The		
			nell'interesse proprio del	statement made in his/her own		
			dichiarante può riguardare anche	interest may also concern states,		
			stati, qualità personali e fatti	personal qualities and facts		
			relativi ad altri soggetti di cui egli	relating to other subjects of		
			abbia diretta conoscenza. (R)	whom he/she has direct		
			3. Fatte salve le	knowledge.		
			eccezioni espressamente previste	3. Subject to		
			per legge, nei rapporti con la	the exceptions expressly		
			pubblica amministrazione e con i	provided by law, in dealings		
			concessionari di pubblici servizi,	with the public administration		
			tutti gli stati, le qualità personali	and with the concessionaires of		
			e i fatti non espressamente	public services, all states, the		
			indicati nell'articolo 46 sono	personal qualities and facts not		
			comprovati dall'interessato	expressly mentioned in art. 46		
			mediante la dichiarazione sostitutiva di atto di notorietà. (R)	are supported by the interested person by the statements		
			4. Salvo il caso in cui la	replacing the affidavit.		
			legge preveda espressamente che	4. Excluded		
			la denuncia all'Autorità di Polizia	where the law expressly provides		
			Giudiziaria è presupposto	that the complaint to the Judicial		
			necessario per attivare il	Police is necessary to activate		
			procedimento amministrativo di	the administrative procedure		
			rilascio del duplicato di	that issues the duplicate of		
			documenti di riconoscimento o	identification documents or		
			comunque attestanti stati e qualità	documents attesting the states		
			personali dell'interessato, lo	and personal qualities of the		
			smarrimento dei documenti	person concerned, the loss of the		
			medesimi è comprovato da chi ne	documents themselves is		
			richiede il duplicato mediante	evidenced by the person		
			dichiarazione sostitutiva. (R)]	applying for the duplicate in a		

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord? (y/n)	Comments/Problems
			6. Salvo quanto previsto dal presente decreto, per l'iscrizione anagrafica ed il rilascio della ricevuta di iscrizione e del relativo documento di identità si applicano le medesime disposizioni previste per il cittadino italiano.	6. Except for what provided in the present decree, for the registration and the release of the registration's certificate and of the identity document, the same provisions laid down for Italian citizens will apply.		This provision anticipates what declared in Art. 24 of the Directive, <i>i.e.</i> , equal treatment. Art. 9.6 D.Lgs n. 30/07 will be amended if the draft Legislative decree amending and supplementing D.Lgs n. 30/07 is finally adopted.
Art. 8.5	5. For the registration certificate to be issued to family members of Union citizens, who are themselves Union citizens, Member States may require the following documents to be presented:	Art. 9.5 D.Lgs n. 30/07	5. Ai fini dell'iscrizione anagrafica, oltre a quanto previsto per i cittadini italiani dalla normativa di cui al comma 1, i familiari del cittadino dell'Unione europea che non hanno un autonomo diritto di soggiorno devono presentare, in conformità alle disposizioni del decreto del Presidente della Repubblica 28 dicembre 2000, n. 445:	5. For the registration, in addition to what required for Italian citizens according paragraph 1, family members of Union citizens, who do not have autonomous right of residence, may require the following documents to be presented, in accordance with Presidential Decree of 28 December 2000, n. 445:	Y	Effective transposition The Italian Decree refers to "family members of Union citizens, who do not have autonomous right of residence" while the Directive refers to "family members of Union citizens, who are themselves Union citizens". However also the Directive implies that family members do not have autonomous right of residence. The Italian provision seems to be
		Art. 1 Presidential Decree of 28 December 2000, n. 445	[Art. 1 Presidential Decree of 28 December 2000, n. 445: [1. Le disposizioni del presente testo unico si applicano ai cittadini italiani e dell'Unione europea, alle persone giuridiche, alle società di persone, alle pubbliche amministrazioni e agli enti, alle associazioni e ai comitati aventi sede legale in Italia o in uno dei Paesi dell'Unione europea. (R) 2. I cittadini di Stati non appartenenti all'Unione regolarmente soggiornanti in Italia, possono utilizzare le	2. Non EU Member States' citizens legally residing in Italy,		wider since it refers to family members of a Union citizen apart from referring that they are themselves Union citizens. That is why it refers in point a) below to show "entry visa when required". Therefore it also refers to family members who are not themselves Union citizens but also to family members who are Union citizens. The Italian law transposes Article 8 and 10 together since the requirements are very similar. (Presidential Decree of 28 December 2000, n. 445: Laws on administrative

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of Member State)	national provision	accord? (y/n)	
			dichiarazioni sostitutive di cui	statements referred to in Articles	,	documentation).
			agli articoli 46 e 47 limitatamente	46 and 47 but limited to states,		ŕ
			agli stati, alle qualità personali e	personal qualities and facts that		
			ai fatti certificabili o attestabili da	are possible to certify or		
			parte di soggetti pubblici italiani,	certified by the Italian public		
			fatte salve le speciali disposizioni	entities, except the special		
			contenute nelle leggi e nei	provisions contained in laws and		
			regolamenti concernenti la	regulations governing		
			disciplina dell'immigrazione e la	immigration and the condition of		
			condizione dello straniero. (R)	foreigners		
			3 Al di fuori dei casi	3. Outside the cases referred to		
			previsti al comma 2, i cittadini di	in paragraph 2, citizens of non		
			Stati non appartenenti all'Unione	EU Member States authorised to		
			autorizzati a soggiornare nel	reside in the territory of the		
			territorio dello Stato possono	State may use the replacement		
			utilizzare le dichiarazioni	statements referred to in Articles		
			sostitutive di cui agli articoli 46 e	46 and 47 according that they		
			47 nei casi in cui la produzione	are produced according to		
			delle stesse avvenga in	international conventions		
			applicazione di convenzioni	between Italy and the country of		
			internazionali fra l'Italia ed il	origin of the person concerned.		
			Paese di provenienza del	4. Outside of cases referred to in		
			dichiarante. (R)	paragraphs 2 and 3 states, the		
			4. Al di fuori dei casi di	personal qualities and facts are		
			cui ai commi 2 e 3 gli stati, le	documented by certificates or		
			qualità personali e i fatti, sono	attestations issued by the		
			documentati mediante certificati o	competent foreign authority of		
			attestazioni rilasciati dalla	the foreign State, accompanied		
			competente autorità dello Stato	by an Italian translation		
			estero, corredati di traduzione in	certified by the Italian consular		
			lingua italiana autenticata	authority which attests the		
			dall'autorità consolare italiana	conformity of the document to		
			che ne attesta la conformità	the original version, after having		
			all'originale, dopo aver ammonito	warned the person concerned		
			l'interessato sulle conseguenze penali della produzione di atti o	about the consequences of criminal acts or producing false		
			documenti non veritieri.]	documents.]		
	(a) a valid identity card or passport;	Art. 9.5 a) D.Lgs n. 30/07	a) un documento di identità o il	a) a valid identity document or	Y	Effective transposition
	(a) a valid identity card of passport;	Ait. 3.3 a) D.Lgs II. 30/0/	passaporto in corso di validità,	passport and the entry visa when	1	(however, see assessment of
			nonché il visto di ingresso quando	required;		transposition of Article 10).
			richiesto;	required,		transposition of Article 10).
			nemesto,			

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	
			Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
						The Italian provision also refers to the entry visa when required; this
						means that the provision refers in fact
						to family members who are not
						themselves Union citizens since the
						entry visa is only required for those
						latter. But it can also be a general
						provision applying to both since the documents under Article 8a and 10
						are the same. (Same comment as
						above).
	(b) a document attesting to the existence of a family relationship or of a registered	Art. 9.5 b) D.Lgs n. 30/07	b) un documento che attesti la qualità di familiare e []	b) a document attesting to the existence of a family	Y	Effective transposition
	partnership;		•	relationship and []		The reference to "registered
						partnership" is missing since that
						concept does not currently exist in Italy Please refer to comment in Art.
						2 above
	(c) where appropriate, the registration	Art. 9.5 c) D.Lgs n. 30/07	c) l'attestato della richiesta	c) the certificate of the	Y	Effective transposition
	certificate of the Union citizen whom		d'iscrizione anagrafica del	application for registration of the		-
	they are accompanying or joining;		familiare cittadino dell'Unione.	family member of the Union		The transposing provision refers to
				citizen.		the certificate of the application for registration and not to the registration
						certificate as the Directive requires.
						This is more a linguistic "nuance",
						In fact in Italy when requesting the
						registration a certificate of
						application for registration is issued immediately, then this last certificate
						is enough to satisfy the Directive's
						requirement (registration certificate).
	(d) in cases falling under points (c) and	Art. 9.5 b) D.Lgs n. 30/07	b) un documento che attesti la	b) a document attesting to the	Y	Transposed since family members
	(d) of Article 2(2), documentary		qualità di familiare e []	existence of a family		provided for in Article 2(2 c) and d)
	evidence that the conditions laid down			relationship and []		of the Directive can be descendants
	therein are met; (e) in cases falling under Article 3(2)(a),	Art. 9.5 b) D.Lgs n. 30/07	b) un documento che attesti,	b) a document attesting to the	Y	or ascendants. Effective transposition
	a document issued by the relevant	7.11. 7.3 0) D.Dgs II. 30/07	qualora richiesto, la qualità di	existence if requested, of	1	Effective transposition
	authority in the country of origin or	Circular of the Ministry of	familiare a carico; []	dependant family member; []		The Italian provision is more
	country from which they are arriving	Interior of 18 July 2007				favourable since it says that is
	certifying that they are dependants or					sufficient to proof that the person
	members of the household of the Union					concerned is dependant family

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
	citizen, or proof of the existence of		2.2022.202 2.0000)	po visioni	(3,1)	member without specifying the
	serious health grounds which strictly					grounds of health [serious- which
	require the personal care of the family					strictly require the personal care of
	member by the Union citizen;					the family member by the Union
						citizen;].
						The documents referred to in Article
						3(2)(a) are the contained in the
						Circular (page 3). The Circular refers
						to the documents that Union citizens
						shall have in order to register (in this
						case the Union citizen can self
						declare that they are dependants or
						members of the household of the
						Union citizen, or proof of the
	(f) : f-11: d At:-1- 2(2)(h)	Circular of the Ministry of			NT	existence of serious health grounds). Not transposed
	(f) in cases falling under Article 3(2)(b), proof of the existence of a durable	Interior of 18 July 2007			IN I	Not transposed
	relationship with the Union citizen.	linterior of 18 July 2007				However the Circular specifies that
	relationship with the Official eleizen.					the documents that are requested for
						the registration are: []document of
						the State of the Union citizen, who is
						the holder of the right of residence,
						from which it appears the relationship
						or the durable relationship registered
						in the same State; []
Art. 9.1	Administrative formalities for family	Art. 10.1 D.Lgs n. 30/07	Art. 10 (Carta di soggiorno per	Art. 10 (Residence cards for	Y	Almost literal transposition
	members who are not nationals of a Member State.		i familiari del cittadino comunitario non aventi la	family members of Union citizens who are not nationals		
	Wiember State.		cittadinanza di uno Stato	of a Member State)		Art. 10.1 D.Lgs n. 30/07 will be
	1. Member States shall issue a residence		membro dell'Unione europea)	1. After three months from the		replaced if the draft Legislative
	card to family members of a Union		1. I familiari del cittadino	date of arrival in the national		decree amending and supplementing
	citizen who are not nationals of a		dell'Unione non aventi la	territory, family members of a		D.Lgs n. 30/07 is finally adopted.
	Member State, where the planned period		cittadinanza di uno Stato membro,	Union citizen who are not		
	of residence is for more than three		di cui all'articolo 2, trascorsi tre	nationals of a Member State,		
	months.		mesi dall'ingresso nel territorio	referred to in Article 2, shall ask		
			nazionale, richiedono alla	for the "Carta di soggiorno di		
			questura competente per territorio	familiare di un cittadino		
			di residenza la «Carta di	dell'Unione" (residence card for		
			soggiorno di familiare di un cittadino dell'Unione», []	family member of a Union		
			cittaumo den Umone», []	citizen), [] to the Police		

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord? (y/n)	Comments/Problems
		Art. 9.7 D.Lgs n. 30/07 In this regard also Circular of the Ministry of Interior n. 19 of 6 April 2007 Art. 6.7 of Legislative Decree n. 286 of 1998				In this regards the Circular specifies that the registration of the family member who is not national of a MS is subject to the release of the Carta di soggiorno di familiare di un cittadino dell'Unione although it is not impeded to request the registration before obtaining the Carta di soggiorno di familiare di un cittadino dell'Unione This means that if the person concerned holds already the Carta di soggiorno then it is obvious that he/she is entitled to register; if she/he does not have yet the Carta di soggiorno but has done e.g., all the papers etc, so he/she has the "permission" (nulla osta) to register but the Carta di soggiorno has not yet arrived, then he/she might ask for registration BUT the procedure of registration will be considered as
Art. 9.2	2. The deadline for submitting the residence card application may not be less than three months from the date of arrival.	Art. 10.1 D.Lgs n. 30/07	[] trascorsi tre mesi dall'ingresso nel territorio nazionale, []	questura that is territorially competent of the registration and of any variation.] [] after three months from the date of arrival in the national territory, []	Y	completed once the Carta di soggiorno is shown. Almost literal transposition Art. 10.1 D.Lgs n. 30/07 will be replaced if the draft Legislative

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord? (y/n)	Comments/Problems
						decree amending and supplementing D.Lgs n. 30/07 is finally adopted.
Art. 9.3	3. Failure to comply with the requirement to apply for a residence card may make the person concerned liable to proportionate and non-discriminatory sanctions.				Y	Not transposed – no sanctions However, if the draft legislative decree (currently blocked) modifying the current Legislative Decree 30/2007 transposing Directive 2004/38 is finally adopted, then this particular provision will be considered as incorrectly transposed. According to the draft Decree not holding registrations certificate and failure to request a residence card are grounds for expulsion and this cannot be considered as a "proportionate and non-discriminatory sanctions", so it is not in compliance with the Directive.
Art.10.1	Issue of residence cards 1. The right of residence of family members of a Union citizen who are not nationals of a Member State shall be evidenced by the issuing of a document called 'Residence card of a family member of a Union citizen' no later than six months from the date on which they submit the application. A certificate of application for the residence card shall be issued immediately.	Art. 10.1 D.Lgs n. 30/07	1. I familiari del cittadino dell'Unione non aventi la cittadinanza di uno Stato membro, di cui all'articolo 2, [] richiedono alla questura competente per territorio di residenza la «Carta di soggiorno di familiare di un cittadino dell'Unione», redatta su modello conforme a quello stabilito con decreto del Ministro dell'interno da emanarsi entro sei mesi dalla data di entrata in vigore del presente decreto legislativo. Fino alla data di entrata in vigore del predetto decreto, e' rilasciato il titolo di soggiorno previsto dalla normativa vigente alla data di entrata in vigore del presente decreto.	1. After three months from the date of arrival in the national territory, family members of a Union citizen who are not nationals of a Member State, referred to in Article 2, [] shall ask for the "Carta di soggiorno di familiare di un cittadino dell'Unione" (residence card for family member of a Union citizen), [] to the Police (Questura) that is territorially competent. The card shall be prepared on a model in accordance with a decree of the Ministry of Interior Affairs hat needs to be issued within six months from the date of entry into force of this Legislative Decree. Until the entry into force of the decree, the residence card is issued according to the	N, Incorrect	Incorrect transposition Incorrect transposition since the implementing measures (the transposing provision refers to a model of residence card to be "issued within six months from the date of entry into force of this Legislative Decree", (i.e., 11 April 2007)) should have been in force by the deadline of transposition. Contacts with authorities (on 27 June 2008) have revealed that the model of residence card has not yet been prepared. Art. 10.1 D.Lgs n. 30/07 will be replaced if the draft Legislative decree amending and supplementing D.Lgs n. 30/07 is finally adopted.

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
Ait	Citation of the Article of the Directive	provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	Comments/1 Toblems
			Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
				legislation in force at the date of entry into force of this decree.		
		Art. 10.2 D.Lgs n. 30/07	2. Al momento della richiesta di rilascio della carta di soggiorno, al familiare del cittadino dell'Unione e' rilasciata una ricevuta secondo il modello definito con decreto del Ministro dell'interno di cui al comma 1.	2. When submitting the residence card application, the family member of a Union citizen receives a certificate according to the modality indicated by Ministerial decree referred to in paragraph 1.		This provision has correctly transposed the last part of the Directive's provision. "When submitting" implies immediately.
Art.10.2 (a)	2. For the residence card to be issued, Member States shall require presentation of the following documents: (a) a valid passport;	Art. 10.3 a) D.Lgs n. 30/07	3. Per il rilascio della Carta di soggiorno, e' richiesta la presentazione: a) del passaporto o documento equivalente, in corso di validità, nonché del visto di ingresso, qualora richiesto;	3. For the residence card to be issued, presentation of the following documents is required: a) passport; or equivalent valid document and entry visa when required;	N, Incorrect	Incorrect transposition Incorrect transposition since the national provisions also adds the requirement of the entry visa (when required).
Art.10.2 (b)	(b) a document attesting to the existence of a family relationship or of a registered partnership;	Art. 10.3 b) D.Lgs n. 30/07	b) di un documento che attesti la qualità di familiare e, qualora richiesto, di familiare a carico;	b) document attesting to the existence of a family relationship and, if required, of dependant family member;	Y	Effective transposition Effective transposition since it also adds the presentation of the document attesting to the existence of dependant family member; if required. Art. 10.3 b) of D.Lgs n. 30/07 fails to refer to "registered partnership" since in Italy they are not regulated. See comments on Article 2.2(b) above.
Art.10.2 (c)	(c) the registration certificate or, in the absence of a registration system, any other proof of residence in the host Member State of the Union citizen whom they are accompanying or joining;	Art. 10.3 c) D.Lgs n. 30/07	c) dell'attestato della richiesta d'iscrizione anagrafica del familiare cittadino dell'Unione;	c) certificate of the application for registration of the family member of the Union citizen;	N, Incorrect	Incorrect transposition The transposing provision refers to the certificate of the application for registration and not to the registration certificate as the Directive requires. This is more a linguistic "nuance", In fact in Italy when requesting the registration, a certificate of application for registration is issued immediately, then this last certificate is enough to satisfy the Directive's

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord? (y/n)	Comments/Problems
						requirement (registration certificate
			d) della fotografia dell'interessato, in formato tessera, in quattro esemplari.	d) four passport photos of the person concerned.		This is an additional requirement that makes the Italian provision more stringent. Therefore transposition is incorrect in relation to this point.
Art.10.2 (d)	(d) in cases falling under points (c) and (d) of Article 2(2), documentary evidence that the conditions laid down therein are met;	Art. 10.3 b) D.Lgs n. 30/07	[] e, qualora richiesto, di familiare a carico; []	[] and, if required, of dependant family member []	Y	Effective transposition Effective transposition since Art. 10.3 b) of the Italian Decree refers to both cases pf Art. 10.2 d) and 10.2 e) of the Directive.
Art.10.2 (e)	(e) in cases falling under Article 3(2)(a), a document issued by the relevant authority in the country of origin or country from which they are arriving certifying that they are dependants or members of the household of the Union citizen, or proof of the existence of serious health grounds which strictly require the personal care of the family member by the Union citizen;	Art. 10.3 b) D.Lgs n. 30/07	[] e, qualora richiesto, di familiare a carico; []	[] and, if required, of dependant family member []	Y	Both provisions (10.2 d) and e)) present the same differences as showed in correspondence of Art. 8.5 of the Directive (Art. 9,5 of the Italian provision). In Italy in order to have the personal data (anagrafe) registration as a family member of a Union citizen, as well as to have the Residence Card, no specific evidences are required as of being child minor of 21 of the citizen or partner or of the direct ascendant and neither the health grounds; only the document showing the quality of dependant family member is more generally required. Therefore Italy puts less condition. Therefore the provision is more favourable.
Art.10.2 (f)	(f) in cases falling under Article 3(2)(b), proof of the existence of a durable relationship with the Union citizen.	Circular of the Ministry of Interior of 18 July 2007			NT	Not transposed However the Circular specifies that the documents that are requested for the registration are: []document of the State of the Union citizen, who is the holder of the right of residence,

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord? (y/n)	Comments/Problems
						from which it appears the relationship or the durable relationship registered in the same State; []
Art.11.1	1. The residence card provided for by Article 10(1) shall be valid for five years from the date of issue or for the envisaged period of residence of the Union citizen, if this period is less than five years.	Art. 10.4 D.Lgs n. 30/07	4. La carta di soggiorno di familiare di un cittadino dell'Unione ha una validità di cinque anni dalla data del rilascio.	4. The resident card of a family member of a Union citizen shall be valid for five years from the date of issue.	Y	Effective transposition The Italian provision has not transposed the last part of the Directive's Art. 11.1; however this does not have practical consequences on the right of residence of the family member. Italy will not issue residence cards for less than 5 years
Art.11.2	2. The validity of the residence card shall not be affected by temporary absences not exceeding six months a year, or by absences of a longer duration for compulsory military service or by one absence of a maximum of 12 consecutive months for important reasons such as pregnancy and childbirth, serious illness, study or vocational training, or a posting in another Member State or a third country.	Art. 10.5 D.Lgs n. 30/07	5. La carta di soggiorno mantiene la propria validità anche in caso di assenze temporanee del titolare non superiori a sei mesi l'anno, nonché di assenze di durata superiore per l'assolvimento di obblighi militari ovvero di assenze fino a dodici mesi consecutivi per rilevanti motivi, quali la gravidanza e la maternità, malattia grave, studi o formazione professionale o distacco per motivi di lavoro in un altro Stato; e' onere dell'interessato esibire la documentazione atta a dimostrare i fatti che consentono la perduranza di validità.	5. The resident card remains valid in case of temporary absences not exceeding six months a year or by absences of a longer duration for compulsory military service or by absences of a maximum of 12 consecutive months for important reasons such as pregnancy and childbirth, serious illness, study or vocational training, or a posting in another State; it is on the party concerned to show the documents that corroborate the existence/validity of the facts that render the resident card still valid.	Y	Effective transposition although there are some differences in the wording. The national provision says "absences" in plural instead of "one absence". This might be a typo mistake or a case of less stringent requirement. One could argue that more absences of a maximum of 12 months would make possible even two or three absences (of a maximum of 12 months) in one year, going therefore further than the Directive. Moreover Art. 10.5 of D.Lgs n. 30/07 makes no distinction between "another Member State" or a "third country" but more generally refers to "another State", therefore including another MS or a third country. The Italian provision adds that the party concerned shall corroborate/proof the existence of the facts that render the resident card still valid: this requirement, although not given by the Directive does not seem to render transposition more stringent since it does not affect the duration

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord?	Comments/Problems
						requirements. The Italian authorities will not check. However, if for any reasons it is "discovered" it is on the party concerned to proof. This is linked to prove duration under Article 16 and 21 for acquiring the right of permanent residence.
Art.12.1	Retention of the right of residence by family members in the event of death or departure of the Union citizen 1. Without prejudice to the second subparagraph, the Union citizen's death or departure from the host Member State shall not affect the right of residence of his/her family members who are nationals of a Member State. Before acquiring the right of permanent residence, the persons concerned must meet the conditions laid down in points (a), (b), (c) or (d) of Article 7(1).	Art. 11.1 D.Lgs n. 30/07	Art. 11 (Conservazione del diritto di soggiorno dei familiari in caso di decesso o di partenza del cittadino dell'Unione europea) 1. Il decesso del cittadino dell'Unione o la sua partenza dal territorio nazionale non incidono sul diritto di soggiorno dei suoi familiari aventi la cittadinanza di uno Stato membro, a condizione che essi abbiano acquisito il diritto di soggiorno permanente ai sensi dell'articolo 14 o siano in possesso dei requisiti previsti dall'articolo 7, comma 1.	Art. 11 (Retention of the right of residence by family members in the event of death or departure of the Union citizen) 1. The Union citizen's death or departure from the national territory shall not affect the right of residence of his/her family members who are nationals of a Member State, provided that the persons concerned have acquired the right of permanent residence according to Article 14 or they fulfil the requirements laid down in Article 7.1.	Y	Effective transposition The structure of the Italian provision is slightly different a compared to the Directive but the substance is the same. The Italian provision expressly recalls the acquisition of the right of permanent residence. This does not constitute a conformity issue since if the conditions for permanent residence exist (Article 14 of Lgs n. 30/07), then a fortiori the concerned person has the right described in the first paragraph, i.e, the right of residence. Article 18 is Literally transposed The people retaining the right can then acquire the right of permanent residence after 5 years of residence. The other way round, namely, if the person concerned does not have the right of permanent residence in case of death or departure of the Union citizen, it is sufficient to fulfil the requirements of Art. 7.1 (that are those requested in order to obtain the right of residence for more than 3 months). In this case the provision refers to the
						In this case the provision refers to the whole Article 7 of the Directive

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord? (y/n)	Comments/Problems
						therefore there is full conformity of the two texts.
Art.12.2	2. Without prejudice to the second subparagraph, the Union citizen's death shall not entail loss of the right of residence of his/her family members who are not nationals of a Member State and who have been residing in the host Member State as family members for at least one year before the Union citizen's death.	Art. 11.2 D.Lgs n. 30/07	2. Il decesso del cittadino dell'Unione non comporta la perdita del diritto di soggiorno dei familiari non aventi la cittadinanza di uno Stato membro, sempre che essi abbiano soggiornato nel territorio nazionale per almeno un anno prima del decesso del cittadino dell'Unione []	2. The Union citizen's death shall not affect the right of residence of his/her family members who are not nationals of a Member State, provided that they have resided in the national territory for at least one year before the death of the Union citizen []	Y	Almost literal transposition
	Before acquiring the right of permanent residence, the right of residence of the persons concerned shall remain subject to the requirement that they are able to show that they are workers or self-employed persons or that they have sufficient resources for themselves and their family members not to become a burden on the social assistance system of the host Member State during their period of residence and have comprehensive sickness insurance cover in the host Member State, or that they are members of the family, already constituted in the host Member State, of a person satisfying these requirements. 'Sufficient resources' shall be as defined in Article 8(4).	Art. 11.2 D.Lgs n. 30/07 In this regard also Circular of the Ministry of Interior of 10 April 2007	[] ed abbiano acquisito il diritto di soggiorno permanente di cui all'articolo 14 o dimostrino di esercitare un'attività lavorativa subordinata od autonoma o di disporre per se' e per i familiari di risorse sufficienti, affinché non divengano un onere per il sistema di assistenza sociale dello Stato durante il loro soggiorno, nonché di una assicurazione sanitaria che copra tutti i rischi nello Stato, ovvero di fare parte del nucleo familiare, già costituito nello Stato, di una persona che soddisfa tali condizioni. Le risorse sufficienti sono quelle indicate all'articolo 9, comma 3.	[] and have acquired the right of permanent residence referred to in Article 14 or they are able to show that they are workers or self-employed persons or that they have sufficient resources for themselves and their family members not to become a burden on the social assistance system of the State during their period of residence and have comprehensive sickness insurance cover in the State, or that they are members of the family, already constituted in the State, of a person satisfying these requirements. 'Sufficient resources' shall be as defined in Article 9.3.	Y	Almost literal transposition of the substantial requirements although in the last part it refers to the "sufficient resources' as defined in Article 8(4) of the Directive -Article 9.3 of Italian Decree that is not correctly transposed in itself. The reference to the Articles is obviously different therefore correct: Article 9.3 of the national Decree transposes Article 8(4) of the Directive. For the reference to Article 14 refer to comment <i>supra</i> (Article 12.1 to the national provision).
			3. Nell'ipotesi di cui al comma 2, quando non sussiste il requisito del soggiorno nel territorio nazionale per almeno un anno si applica l'articolo 30, comma 5, del decreto legislativo 25 luglio 1998, n. 286, e successive	3. In the case referred to in paragraph 2, when the requirement of residence within the national territory for at least one year is not fulfilled, Article 30.5 of Legislative Decree of 25 July 1998, n. 286 and its	Y	This provision has been added by the transposing Decree. When the requirement of residence for at least one year is not fulfilled, a permit of residence for the family is given, according Art. 30.5 of Legislative Decree n. 286/1998. According to

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of	Translation into English of national	Fully in accord?	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
			modificazioni.	amendments, applies.		Art. 30.5 family members of a Union citizen who are not nationals of a Member State might keep the right of residence in Italy although they have resided for less than one year in the national territory. In this case however, the right of residence is converted into right of residence as workers or self employed persons or for study reasons. (Basically if the death Union citizen had the right of residence, that right goes to his/her the family member but converted into a right of residence for specific reasons that are explained above).
						Italy is therefore facilitating such right even when the conditions are not met, then one could argue that Italian legislation is more favourable.
	Such family members shall retain their right of residence exclusively on a personal basis.				NT	Not transposed
Art.12.3	3. The Union citizen's departure from the host Member State or his/her death shall not entail loss of the right of residence of his/her children or of the parent who has actual custody of the children, irrespective of nationality, if the children reside in the host Member State and are enrolled at an educational establishment, for the purpose of studying there, until the completion of their studies.	Art. 11.4 D.Lgs n. 30/07	4. La partenza del cittadino dell'Unione dal territorio nazionale o il suo decesso non comportano la perdita del diritto di soggiorno dei figli o del genitore che ne ha l'affidamento, indipendentemente dal requisito della cittadinanza, se essi risiedono nello Stato e sono iscritti in un istituto scolastico per seguirvi gli studi, e fino al termine degli studi stessi.	from the national territory or his/her death shall not entail loss of the right of residence of his/her children or of the parent who has custody of the children, irrespective of nationality, if the children reside in State and are enrolled at an educational establishment, for the purpose of studying there, until the completion of their studies.	Y	Effective transposition The Italian provision only refers to "custody" and not to "actual custody" but the "actual" is implicit
Art.13.1	Retention of the right of residence by family members in the event of divorce, annulment of marriage or termination of registered partnership	Art. 12.1 D.Lgs n. 30/07	Art. 12 (Mantenimento del diritto di soggiorno dei familiari in caso di divorzio e di annullamento del matrimonio) 1. Il divorzio e l'annullamento del	of residence by family members in the event of divorce, annulment of	Y	Almost literal transposition The concept of registered partnership does not currently exist in Italy.

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord? (y/n)	Comments/Problems
	1. Without prejudice to the second subparagraph, divorce, annulment of the Union citizen's marriage or termination of his/her registered partnership, as referred to in point 2(b) of Article 2 shall not affect the right of residence of his/her family members who are nationals of a Member State.		matrimonio dei cittadini dell'Unione non incidono sul diritto di soggiorno dei loro familiari aventi la cittadinanza di uno Stato membro, []	1. Divorce and annulment of the Union citizen's marriage, shall not affect the right of residence of his/her family members who are nationals of a Member State, []		(for "registered partnership" see comment in correspondence of Article 2(2). (b) of the Directive)
	Before acquiring the right of permanent residence, the persons concerned must meet the conditions laid down in points (a), (b), (c) or (d) of Article 7(1).	Art. 12.1 D.Lgs n. 30/07	[] a condizione che essi abbiano acquisito il diritto di soggiorno permanente di cui all'articolo 14 o soddisfino personalmente le condizioni previste all'articolo 7, comma 1	[] provided that they [the persons concerned have acquired the right of permanent residence referred to in Article 14 or they personally fulfil the requirements laid down in Article 7.1.	Y	Almost literal transposition See comments on Article 12.1 regarding reference to Art. 14 and 7.1. If the family member has the right of permanent residence referred to in Article 14 then obviously divorce etc. do not affect his/her right of residence; on the contrary if he/she satisfies the conditions laid down in Art. 7.1, then divorce etc. do not affect his/her right of residence either.
Art.13.2 (a)	2. Without prejudice to the second subparagraph, divorce, annulment of marriage or termination of the registered partnership referred to in point 2(b) of Article 2 shall not entail loss of the right of residence of a Union citizen's family members who are not nationals of a Member State where: (a) prior to initiation of the divorce or annulment proceedings or termination of the registered partnership referred to in point 2(b) of Article 2, the marriage or registered partnership has lasted at least three years, including one year in the host Member State; or	Art. 12.2 a) D.Lgs n. 30/07	2. Il divorzio e l'annullamento del matrimonio con il cittadino dell'Unione non comportano la perdita del diritto di soggiorno dei familiari del cittadino dell'Unione non aventi la cittadinanza di uno Stato membro a condizione che essi abbiano acquisito il diritto al soggiorno permanente di cui all'articolo 14 o che si verifichi una delle seguenti condizioni: a) il matrimonio e' durato almeno tre anni, di cui almeno un anno nel territorio nazionale, prima dell'inizio del procedimento di divorzio o annullamento;	2. Divorce and annulment of marriage with a Union citizens shall not entail loss of the right of residence of a Union citizen's family members who are not nationals of a Member State provided that they have acquired the right of permanent residence referred to in Article 14 or one of the following conditions exist: a) the marriage has lasted at least three years, including one year in the national territory, before the beginning of the divorce or annulment proceeding;	Y	Almost literal transposition For the reference to Article 14 refer to comment <i>supra</i> (Article 12.1 do the national provision). The concept of registered partnership does not currently exist in Italy (see comments above). The Italian provision does not insert ";" in the end of the paragraph; this does not represent a problem since the text of the provision clearly states that "or one of the following conditions exist", that mean the different subparagraphs are alternative, in line with the Directive (the same comment applies for

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of Member State)	national provision	accord? (y/n)	
					V	Articles Art. 1.2 b) and Art. 12.2 c)). For comments in relation to Art.14 please see comments on Art. 12.2 of the Directive. (for "registered partnership" see comment in correspondence of Article 2(2). (b) of the Directive)
Art.13.2 (b)	(b) by agreement between the spouses or the partners referred to in point 2(b) of Article 2 or by court order, the spouse or partner who is not a national of a Member State has custody of the Union citizen's children; or	Art. 12.2 b) D.Lgs n. 30/07	b) il coniuge non avente la cittadinanza di uno Stato membro ha ottenuto l'affidamento dei figli del cittadino dell'Unione in base ad accordo tra i coniugi o a decisione giudiziaria;	b) by agreement between the spouses or by court order, the spouse who is not a national of a Member State has custody of the Union citizen's children; or	Y	Almost literal transposition There is no reference to the "partner" since the concept of registered partnership does not currently exist in Italy . (see comments).
Art.13.2 (c)	(c) this is warranted by particularly difficult circumstances, such as having been a victim of domestic violence while the marriage or registered partnership was subsisting; or	Art. 12.2 c) D.Lgs n. 30/07	c) l'interessato risulti parte offesa in procedimento penale, in corso o definito con sentenza di condanna, per reati contro la persona commessi nell'ambito familiare;	c) the concerned person is offended party in a criminal proceeding, which is still going on or settles/concluded with a conviction judgment regarding crimes against the person committed within the family orbit/environment;	N, Incorrect	Incorrect transposition and more stringent The Directive more generally refers to "particularly difficult circumstances", that is not the same as the situations mentioned in the transposing decree that is in fact more stringent. In addition, the Directive says that the annulment or divorce [] do not affect the right of residence of the partner or spouse for having been victim of domestic violence. The Directive does not mention the necessity of a criminal proceeding. On the contrary, the Italian provision says that the person concerned (the spouse) is offended party in a criminal proceeding, which is still going on or settles/concluded with a conviction judgment regarding crimes against the person committed within the family orbit/environment; in this regard the transposing

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord? (y/n)	Comments/Problems
						provision is also much more stringent. (for "registered partnership" see comment in correspondence of Article 2(2) (b) of the Directive)
Art.13.2 (d)	d) by agreement between the spouses or partners referred to in point 2 (b) of Article 2 or by court order, the spouse or partner who is not a national of a Member State has the right of access to a minor child, provided that the court has ruled that such access must be in the host Member State, and for as long as is required.	Art. 12.2 d) D.Lgs n. 30/07	d) il coniuge non avente la cittadinanza di uno Stato membro beneficia, in base ad un accordo tra i coniugi o a decisione giudiziaria, di un diritto di visita al figlio minore, a condizione che l'organo giurisdizionale ha ritenuto che le visite devono obbligatoriamente essere effettuate nel territorio nazionale, e fino a quando sono considerate necessarie.	Member State has the right of access to a minor child, provided that the court has ruled that such access must be in the national territory, and for as long as is required.	Y	Almost literal transposition There is no reference to the "partner" since the concept of registered partnership does not currently exist in Italy. (for "partner" see comment in correspondence of Article 2(2) (b) of the Directive)
	Before acquiring the right of permanent residence, the right of residence of the persons concerned shall remain subject to the requirement that they are able to show that they are workers or self-employed persons or that they have sufficient resources for themselves and their family members not to become a burden on the social assistance system of the host Member State during their period of residence and have comprehensive sickness insurance cover in the host Member State, or that they are members of the family, already constituted in the host Member State, of a person satisfying these requirements. 'Sufficient resources' shall be as defined in Article 8(4).	Art. 12.4 and 12.3 D.Lgs n. 30/07	4. Nei casi di cui al comma 2, salvo che gli interessati abbiano acquisito il diritto di soggiorno permanente di cui al successivo articolo 14, il loro diritto di soggiorno e' comunque subordinato al requisito che essi dimostrino di esercitare un'attività lavorativa subordinata o autonoma, o di disporre per se' e per i familiari di risorse sufficienti, affinché non divengano un onere per il sistema di assistenza sociale dello Stato durante il soggiorno, nonché di una assicurazione sanitaria che copra tutti i rischi nello Stato, ovvero di fare parte del nucleo familiare, già costituito nello Stato, di una persona che soddisfa tali condizioni. Le risorse sufficienti sono quelle indicate all'articolo 9, comma 3.	that they are members of the family, already constituted in the	Y	Effective transposition Almost literal transposition of the substantial requirements although in the last part it refers to the "sufficient resources' as defined in Article 8(4) of the Directive -Article 9.3 of Italian Decree that is not correctly transposed in itself.

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of	Translation into English of national	Fully in accord?	Comments/Problems
			Member State)	provision resources' shall be as defined in	(y/n)	
				Article 9.3.		
			3. Nei casi di cui al comma 2, quando non si verifichi alcuna delle condizioni di cui alle lettere <i>a</i>), <i>b</i>), <i>c</i>) e <i>d</i>), si applica l'articolo 30, comma 5, del citato decreto legislativo n. 286 del 1998, e successive modificazioni.	3. In cases falling under paragraph 2, when none of the conditions referred to in letters a), b), c) and d) are satisfied, Article 30.5 of the mentioned Legislative Decree n. 286 of 1998, and its amendments, shall apply.	Y	This provision has been added by the transposing Decree. When the requirement of paragraph a), b), c) d) are not fulfilled a permit of residence for the person concerned, is given according to Art. 30.5 of Legislative Decree n. 286/1998. In fact, in this case, the right of residence is converted into permit of residence as workers or self employed persons or for study reasons. (Basically in case of divorce, annulment of the Union citizen's marriage the right of the Union citizen goes to his/her family member but converted into a permit of residence for specific reasons that are explained above).
						The reference to the Articles is obviously different, therefore correct: Article 9.3 of the national Decree transposes Article 8(4) of the Directive.
						For the reference to Article 14 refer to comment <i>supra</i> (Article 12.1 do the national provision).
	Such family members shall retain their right of residence exclusively on personal basis.				NT	Not transposed
Art.14.1	Retention of the right of residence	Art. 13.1 D.Lgs n. 30/07	1. I cittadini dell'Unione ed i loro	1. Union citizens and their	Y	Correct transposition
	Union citizens and their family members shall have the right of residence provided		familiari beneficiano del diritto di soggiorno di cui all'articolo 6, finché hanno le risorse	family members shall have the right of residence provided for in Article 6, as long as they have		The statement in the last part of the Italian provision refers to Article 27's

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of	Translation into English of national	Fully in accord?	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
	for in Article 6, as long as they do not		economiche di cui all'articolo 9,	the resources referred to in		grounds for restricting the right of
	become an unreasonable burden on the		comma 3, che gli impediscono di	Article 9.3, so not to become an		residence. Therefore is correct.
	social assistance system of the host Member State.		diventare un onere eccessivo per il sistema di assistenza sociale dello	unreasonable burden on the social assistance system of the		As the provision is framed, it does
	Wellber State.		Stato membro ospitante e finché	host Member State and as long		not imply that if an EU citizen asks
			non costituiscano un pericolo per	as they do not represent a danger		for social assistance, he/she will be
			l'ordine e la sicurezza pubblica.	for public policy or public		considered as an unreasonable
				security.		burden. It shall also be considered that Italy will not "take the initiative"
						to check the existence of the
						resources referred to in Art. 1. Italy
						might become aware of the
						insufficient resources because the
						person asks for the social assistance or because he/she declares it.
						of because he/she declares it.
						Actually it would seem that the
						provision is even more favourable
						since according to Art. 13.1 D.Lgs n. 30/07 the retention of the right of
						residence is subject not only to one
						condition (resources referred to in
						Article 9(3) so not to become an
						unreasonable burden on the social
						assistance system of the host Member State) but also to another one (do not
						represent a danger for public policy
						or public security). So even if
						someone does not have resources
						he/she cannot lose the right unless he/she is a danger to public policy or
						public security. Therefore in this
						sense the requirements are two: "as
						long as they have the resources []"
						and "as long as they do not represent
						a danger for public policy or public security."
Art.14.2	2. Union citizens and their family	Art. 13.2 D.Lgs n. 30/07	2. I cittadini dell'Unione e i loro	2. Union citizens and their	Y	Literal transposition.
	Members shall have the right of		familiari beneficiano del diritto di	family Members shall have the		
	residence provided for in Articles 7, 12	In this regard also Circular of the	soggiorno di cui agli articoli 7, 11	right of residence provided for in		Articles 7, 11 and 12 of the Italian
	and 13 as long as they meet the	Ministry of Interior n.19 of 6	e 12, finché soddisfano le	Articles 7, 11 and 12 as long as		Decree transpose Articles 7, 12 and

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of	Translation into English of national	Fully in accord?	Comments/Problems
		provision (legarite: & art.)	Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
	conditions set out therein.	April 2007	condizioni fissate negli stessi articoli.	they meet the conditions set out therein.	•	13 of the Directive.
	In specific cases where there is a reasonable doubt as to whether a Union citizen or his/her family members satisfies the conditions set out in Articles 7, 12 and 13, Member States may verify if these conditions are fulfilled. This verification shall not be carried out systematically.	Order of the President of the Council of Ministers on May 30, 2008 (Order No. 3676) Provisions urgent civil protection to address the state of emergency in relation to settlements of nomadic communities in the region Lazio. Order of the President of the Council of Ministers on May 30, 2008 (Order No. 3677) Provisions urgent civil protection to address the state of emergency in relation to settlements of nomadic communities in the region Lombardy Order of the President of the Council of Ministers on May 30, 2008 (Order No. 3678) Provisions urgent civil protection of Ministers on May 30, 2008 (Order No. 3678) Provisions urgent civil protection to address the state of emergency in relation to settlements of nomadic communities in the region Campania			NT	Not transposed. It seems that they will not check. However, recent <i>Ordinanze</i> issued by the President of the Council of Ministers require special Commissioners appointed by the said <i>Ordiananze</i> , to do a series of checks to nomads camps that are not compatible with the Directive. In particular he/she is supposed to make (apparently) systematic monitoring of the nomads camps (e.g. identify illegal camps, to do a census of all the persons living in such camps, to adopt measures aimed at clearing and restoration of areas which are occupied by illegal camps, etc). This goes beyond the provision of the Directive. See CS for a more detailed comment on this.
Art.14.3	3. An expulsion measure shall not be the automatic consequence of a Union citizen's or his or her family member's recourse to the social assistance system of the host Member State.				NT	Not transposed
Art.14.4 (a)	4. By way of derogation from paragraphs 1 and 2 and without prejudice to the provisions of Chapter VI, an expulsion measure may in no case be adopted against Union citizens or their family members if:	Art. 13.3 a) D.Lgs n. 30/07	3. Ferme le disposizioni concernenti l'allontanamento per motivi di ordine e sicurezza pubblica, un provvedimento di allontanamento non può essere adottato nei confronti di cittadini	stated in the provisions on expulsion for public policy and public security, an expulsion measure may in no case be	Y, More favourabl e	More favourable transposition The Italian provision only refers to provisions on expulsion for public policy and public security, while the Directive refers to the whole Chapter

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord? (y/n)	Comments/Problems
	(a) the Union citizens are workers or self-employed persons, or		dell'Unione o dei loro familiari, qualora; a) i cittadini dell'Unione siano lavoratori subordinati o autonomi;	or their family members if: a) the Union citizens are workers or self-employed persons;		VI, which includes provisions on public health. See content of art 20(8) of the Italian Decree that transposes art. 29(2) of the Dir which does not allow for expulsion on the grounds of public health.
Art.14.4 (b)	(b) the Union citizens entered the territory of the host Member State in order to seek employment. In this case, the Union citizens and their family members may not be expelled for as long as the Union citizens can provide evidence that they are continuing to seek employment and that they have a genuine chance of being engaged.	Art. 13.3 b) D.Lgs n. 30/07	b) i cittadini dell'Unione siano entrati nel territorio dello Stato per cercare un posto di lavoro. In tale caso i cittadini dell'Unione e i membri della loro famiglia non possono essere allontanati fino a quando i cittadini dell'Unione possono dimostrare di essere iscritti nel Centro per l'impiego da non più di sei mesi, ovvero di aver reso la dichiarazione di immediata disponibilità allo svolgimento dell'attività lavorativa, di cui all'articolo 2, comma 1, del decreto legislativo 21 aprile 2000, n. 181, così come sostituito dall'articolo 3 del decreto legislativo 19 dicembre 2002, n. 297 e di non essere stati esclusi dallo stato di disoccupazione ai sensi dell'articolo 4 del medesimo decreto legislativo n. 297 del 2002.	b) the Union citizens entered the territory of the State in order to seek employment. In this case, the Union citizens and their family members may not be expelled for as long as the Union citizens can provide evidence that they are registered in the <i>Centro per l'impiego</i> for not longer than six months, or by means of a declaration have declared immediate willingness to carry out work referred to in Article 2.1 of Legislative Decree of 21 April 2000, n. 181 as repealed by Article 3 of Legislative Decree of 19 December 2002, n. 297 and not be excluded from unemployment status according to Article 4 of Legislative Decree n. 297 of 2002.	Y, More favourabl e	More favourable transposition The first part of the provision has been literally transposed; in the second part of the transposing Decree, the fact to be registered in the employment office represents evidence that the Union citizens are continuing to seek employment. The same for the other two requirements mentioned in the Italian provision, namely, the declaration of immediate readiness to carry out work, and not be excluded from unemployment status. There is no mention of the evidence to "have a genuine chance of being engaged." And this renders the Italian provision even more favourable.
Art.15.1	Procedural safeguards The procedures provided for by Articles 30 and 31 shall apply by analogy to all decisions restricting free movement of Union citizens and their family members on grounds other than public policy, public security or public health.	Art. 8 D.Lgs n. 30/07	Art. 8 (Ricorsi avverso il mancato riconoscimento del diritto di soggiorno) 1. Avverso il provvedimento di rifiuto e revoca del diritto di cui agli articoli 6 e 7, e' ammesso ricorso al tribunale in composizione monocratica del luogo ove dimora il richiedente, il quale provvede, sentito l'interessato, nei modi di cui agli articoli 737 e seguenti del codice	Art. 8 (Appeal against non recognition of the right of residence) 1. The measures refusing or revokes the rights provided for in Article 6 and 7, can be appealed before the monocratic Court of the place where the person concerned has his/her "dimora" (place where a person is even only for a short period) the Court decides according to	N, Incomplet e and Incorrect	Incomplete and incorrect transposition The Italian legislation does not contain a provision framed as the one of the Directive. Art. 21 refers to guarantees (not all) set in Art. 30 and 31 (see highlighted in bold in the text of the Law) with the following differences: - the person concerned shall

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
7110	Citation of the fitties of the Birecuve	provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	Commency/110bicins
		provision (regarized et arti)	Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
			di procedura civile.	the procedures referred to in	V ,	be informed precisely and in full of
				Articles 737 and following of the		the grounds of expulsion, while the
				civil procedural code, after		Italian provision requests that the act
				having heard the person		shall explain the grounds
				concerned.		- the application for an
						interim order to suspend enforcement
						of that decision is not included in
		New Art. 21 D.Lgs n. 30/07 as	Art. 21 (Allontanamento per	Art. 21 (Expulsion on grounds		Italy for grounds other than public
		replaced by Art. 1.1 e) D.Lgs n. 32/08	cessazione delle condizioni che	of cessation of the conditions		policy, public security or public health.
		32/08	determinano il diritto di soggiorno)	that give the right of residence) 1. The expulsion decision of		In this regard see also the ECJ ¹ that
			1. Il provvedimento di	other Member States' citizens		has stated that" Member States must
			allontanamento dei cittadini degli	and their family members		take all steps to ensure that the
			altri Stati membri dell'Unione	irrespective of nationality, may		safeguard of the provisions of the
			europea e dei loro familiari,	also be adopted when the		directive is available to any national
			qualunque sia la loro cittadinanza,	conditions that give the person		of another Member State who is
			può altresì essere adottato quando	concerned the right of residence,		subject to a decision ordering
			vengono a mancare le condizioni	referred to in Articles 6, 7 and		expulsion".
			che determinano il diritto di	13 lack, except what provided		Transposition is therefore incorrect in
			soggiorno dell'interessato ai sensi	for in Articles 11 and 12.		this regard.
			degli articoli 6, 7 e 13 e salvo			
			quanto previsto dagli articoli 11 e			Articles 8 of D.Lgs n. 30/07, only
			12.			mentions the possibility to appeal for the non recognition of the right
			2. Il provvedimento di cui al	2. The decision referred to in		provided for in Article 6 and 7.
			comma 1 e' adottato dal Prefetto,	paragraph 1 is adopted by the		Article 8 does not refer to expulsion
			territorialmente competente	Prefetto territorially competent,		and therefore does not include the
			secondo la residenza o dimora del	according to the residence or		guarantees provided for in Art. 15
			destinatario, anche su	dimora/address of the person		and therefore in Art. 30 and 31.
			segnalazione motivata del sindaco	concerned, also upon a		(However, it is partially covered by
			del luogo di residenza o dimora,	grounded recommendation of the		Article 21 which refers to expulsion
			con atto motivato e notificato	Major of the place of residence		on grounds other than public order
			all'interessato. Il provvedimento e'	or of the dimora/address, by an		etc.)
			adottato tenendo conto della	act that explains the grounds of		
			durata del soggiorno	the decision and that is notified		
			dell'interessato, della sua età, della	to the person concerned. The		
			sua salute, della sua integrazione	expulsion decision takes into		
			sociale e culturale e dei suoi	consideration how long the		
			legami con il Paese di origine. Il	individual concerned has resided		

ITALY 49/130

¹ E.g., Case C-136/03 Dörr and Ünal par. 49. Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord? (y/n)	Comments/Problems
			provvedimento riporta le modalita' di impugnazione, nonché il termine per lasciare il territorio nazionale, che non può essere inferiore ad un mese. Se il destinatario non comprende la lingua italiana, si applicano le disposizioni di cui all'articolo 20, comma 10	on its territory, his/her age, state of health, social and cultural integration into the host Member State and the extent of his/her links with the country of origin. The expulsion decision indicates the redress procedures and the deadline to leave the national territory that cannot be less than one month. If the person concerned does not have an understating of the Italian language, the provision of Art. 20.10 shall apply. [Art. 20.10. [] If the person concerned does not comprehend the Italian language, then the expulsion measure is accompanied by a translation of its content, also using suitable models, sufficiently detailed, written in a language that the person concerned is able to comprehend or if this is not possible for lack of translation's personnel, in any event in French, English, Spanish or German, according the preference indicated by the person concerned shall be notified the expulsion measure.]		
			3. Unitamente al provvedimento di allontanamento e' consegnata all'interessato una attestazione di obbligo di adempimento dell'allontanamento, secondo le modalità stabilite con decreto del	3. Together with the expulsion decision the person concerned is given a certificate concerning the obligation to fulfil the expulsion, according to the procedures set by a decree of the		

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	
			Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
			Ministro dell'interno e del	Ministries of Internal and		
			Ministro degli affari esteri, da presentare presso un consolato	External Affairs; the mentioned certificate shall be produced		
			italiano. [Il provvedimento di	with an Italian Consulate. [The		
			allontanamento di cui al comma 1	expulsion decision referred to in		
			non puo' prevedere un divieto di	paragraph 1 shall not impose a		
			reingresso sul territorio	ban on entry in the national		
			nazionale.]	territory.]		
			4. []	4. []		
Art.15.2	2. Expiry of the identity card or passport	New Art. 21.1 D.Lgs n. 30/07 as	Art. 21 (Allontanamento per	Art. 21 (Expulsion on grounds	N,	Incorrect transposition
	on the basis of which the person	replaced by Art. 1.1 e) D.Lgs n.	cessazione delle condizioni che	of cessation of the conditions	Incorrect	
	concerned entered the host Member State	32/08	determinano il diritto di	that give the right of residence)		Not transposed as such but the Italian
	and was issued with a registration certificate or residence card shall not		soggiorno) 1. Il provvedimento di	1. The expulsion decision of other Member States' citizens		rule seems to be more stringent since Article 21 of D.Lgs n. 30/07 (as
	constitute a ground for expulsion from		allontanamento dei cittadini degli	and their family members		amended) says that an "expulsion
	the host Member State.		altri Stati membri dell'Unione	irrespective of nationality, may		decision of other Member States'
			europea e dei loro familiari,			citizens and their family members
			qualunque sia la loro cittadinanza,	conditions that give the person		irrespective of nationality, may also
			può altresì essere adottato quando	concerned the right of residence,		be adopted when the conditions that
			vengono a mancare le condizioni che determinano il diritto di	referred to in Articles 6, 7 and 13 lack, except what provided		give the person concerned the right of residence, referred to in Articles 6, 7
			soggiorno dell'interessato ai sensi			and 13 do not exist, (except what
			degli articoli 6, 7 e 13 e salvo	[]		provided for in Articles 11 and 12)".
			quanto previsto dagli articoli 11 e			
			12.			Article 6.1 of the transposing Decree
			[]			requires as an essential condition in
						order to have the right of residence, a valid identity document which is
						valid for expatriation according to the
						legislation of the State of nationality.
						This seems to imply that if the
						conditions are not fulfilled (expiry of
						the document), this might be a
						ground of expulsion, in contradiction to the Directive's provision.
						•
						The expiry of the identity document
						is therefore considered as a situation
						that makes the residence of the person concerned as unlawful.
						person concerned as umawruf.

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art.15.3 3. The host Member State may not impose a ban on entry in the context of an expulsion decision to which paragraph 1 applies. New Art. 21 D.Lgs n. 30/07 as replaced by Art. 1.1 e) D.Lgs n. 32/08 New Art. 21 D.Lgs n. 30/07 as replaced by Art. 1.1 e) D.Lgs n. 30/07 an expulsion decision to which paragraph 1 applies. New Art. 21 D.Lgs n. 30/07 as replaced by Art. 1.1 e) D.Lgs n. 30/07 as replaced by Art. 1.1 e) D.Lgs n. 30/07 as replaced by Art. 1.1 e) non può prevedere un divieto di reingresso sul territorio nazionale.	(Also see analysis of problem in 61.11 <i>bis</i> of aggravating committing in the territo	CS for a more detailed of the non conformity relation to new Article of the CP creating an a circumstance for persons
impose a ban on entry in the context of an expulsion decision to which paragraph an expulsion decision to which paragraph and a limit and		a crime who are illegally ory of Italy).
	agraph 1 shall on entry in the Correct tr provision of decision bar conditions residence a	
Chapter IV RESIDENCE Section I. Eligibility		
Art. 16.1 General rule for Union citizens and their family members 1. Union citizens who have resided legally for a continuous period of five years in the host Member State shall have the right of permanent residence there. This right shall not be subject to the conditions provided for in Chapter III. Art. 14.1 D.Lgs n. 30/07 Art. 14 (Diritto di soggiorno permanente) 1. Il cittadino dell'Unione che ha soggiornato legalmente ed in via continuativa per cinque anni nel territorio nazionale ha diritto al soggiorno permanente non subordinato alle condizioni previste dagli articoli 7, 11, 12 e 13. Art. 14 (Diritto di soggiorno residence) 1. Union citizens resided legally for period of five years in the host Member State shall have the right of permanente non subordinato alle condizioni previste dagli articoli 7, 11, 12 e 13.	ns who have r a continuous years in the shall have the ent residence ht shall not be e conditions rticle 7, 11, 12 The substa correctly Directive residence transposing Articles 7 of the Directive residence transposes transposes transposes transposes transposes transposes transposition provisions reference he the condition	ansposition ance of the provision is transposed but the efers to the whole Chapter is 6 to 15), while the Decree only refers to (that transposes Article 7 ective) 11 (that transposes of the Directive), 12 (that Article 13) and 13 (that Article 14). Although the ers to lesser provisions as to the Directive, on is effective because the not covered by the Italian have no a real impact on ons for residence.
Art. 16.2 2. Paragraph 1 shall apply also to family members who are not nationals of a Member State and have legally resided with the Union citizen in the host 2. Paragraph 1 shall apply also to family articoli 11 e 12, il familiare non avente la cittadinanza di uno Stato members who are membro acquisisce il diritto di of a Member State	provisions of Y Effective training 12, family e not nationals Although	

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of	Translation into English of national	Fully in accord?	Comments/Problems
	Member State for a continuous period of five years.		Member State) soggiorno permanente se ha soggiornato legalmente in via continuativa per cinque anni nel territorio nazionale unitamente al cittadino dell'Unione.	right of permanent residence if have legally resided with the Union citizen in the national territory for a continuous period of five years.	(y/n)	the Directive) and 12 (Art. 13 of the Directive) that the Directive does not do it can be considered that transposition is effective since the substance of the provision (also considered Art. 18 of the Directive) appears the same. Art 18 in fact says that family members of Union citizens who are not national of a MS have to satisfy the conditions laid down in Art. 12 and 13 of the Directive if pertinent.
Art.16.3	3. Continuity of residence shall not be affected by temporary absences not exceeding a total of six months a year, or by absences of a longer duration for compulsory military service, or by one absence of a maximum of 12 consecutive months for important reasons such as pregnancy and childbirth, serious illness, study or vocational training, or a posting in another Member State or a third country.	Art. 14.3 D.Lgs n. 30/07 In this regard also Circular of the Ministry of Interior n. 19 of 6 April 2007	3. La continuità del soggiorno non e' pregiudicato da assenze che non superino complessivamente sei mesi l'anno, nonché da assenze di durata superiore per l'assolvimento di obblighi militari ovvero da assenze fino a dodici mesi consecutivi per motivi rilevanti, quali la gravidanza e la maternità, malattia grave, studi o formazione professionale o distacco per motivi di lavoro in un altro Stato membro o in un Paese terzo.	3. Continuity of residence shall not be affected by absences not exceeding a total of six months a year, or by absences of a longer duration for compulsory military service, or by absences of a maximum of 12 consecutive months for important reasons such as pregnancy and childbirth, serious illness, study or vocational training, or a posting in another Member State or a third country.	Y	Effective transposition Correct transposition although there are some differences in the wording. The national provision says "absences" in plural instead of "one absence". This looks like a typo mistake.
Art.16.4	4. Once acquired, the right of permanent residence shall be lost only through absence from the host Member State for a period exceeding two consecutive years.	Art. 14.4 D.Lgs n. 30/07	4. Il diritto di soggiorno permanente si perde in ogni caso a seguito di assenze dal territorio nazionale di durata superiore a due anni consecutivi.	4. Once acquired, the right of permanent residence shall be lost only through absence from the national territory for a period exceeding two consecutive years.	Y	Almost literal transposition A new par, namely Art. 14.4bis D.Lgs n. 30/07 will be added if the draft Legislative decree amending and supplementing D.Lgs n. 30/07 is finally adopted.
Art.17.1 (a)	Exemptions for persons no longer working in the host Member State and their family members	Art. 15.1 a) D.Lgs n. 30/07	Art. 15 (Deroghe a favore dei lavoratori che hanno cessato la loro attività nello Stato membro ospitante e dei loro familiari)	Art. 15 (Exemptions for persons no longer working in the host Member State and their family members)	Y	Almost literal transposition Article 14 corresponds to Article 16

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of	Translation into English of national	Fully in accord?	Comments/Problems
	1. By way of derogation from Article 16, the right of permanent residence in the host Member State shall be enjoyed before completion of a continuous period of five years of residence by: (a) workers or self-employed persons who, at the time they stop working, have reached the age laid down by the law of that Member State for entitlement to an old age pension or workers who cease paid employment to take early retirement, provided that they have been working in that Member State for at least the preceding twelve months and have resided there continuously for more than three years.	provision (legal fet. & art.)	Member State) 1. In deroga all'articolo 14 ha diritto di soggiorno permanente nello Stato prima della maturazione di un periodo continuativo di cinque anni di soggiorno: a) il lavoratore subordinato o autonomo il quale, nel momento in cui cessa l'attività, ha raggiunto l'età prevista ai fini dell'acquisizione del diritto alla pensione di vecchiaia, o il lavoratore subordinato che cessa di svolgere un'attività subordinata a seguito di pensionamento anticipato, a condizione che abbia svolto nel territorio dello Stato la propria attività almeno negli ultimi dodici mesi e vi abbia soggiornato in via continuativa	provision 1. By way of derogation from Article 16, the right of permanent residence in the State shall be enjoyed before completion of a continuous period of five years of residence by: a) workers or self-employed persons who, at the time they stop working, have reached the age for entitlement to an old age pension or workers who cease paid employment to take early retirement, provided that they have been working in the territory of the State for at least the preceding twelve months and have resided there continuously for more than three years.	(y/n)	of the Directive.
	If the law of the host Member State does not grant the right to an old age pension to certain categories of self-employed persons, the age condition shall be deemed to have been met once the person concerned has reached the age of 60;	Art. 15.1 a) D.Lgs n. 30/07	per oltre tre anni. Ove il lavoratore appartenga ad una categoria per la quale la legge non riconosce il diritto alla pensione di vecchiaia, la condizione relativa all'età e' considerata soddisfatta quando l'interessato ha raggiunto l'età di 60 anni;	If the worker belongs to a certain category for which the law does not grant the right to an old age pension to certain categories of self-employed persons, the age condition shall be deemed to have been met once the person concerned has reached the age of 60;	Y	Effective transposition The provision has a slight different structure but is transposed, although the Italian provision more generally refers to "worker" and not to "certain categories of self-employed" as the Directive does. In this sense the transposing provision is wider than the Directive.
Art.17.1 (b)	(b) workers or self-employed persons who have resided continuously in the host Member State for more than two years and stop working there as a result of permanent incapacity to work. If such incapacity is the result of an accident at work or an occupational disease entitling the person concerned to a benefit payable in full or in part by an	Art. 15.1 b) D.Lgs n. 30/07	b) il lavoratore subordinato o autonomo che ha soggiornato in modo continuativo nello Stato per oltre due anni e cessa di esercitare l'attività professionale a causa di una sopravvenuta incapacità lavorativa permanente. Ove tale incapacità sia stata causata da un infortunio sul lavoro	b) workers or self-employed persons who have resided continuously in the State for more than two years and stop working there as a result of permanent incapacity to work. If such incapacity is the result of an accident at work or an occupational disease entitling the	Y	Literal transposition

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of Member State)	national provision	accord? (y/n)	
	institution in the host Member State, no condition shall be imposed as to length of residence;		o da una malattia professionale che dà all'interessato diritto ad una prestazione interamente o parzialmente a carico di un'istituzione dello Stato, non si applica alcuna condizione relativa alla durata del soggiorno;	person concerned to a benefit payable in full or in part by an institution of the State, no condition shall be imposed as to length of residence;	<u> </u>	
Art.17.1 (c)	(c) workers or self-employed persons who, after three years of continuous employment and residence in the host Member State, work in an employed or self-employed capacity in another Member State, while retaining their place of residence in the host Member State, to which they return, as a rule, each day or at least once a week.	Art. 15.1 c) D.Lgs n. 30/07	c) il lavoratore subordinato o autonomo che, dopo tre anni d'attività e di soggiorno continuativi nello Stato, eserciti un'attività subordinata o autonoma in un altro Stato membro, pur continuando a risiedere nel territorio dello Stato, permanendo le condizioni previste per l'iscrizione anagrafica.	c) workers or self-employed persons who, after three years of continuous employment and residence in the State, work in an employed or self-employed capacity in another Member State, while retaining their place of residence in the State, while the conditions for the registration still exist.	N, Ambiguo us	Ambiguous transposition The transposing provision refers to the "State", <i>i.e</i> , Italy, which is understood as the "host Member State" referred to in the Directive. The last part of the provision is not transposed as such and the Italian provision refers to "conditions for the registration still exist". These conditions are the ones referred to in Article 9 of D.Lgs 30/07 that are
		Art. 3 Presidential Decree n. 223/89	[*Presidential Decree n. 223/89, Articolo 3 - Popolazione residente. 1. Per persone residenti nel comune s'intendono quelle aventi la propria dimora abituale nel comune. 2. Non cessano di appartenere alla popolazione residente le persone temporaneamente dimoranti in altri comuni o all'estero per l'esercizio di occupazioni stagionali o per causa di durata limitata.]	[*Presidential Decree n. 223/89, Article 3 - Resident population. 1. Residents in the municipality are those who have their habitual residence in the municipality. 2. Persons temporarily residents in other municipalities or abroad for the exercise of seasonal jobs or because of a reason of limited duration, do not cease to belong to the residing population.]		different as compared to the requirements set in the Directive. However, the Italian provision appears to be lesser restrictive since the Union citizen is not required to go back in the State each day or at least once a week (the conditions referred for the registration have still to be fulfilled). According to Presidential Decree n. 223/89, the persons who temporarily reside (dimorano) in a foreign country or in other national Municipalities (Comuni) for carrying out seasonal work or of a limited duration, do not loose the status of resident population. * It is difficult to give a definitive answer: on the one hand Italy seems to request something more than the

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of	Translation into English of national	Fully in accord?	Comments/Problems
			Member State)	provision	(y/n)	Directive since it refers to "conditions for the registration still exist." (Art. 9.3 of the Decree). On the other hand, Italy allows that the conditions for anagrafic (population) residence (residence registry) remain although the person concerned does not return, each day or at least once a week.
	For the purposes of entitlement to the rights referred to in points (a) and (b), periods of employment spent in the Member State in which the person concerned is working shall be regarded as having been spent in the host Member State.	Art. 15.2 D.Lgs n. 30/07	2. Ai fini dell'acquisizione dei diritti previsti nel comma 1, lettere <i>a</i>) e <i>b</i>), i periodi di occupazione trascorsi dall'interessato nello Stato membro in cui esercita un'attività sono considerati periodi trascorsi nel territorio nazionale.	2. For the purposes of entitlement to the rights referred to in points a) and b), periods of employment spent in the Member State in which the person concerned is working shall be regarded as having been spent in the national territory.	Y	Almost literally transposed The transposing provision refers to the "national territory", i.e., Italy, which is understood as the "host Member State" referred to in the Directive.
	Periods of involuntary unemployment duly recorded by the relevant employment office, periods not worked for reasons not of the person's own making and absences from work or cessation of work due to illness or accident shall be regarded as periods of employment.	Art. 15.3 D.Lgs n. 30/07	3. I periodi di iscrizione alle liste di mobilità o di disoccupazione involontaria, così come definiti dal decreto legislativo 19 dicembre 2002, n. 297, o i periodi di sospensione dell'attività indipendenti dalla volontà dell'interessato e l'assenza dal lavoro o la cessazione dell'attività per motivi di malattia o infortunio sono considerati periodi di occupazione ai fini dell'applicazione delle disposizioni di cui al comma 1.	3. Periods of registration in the lists of mobility or involuntary unemployment, as defined by Legislative Decree of 19 December 2002, n. 297, or periods not worked for reasons not of the person's own making and absences from work or cessation of work due to illness or accident shall be regarded as periods of employment for the application of the provisions of paragraph 1.	Y	Periods of unemployment are duly recorded by registration in the lists of mobility or involuntary unemployment, as defined by Legislative Decree of 19 December 2002, n. 297.
		Art. 1.2 c) Legislative Decree of 19 December 2002, n. 297 and Art. 3 & 5	[Legislative Decree of 19 December 2002, n. 297 Art. 1.2 c) [] c) "stato di disoccupazione , la condizione del soggetto privo di lavoro, che sia immediatamente disponibile allo svolgimento ed	December 2002, n. 297 Art. 1.2 c) [] c) " state of unemployment, the condition of the subject who is without work, who is		

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

A set	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Commonanding national	Complete text of notional	Translation into English of	Euller in	Comments/Problems
Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of	Translation into English of national	Fully in accord?	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
			alla ricerca di una attivita'	and who is looking for a job	(y /II)	
			lavorativa secondo modalita'	according to modalities defined		
			definite con i servizi competenti;	with the competent services;		
			Art. 3	with the competent services,		
			1. All'articolo 2 del decreto	Art. 3		
			legislativo 21 aprile 2000, n. 181,	1. The following changes are		
			sono apportate le seguenti	made to Article 2 of Legislative		
			modificazioni:	Decree on April 21, 2000, n.		
			a) i commi 1, 3 e 4 sono sostituiti	181,:		
			dai seguenti:	a) paragraphs 1, 3 and 4 are		
			"1. La condizione di cui	replaced by the following:		
			all'articolo 1, comma 2, lettera <i>c</i>),	"1. The condition referred to in		
			dev'essere comprovata dalla	Article 1, paragraph 2, letter c)		
			presentazione dell'interessato	[on the state unemployment]		
			presso il servizio competente nel	must be proven by appearance of		
			cui ambito territoriale si trovi il	the interested person to the		
			domicilio del medesimo,	competent department in whose		
			accompagnata da una	territory the said person has		
			dichiarazione, ai sensi del decreto	his/her domicile; it is also		
			del Presidente della Repubblica	required a declaration,		
			28 dicembre 2000, n. 445, che	according to Presidential		
			attesti l'eventuale attivita'	Decree 28 December 2000 n.		
			lavorativa precedentemente	445, certifying any work		
			svolta, nonche' l'immediata	previously performed and the		
			disponibilita' allo svolgimento di	immediate availability for the		
			attivita' lavorativa.	performance of work.		
			4. La verifica dell'effettiva	4. The verification of the stay of		
			permanenza nello stato di	the state of unemployment is		
			disoccupazione e' effettuata dai	carried out by the competent		
			servizi competenti con le seguenti modalita':	services with the following rules		
			a) sulla base delle comunicazioni	a) on the basis of the		
			di cui all'articolo 4- <i>bis</i> o di altre	communications referred to in		
			informazioni fornite dagli organi	Article 4-bis or other		
			di vigilanza;	information supplied by		
			b) in relazione al rispetto delle	supervision organs ;		
			misure concordate con il	b) according to the modalities		
			disoccupato.";	agreed with the unemployed		
			b) al comma 5, le parole: "20	person.";		
			ottobre 1998, n. 403." sono	b) in paragraph 5, the words:		
			sostituite dalle seguenti: "decreto	"20 October 1998, n. 403." Are		

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord?	Comments/Problems
			del Presidente della Repubblica 28 dicembre 2000, n. 445."; c) al comma 6, la parola: "inferiori" e' sostituita dalla seguente: "fino"; d) il comma 7 e' soppresso. 2. Gli interessati all'accertamento della condizione di cui all'articolo 1, comma 2, lettera c), sono tenuti a presentarsi presso il servizio competente per territorio entro centottanta giorni dalla data di entrata in vigore del presente decreto ed a rendere la dichiarazione di cui al comma 1. Restano valide le dichiarazioni di disponibilita' allo svolgimento dell'attivita' lavorativa prestate ai sensi della precedente normativa e gli obblighi che ne derivano per i servizi competenti.	replaced by the following: "decree of the President of the republic 28 December 2000, n. 445."; c) in paragraph 6, the word: "inferior" is replaced by the following': "until"; d) paragraph 7 is repealed. 2. The parties interested to ascertain the condition of Article 1, paragraph 2, letter c) are required to appear to the relevant department responsible for the area within one-hundred days from the date of entry into force of this Decree and to make the declaration referred to in paragraph 1. The declarations of availability to work that have been made under the previous legislation and the competent services' obligations remain valid.		
			Art. 5. 1. L'articolo 4 del decreto legislativo 21 aprile 2000, n. 181, e' sostituito dal seguente: "Art. 4 (<i>Perdita dello stato di disoccupazione</i>) 1. Le Regioni stabiliscono i criteri per l'adozione da parte dei servizi competenti di procedure uniformi in materia di accertamento dello stato di disoccupazione sulla base dei seguenti principi: a) conservazione dello stato di disoccupazione a seguito di svolgimento di attivita' lavorativa tale da assicurare un reddito	Art. 5. 1. Article 4 of legislative decree 21 April 2000, n. 181, is replaced by the following: principi: Art. 4 (Loss of the state of unemployment) 1. The regions determine the criteria for the adoption by the competent departments of uniform procedures for investigation of the state of unemployment based on the following principles a) conservation of the state of unemployment as a result of the carrying out work that ensures		

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
111		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	
		r (- g	Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
			annuale non superiore al reddito	an annual income not exceeding	•	
			minimo personale escluso da	the minimum personal income		
			imposizione. Tale soglia di	excluded from taxation. This		
			reddito non si applica ai soggetti	threshold of income does not		
			di cui all'articolo 8, commi 2 e 3,	apply to persons in Article 8,		
			del decreto legislativo 1 dicembre	paragraphs 2 and 3, of		
			1997, n. 468;	Legislative Decree on December		
			b) perdita dello stato di	1, 1997, n. 468;		
			disoccupazione in caso di mancata	b) loss of the state of		
			presentazione senza giustificato	unemployment when the person		
			motivo alla convocazione del	concerned does not appear		
			servizio competente nell'ambito	without a justified reason before		
			delle misure di prevenzione di cui all'articolo 3;	the competent department, in the framework of preventive		
			c) perdita dello stato di	measures set out in Article 3;		
			disoccupazione in caso di rifiuto	c) loss of the state of		
			senza giustificato motivo di una	unemployment in case of refusal		
			congrua offerta di lavoro a tempo	without a justified reason of a		
			pieno ed indeterminato o	fair job full-time and indefinite		
			determinato o di lavoro	or fixed or temporary work		
			temporaneo ai sensi della legge 24	according to Law of June 24,		
			giugno 1997, n. 196, con durata	1997, n. 196, with a duration of		
			del contratto a termine o,	term contract or, respectively, of		
			rispettivamente, della missione, in	the mission, in both cases at		
			entrambi i casi superiore almeno a	least eight months, or four		
			otto mesi, ovvero a quattro mesi	months if for young people, in		
			se si tratta di giovani, nell'ambito	the docks, distance from home		
			dei bacini, distanza dal domicilio	and transport times with the		
			e tempi di trasporto con mezzi	public means, established by the		
			pubblici, stabiliti dalle Regioni;	Regions;		
			d) sospensione dello stato di	d) Suspension of the state of		
			disoccupazione in caso di	unemployment in case of		
			accettazione di un'offerta di	acceptance of a fixed-term job		
			lavoro a tempo determinato o di	offer or temporary work for less		
			lavoro temporaneo di durata	than eight months, or four		
			inferiore a otto mesi, ovvero di	months in case of young		
			quattro mesi se si tratta di	people".]		
	O The and time to 1 of C	Art 15 4 D L 20/07	giovani.".] 4. La sussistenza delle condizioni	4 Th	Y	Almont literal trans
Art.17.2	2. The conditions as to length of residence and employment laid down in	Art. 15.4 D.Lgs n. 30/07	4. La sussistenza delle condizioni relative alla durata del soggiorno e	4. The conditions as to length of residence and employment laid	Y	Almost literal transposition
						There is no reference to the "martner"
	point (a) of paragraph 1 and the		dell'attività di cui al comma 1,	down in paragraph 1 points a)		There is no reference to the "partner"

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of Member State)	national provision	accord? (y/n)	
	condition as to length of residence laid down in point (b) of paragraph 1 shall not apply if the worker's or the self-employed person's spouse or partner as referred to in point 2(b) of Article 2 is a national of the host Member State or has lost the nationality of that Member State by marriage to that worker or self-employed person.		lettera a) e lettera b), non sono necessarie se il coniuge e' cittadino italiano, ovvero ha perso la cittadinanza italiana a seguito del matrimonio con il lavoratore dipendente o autonomo.	and b) shall not apply if the worker's or the self-employed person's spouse is an Italian national or has lost the Italian nationality by marriage to that worker or self-employed person.		since the concept of registered partnership does not currently exist in Italy. Notice that the Dir differentiates between (a): length of employment and residence; and (b) only length of residence. However, since the Italian transposing provision does not specify "length of employment and residence;" and "only length of residence." But it recalls them by referring to par 1 a) and b).
Art.17.3	3. Irrespective of nationality, the family members of a worker or a self-employed person who are residing with him in the territory of the host Member State shall have the right of permanent residence in that Member State, if the worker or self-employed person has acquired himself the right of permanent residence in that Member State on the basis of paragraph 1.	Art. 15.5 D.Lgs n. 30/07	5. I familiari, qualunque sia la loro cittadinanza, del lavoratore subordinato o autonomo, che soggiornano con quest'ultimo nel territorio dello Stato, godono del diritto di soggiorno permanente se il lavoratore stesso ha acquisito il diritto di soggiorno permanente in forza del comma 1	5. Irrespective of nationality, the family members of a worker or a self-employed person who are residing with him in the territory of the State shall have the right of permanent residence if the worker or self-employed person has acquired himself the right of permanent residence in that Member State on the basis of paragraph 1.	Y	Literal transposition
Art.17.4 (a)	4. If, however, the worker or self-employed person dies while still working but before acquiring permanent residence status in the host Member State on the basis of paragraph 1, his family members who are residing with him in the host Member State shall acquire the right of permanent residence there, on condition that: (a) the worker or self-employed person had, at the time of death, resided continuously on the territory of that Member State for two years; or	Art. 15.6 a) D.Lgs n. 30/07	6. Se il lavoratore subordinato o autonomo decede mentre era in attività senza aver ancora acquisito il diritto di soggiorno permanente a norma del comma 1, i familiari che hanno soggiornato con il lavoratore nel territorio acquisiscono il diritto di soggiorno permanente, qualora si verifica una delle seguenti condizioni: a) il lavoratore subordinato o autonomo, alla data del suo decesso, abbia soggiornato in via continuativa nel territorio nazionale per due anni;	6. If the worker or self-employed person dies while still working but before acquiring permanent residence status on the basis of paragraph 1, his family members who are residing with him in the territory shall acquire the right of permanent residence there, on condition that: a) the worker or self-employed person had, at the time of death, resided continuously on the national territory for two years; or	Y	Literal transposition The Italian provision does not insert ";" in the end of the paragraph; this does not represent a problem since the text of the provision clearly states that "or one of the following conditions exist", that means the different subparagraphs are alternative, in line with the Directive (the same comment applies for Article Art. 17.4 b)).
Art.17.4 (b)	(b) the death resulted from an accident at work or an occupational disease; or	Art. 15.6 b) D.Lgs n. 30/07	b) il decesso sia avvenuto in seguito ad un infortunio sul lavoro	b) the death resulted from an accident at work or an	Y	Literal transposition

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State) o ad una malattia professionale;	Translation into English of national provision occupational disease;	Fully in accord?	Comments/Problems
Art.17.4 (c)	(c) the surviving spouse lost the nationality of that Member State following marriage to the worker or self-employed person.	Art. 15.6 c) D.Lgs n. 30/07	c) il coniuge superstite abbia perso la cittadinanza italiana a seguito del matrimonio con il lavoratore dipendente o autonomo.	c) the surviving spouse lost the Italian nationality following marriage to the worker or self-employed person.	Y	Literal transposition
Art.18	Acquisition of the right of permanent residence by certain family members who are not nationals of a Member State. Without prejudice to Article 17, the family members of a Union citizen to whom Articles 12(2) and 13(2) apply, who satisfy the conditions laid down therein, shall acquire the right of permanent residence after residing legally for a period of five consecutive years in the host Member State. RIGHT OF PERMANENT	Art. 15.7 D.Lgs n. 30/07	7. Se non rientrano nelle condizioni previste dal presente articolo, i familiari del cittadino dell'Unione di cui all'articolo 11, comma 2, e all'articolo 12, comma 2, che soddisfano le condizioni ivi previste, acquisiscono il diritto di soggiorno permanente dopo aver soggiornato legalmente e in via continuativa per cinque anni nello Stato membro ospitante.	7. If the conditions laid down in this Article are not satisfied, family members of a Union citizen referred to in Articles 11.2 and 12.2, who satisfy the conditions laid down therein shall acquire the right of permanent residence after residing legally for a period of five consecutive years in the host Member State.	Y	Literal transposition Articles 11.2 and 12.2 correspond to Articles 12(2) and 13(2) of the Directive.
Chapter IV Art.19.1	RIGHT OF PERMANENT RESIDENCE Section I. Administrative formalities Document certifying permanent residence for Union citizens 1. Upon application Member States shall issue Union citizens entitled to permanent residence, after having verified duration of residence, with a document certifying permanent residence.	Art. 16.1 and 16.2 D.Lgs n. 30/07 In this regard also Circular of the Ministry of Interior n. 19 of 6 April 2007	Art. 16 (Attestazione di soggiorno permanente per i cittadini dell'Unione europea) 1. A richiesta dell'interessato, il comune di residenza rilascia al cittadino di uno Stato membro dell'Unione europea un attestato che certifichi la sua condizione di titolare del diritto di soggiorno permanente. [] [] la richiesta corredata dalla documentazione atta a provare le condizioni, rispettivamente previsti dall'articolo 14 e dall'articolo 15.	presented together with the documents that prove	Y	Effective transposition The verification of the duration of residence is left quite general by the Directive that does not explain how the Member State shall verify this. The Italian provision more specifically recalls Articles 14 and 15 of the same Decree that transpose respectively Article 16 and 17 of the Directive.

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord? (y/n)	Comments/Problems
			2. L'attestato di cui al comma 1 può essere sostituito da una istruzione contenuta nel microchip della carta di identità elettronica di cui al decreto legislativo 7 marzo 2005, n. 82, secondo le regole tecniche stabilite dal Ministero dell'interno.	2. The document referred to in paragraph 1 may be replaced by an instruction contained in the microchip of the electronic identity card referred to in Legislative Decree of 7 March 2005, n. 82, according the technical rules set out by the Ministry of Interior .		This provision only specifies how the entitlement to permanent residence can be certified, so it does not affect the correct transposition of the Directive's provision. Circular n. 19 specifies that the requirement of "continuity" might be proved by the registration of the concerned person
Art.19.2	2. The document certifying permanent residence shall be issued as soon as possible.		[] L'attestato e' rilasciato entro trenta giorni dalla richiesta	[] The document [certifying permanent residence] shall be issued within 30 days from the application []	Y	Effective transposition Effective transposition, although the Italian provision specifies that the document certifying permanent residence shall be accompanied with documents proving the conditions laid down in Articles 14 and 15. 30 days seem soon enough.
Art.20.1	Permanent residence card for family members who are not nationals of a Member State 1. Member States shall issue family members who are not nationals of a Member State entitled to permanent residence with a permanent residence card within six months of the submission of the application. The permanent residence card shall be renewable automatically every 10 years.	Art. 17.1 and 17.2 D.Lgs n. 30/07	Art. 17 (Carta di soggiorno permanente per i familiari non aventi la cittadinanza di uno Stato membro) 1. Ai familiari del cittadino comunitario non aventi la cittadinanza di uno Stato membro dell'Unione europea, che abbiano maturato il diritto di soggiorno permanente, la Questura rilascia una «Carta di soggiorno permanente per familiari di cittadini europei».	Art. 17 (Permanent residence card for family members who are not nationals of a Member State) 1. The Police (<i>Questura</i>) shall issue family members who are not nationals of a Member State entitled to permanent residence with a "permanent residence card for family members of Union citizens".	N, Incomplet e	Incomplete transposition The first part of the provision is correctly transposed. In Italy the <i>Questura</i> issues the permanent residence card. The second part of the provision: It refers to within 90 days instead of within six months of the submission of the application. Therefore more favourable.
			2. La richiesta di Carta di soggiorno permanente e' presentata alla Questura competente per territorio di residenza [] ed e' rilasciata entro 90 giorni, su modello conforme a quello stabilito con decreto del Ministro dell'interno.	2. The application for the Permanent residence card is submitted to the Police territorially competent [] and is issued within 90 days in a model complying with the one established by Ministry of Interior' decree.		But it is incompletely transposed since it does not mention that permanent residence card shall be renewable automatically every 10 years. This represents a gap.

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
1110	Clause of the Miles of the Directive	provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of Member State)	national provision	accord? (y/n)	Comments 1 Tolorans
Art.20.2	2. The application for a permanent residence card shall be submitted before the residence card expires. Failure to comply with the requirement to apply for a permanent residence card may render the person concerned liable to proportionate and non-discriminatory sanctions.	Art. 17.2 D.Lgs n. 30/07	2. La richiesta di Carta di soggiorno permanente e' presentata alla Questura competente per territorio di residenza prima dello scadere del periodo di validità della Carta di soggiorno di cui all'articolo 10 [].	2. The application for the Permanent residence card is submitted to the Police territorially competent, before the residence card expires as referred to in Article 10 [].	Y, More favourabl e	More favourable transposition More favourable since the Italian provision does not establish sanctions for failure to comply with the requirement to apply for a permanent residence card.
Art.20.3	3. Interruption in residence not exceeding two consecutive years shall not affect the validity of the permanent residence card.	Art. 17.4 D.Lgs n. 30/07	4. Le interruzioni di soggiorno che non superino, ogni volta, i due anni consecutivi, non incidono sulla validità della carta di soggiorno permanente.	4. Interruption in residence not exceeding two consecutive years shall not affect the validity of the permanent residence card.	Y	Literal transposition However it shall be noted that the Italian official version of the Directive does not refer to "consecutive years" as the English version does.
Art. 21	For the purposes of this Directive, continuity of residence may be attested by any means of proof in use in the host Member State. Continuity of residence is broken by any expulsion decision duly enforced against the person concerned.	Art. 18.1 and 18.2 D.Lgs n. 30/07 as amended by Art. 1.1 b) D.Lgs n. 32/08 In this regard also Circular of the Ministry of Interior n. 19 of 6 April 2007	Art. 18 (Continuità del soggiorno) 1. La continuità del soggiorno, ai fini del presente decreto legislativo, nonché i requisiti prescritti dagli articoli 13, 14, 15 e 16 possono essere comprovati con le modalità previste dalla legislazione vigente. 2. La continuità del soggiorno e' interrotta dal provvedimento di allontanamento adottato nei confronti della persona interessata «, che costituisce causa di cancellazione anagrafica»;	Art. 18 (Continuity of residence) 1. For the purposes of this decree, continuity of residence and the requirements set out by Articles 13, 14, 15 and 16 may be attested by the modalities set out by the legislation in force. 2. Continuity of residence is broken by any expulsion decision, taken against the person concerned, and that represents a ground of cancellation from the personal details registry.	N, Incorrect	Incorrect transposition The Italian transposing Decree says that not only the continuity of residence but also the requirements set out in Articles 13, 14, 15 and 16 [of the Decree], may be attested by any means of proof. Articles 14, 15 and 16 refer to the "continuity", while Article 13 concerns the retention of the right of residence. It can be affirmed that in order to proof the "continuity" the same requirements mentioned in the Directive may be used. Therefore in this regard no conformity issue arise. The Italian provision refers to "expulsion decision taken []" and not to "expulsion decision duly enforced" as the Directive does. In Italian term used "adottato": "taken "in English) does not

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of national	Fully in	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of Member State)	national provision	accord? (y/n)	
			Niember State)	provision	(y/h)	necessarily differ from the term used in the Directive. It can be a matter of interpretation. The verb "adottato" in itself might be interpreted as "enforced-eseguito". However, in this context the translation and/or the text of the Italian provision should have been more precise. Circular n. 19 specifies that the requirement of "continuity" might be proved by the registration of the concerned person. About the requirement of "legally resided" the Circular adds that the person concerned, during the five years of residence shall have resided in the Italian territory under the conditions laid down in the Italian Decree and without having being expelled, which is not in line with the Directive: the Dir means residing according to the Dir. It can also be that they reside legally under other
Chapter	PROVISIONS COMMON TO THE	Art. 19.1 D.Lgs n. 30/07	Art. 19 (Disposizioni comuni al	Art. 19 (Provisions common to		legislation.
Chapter V	RIGHT OF RESIDENCE AND THE RIGHT OF PERMANENT RESIDENCE	In this regard also Circular of the Ministry of Interior of 6 April 2007	diritto di soggiorno e al diritto di soggiorno permanente)	the right of residence and the right of permanent residence)		
Art. 22	Territorial scope				Y	Effective transposition
	The right of residence and the right of permanent residence shall cover the whole territory of the host Member State.					There is no such a specific provision. However the provision can be considered as transposed since the Directive cannot be applied to only a part of the Italian territory.

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord? (y/n)	Comments/Problems
						Moreover, throughout the text, it is always referred to the national territory, that is, the whole Italian territory.
	Member States may impose territorial restrictions on the right of residence and the right of permanent residence only where the same restrictions apply to their own nationals.	Art. 19.2 D.Lgs n. 30/07	2. Fatte salve le disposizioni specifiche espressamente previste dal Trattato CE e dal diritto derivato, ogni cittadino dell'Unione che risiede, in base al presente decreto, nel territorio nazionale gode di pari trattamento rispetto ai cittadini italiani nel campo di applicazione del Trattato. Il beneficio di tale diritto si estende ai familiari non aventi la cittadinanza di uno Stato membro che siano titolari del diritto di soggiorno o del diritto di soggiorno permanente.	2. Subject to such specific provisions as are expressly provided for in the Treaty and secondary law, all Union citizens residing on the basis of this decree in the national territory shall enjoy equal treatment with the Italian nationals within the scope of the Treaty. The benefit of this right shall be extended to family members who are not nationals of a Member State and who have the right of residence or permanent residence.	NT	Although there is no express transposing provision in this regard. paragraph 2 of Art. 19 says that within the scope of the Treaty, every Union citizen shall enjoy equal treatment with the Italian nationals, [] (so if the re are restrictions for IT citizens, then the same restrictions apply for the EU citizen for equal treatment reason)
Art.23	Related rights Irrespective of nationality, the family members of a Union citizen who have the right of residence or the right of permanent residence in a Member State shall be entitled to take up employment or self employment there.	Art. 19.1 D.Lgs n. 30/07	1. I cittadini dell'Unione e i loro familiari hanno diritto di esercitare qualsiasi attività economica autonoma o subordinata, escluse le attività che la legge, conformemente ai Trattati dell'Unione europea ed alla normativa comunitaria in vigore, riserva ai cittadini italiani.	1. Union citizens and their family members shall be entitled to take up employment or self employment, excluded those activities that the law, in accordance with the European Union Treaty and the European legislation, reserve to Italian citizens.	N, Ambiguo us	Ambiguous transposition Effective transposition of the first part of the provision since although the Italian Decree is framed slightly differently it seems to apply to the same subjects. The transposing provision also refer to Union citizens; this in principle does not represent a problem since it is implicit in the original text that the Union citizens are <i>a fortiori</i> entitled to take up employment. (The problem is for third country family members that's why the provision appears to be ambiguous) The exclusion of employment reserved for Italians is done according to the EC Treaty (thus the public service exception according to Article 39(4)).

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	
			Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
Art.24.1	Equal treatment	Art. 19.2 D.Lgs n. 30/07	2. Fatte salve le disposizioni	2. Subject to such specific	Y	Effective transposition
	1. Subject to such specific provisions as		specifiche espressamente previste dal Trattato CE e dal diritto	provisions as are expressly provided for in the Treaty and		Al 1:41
	are expressly provided for in the Treaty		dar Trattato CE e dar diritto derivato, ogni cittadino	secondary law, all Union citizens		Almost literal transposition but incorrect since the Italian provision
	and secondary law, all Union citizens		dell'Unione che risiede, in base al	residing on the basis of this		says "residing on the basis of the
	residing on the basis of this Directive in	Also Circular of the Ministry of	presente decreto, nel territorio	decree in the national territory		decree". as replacement for on the
	the territory of the host Member State	Interior of 18 July 2007	nazionale gode di pari trattamento	shall enjoy equal treatment with		basis of the Directive (since the
	shall enjoy equal treatment with the		rispetto ai cittadini italiani nel	the Italian nationals within the		Decree is not properly transposed so
	nationals of that Member State within the		campo di applicazione del	scope of the Treaty. The benefit		the residing might be more
	scope of the Treaty. The benefit of this		Trattato. Il beneficio di tale diritto	of this right shall be extended to		restrictive)
	right shall be extended to family		si estende ai familiari non aventi	family members who are not		
	members who are not nationals of a		la cittadinanza di uno Stato	nationals of a Member State and		Circular 18 July specifies that the
	Member State and who have the right of		membro che siano titolari del diritto di soggiorno o del diritto di	who have the right of residence or permanent residence.		worker who is a Union citizen and his/her family members are covered
	residence or permanent residence.		soggiorno permanente.	or permanent residence.		by the national health system
			soggiorno permanente.			(Servizio Sanitario Nazionale).
						(Servicio Santiario Ivazionate).
			[]	[]		
		Art. 6.3 D.Lgs n. 30/07	3. Fatte salve le disposizioni di	3. Subject to the provisions of		Art. 6.3 of D.Lgs n. 30/07 is here
		-	leggi speciali conformi ai Trattati	special laws in accordance with		repeated in order to show that equal
			dell'Unione europea ed alla	the European Union Treaties and		treatment is established for Union
			normativa comunitaria in vigore, i	community law that is in force,		citizens who hold a right of residence
			cittadini di cui ai commi 1 e 2, nello svolgimento delle attività	citizens referred to in paragraphs 1 and 2, are subjects to the same		for up to three months.
			consentite, sono tenuti ai	duties as Italian nationals, while		
			medesimi adempimenti richiesti ai	pursuing activities which are		
			cittadini italiani.	allowed.		
Art.24.2	2. By way of derogation from paragraph	Art. 19.3 D.Lgs n. 30/07	3. In deroga al comma 2 e se non	3. By way of derogation from	N,	Incomplete transposition since the
	1, the host Member State shall not be		attribuito autonomamente in virtù	paragraph 2 and if not	Incomplet	last part of the Directive's provision
	obliged to confer entitlement to social		dell'attività esercitata o da altre	automatically given by the	e	has not been transposed.
	assistance during the first three months of residence or, where appropriate, the		disposizioni di legge, il cittadino dell'Unione ed i suoi familiari non	activity exercised or by other provisions of the law, the Union		Transposition is correct as long as the
	longer period provided for in Article		godono del diritto a prestazioni	citizen and his/her family		mentioned Italian law includes the
	14(4)(b), nor shall it be obliged, prior to		d'assistenza sociale durante i	members do not enjoy the right		status referred to in the text of the
	acquisition of the right of permanent		primi tre mesi di soggiorno o,	to social assistance during the		Directive. Recent contact with the
	residence, to grant maintenance aid for		comunque, nei casi previsti	first three months of residence		national authority has confirmed that
	studies, including vocational training,		dall'articolo 13, comma 3, lettera	or, where appropriate, the longer		"Except when such right is given
	consisting in student grants or student		b), salvo che tale diritto sia	period provided for in Article		automatically from the activity
	loans to persons other than workers, self-		automaticamente riconosciuto in	13.3 b), except when such right		exercised or by other provisions of
	employed persons, persons who retain		forza dell'attività esercitata o da	is given automatically from the		the law"refers to workers and self-
	such status and members of their		altre disposizioni di legge.	activity exercised or by		employed persons, as the Directive

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of Member State)	national	accord?	
	families.		Member State)	provision provisions of the law. (Article 13.3b of D.Lgs n. 30/07: b) the Union citizens entered the territory of the State in order to seek employment. In this case, the Union citizens and their family members may not be expelled for as long as the Union citizens can provide evidence that they are registered in the <i>Centro per l'impiego</i> for not longer than six months, or by means of a declaration have declared immediate willingness	(y/n)	does. The Italian provision should have been more precise.
				to carry out work referred to in Article 2.1 of Legislative Decree of 21 April 2000, n. 181 as repealed by Article 3 of Legislative Decree of 19 December 2002, n. 297 and not be excluded from unemployment status according to Article 4 of Legislative Decree n. 297 of 2002.)		
Art.25.1	General provisions concerning residence documents 1. Possession of a registration certificate as referred to in Article 8, of a document certifying permanent residence, of a certificate attesting submission of an application for a family member residence card, of a residence card or of a permanent residence card, may under no circumstances be made a precondition for the exercise of a right or the completion of an administrative formality, as entitlement to rights may be attested by any other means of proof.	Art. 19.4 D.Lgs n. 30/07	4. La qualità di titolare di diritto di soggiorno e di titolare di diritto di soggiorno permanente può essere attestata con qualsiasi mezzo di prova previsto dalla normativa vigente.	4. The entitlement to the right of residence and to the right of permanent residence may be attested by any other means of proof given by the law In force.	N, Incomplet e	Incomplete transposition The last part of the Directive is transposed, while the first part referring to different certificates/documents is not reproduced; this represents a gap. The provision thus, only refers to the means of proof of the right of residence but not to the exercise of a right or the completion of an administrative formality.

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of Member State)	national provision	accord? (y/n)	
Art.25.2	2. All documents mentioned in paragraph 1 shall be issued free of charge or for a charge not exceeding that imposed on nationals for the issuing of similar documents.	Art. 10.6 D.Lgs n. 30/07	6. Il rilascio della carta di soggiorno di cui al comma 1 e' gratuito, salvo il rimborso del costo degli stampati e del materiale usato per il documento.	6. The resident card referred to in paragraph 1 is issued on a free basis, except the reimbursement of the costs of the forms and of the material used for the document.	Y	Effective transposition. The transposing Decree only refers to the resident card and not to all documents mentioned in Art.25.1 of the Directive. However, through out the text, the transposing Decree refers to different documents that shall be free of charge: Articles 5.3; 10.6; 17.3.
		Art. 17.3 D.Lgs n. 30/07	3. Il rilascio dell'attestazione e' gratuito, salvo il rimborso del costo degli stampati o del materiale utilizzato.	3. The issue of the document is free of charge, except the reimbursement of the cost of the forms and of the material used.		
		Art. 5.3 D.Lgs n. 30/07	3. I visti di cui al comma 2 sono rilasciati gratuitamente e con priorità rispetto alle altre richieste.	3. Visas referred to in paragraph 2 [of Art. 5 of the Decree] are to be issued free of charge as soon as possible and on the basis of an accelerated procedure.		
		Also Circular n. 54 of 8 October 2007				The mentioned Circular has specified that the documents certifying the registration, the permanent residence and the respective applications are subject to a charge of 14,62 € The Circular also specifies that the mentioned acts/documents are subject to this charge as they are considered as act or measures of administrative organs of the State, Region, Municipality, Provinces, issued to whom request them (who makes the application).

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
1110		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	0011110110,7270011110
			Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
Art.26	Checks Member States may carry out checks on compliance with any requirement deriving from their national legislation for non-nationals always to carry their registration certificate or residence card, provided that the same requirement applies to their own nationals as regards their identity card. In the event of failure to comply with this requirement, Member States may impose the same sanctions as those imposed on their own nationals for failure to carry their identity card.	Art. 6.3 D.Lgs n. 30/07	Member State) 3. Fatte salve le disposizioni di leggi speciali conformi ai Trattati dell'Unione europea ed alla normativa comunitaria in vigore, i cittadini di cui ai commi 1 e 2, nello svolgimento delle attività consentite, sono tenuti ai medesimi adempimenti richiesti ai cittadini italiani.	provision 3. Subject to the provisions of special laws in accordance with the European Union Treaties and community law that is in force, citizens referred to in paragraphs 1 and 2, are subjects to the same duties as Italian nationals, while pursuing activities which are allowed.	<u>(y/n)</u> Y	Effective transposition As stated in the ToC sent to the Commission by the Ministry of Interior Affairs, in Italy, there is no legislative provision imposing on Italian citizens what stated in this Directive's Article; Art. 4 of <i>Testo Unico</i> of the Law on Public security (approved by RD 773/1931) states that public security authorities have the power (<i>facoltà</i> : in the sense of freedom) to order dangerous and suspicious persons, and persons who are not able or refuse to proof their identity, to subject them to report them. Moreover Art. 6.3 says that even in cases of short residence (we are within the right of residence up to 3 months), EU citizens and their family members who are in Italy have to behave as Italian citizens ("are
Chapter	RESTRICTIONS ON THE RIGHT		Art. 20 (Limitazioni al diritto di	Art. 20 (Restrictions on the		subjects to the same duties as Italian nationals, while pursuing activities which are allowed."). The Italian provision more generally
VI	OF ENTRY AND THE RIGHT OF RESIDENCE ON GROUNDS OF PUBLIC POLICY, PUBLIC SECURITY OR PUBLIC HEALTH		ingresso e di soggiorno)	right of entry and the right of residence)		refers to "restrictions on the right of entry and the right of residence" without mentioning, in its title, to the grounds specified in the Directive. Overall this Article is not correctly
						transposed. The structure itself of the provision and the cross reference to many other legislation create confusion and ambiguity throughout the text of the Decree.
Art.27.1	General principles	Art. 20 D.Lgs n. 30/07 as	`	Art. 20 (Restrictions on the	N,	Incorrect transposition
	1. Subject to the provisions of this	replaced by Art. 1.1 c) D.Lgs n.	ingresso e di soggiorno)	right of entry and the right of	Incorrect	

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
AII	Citation of the Afficie of the Directive	provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	Comments/F1oblems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
	Chapter, Member States may restrict the	32/08	1. Salvo quanto previsto	residence)	(3/11)	COMMENT on transposition of
	freedom of movement and residence of	32/00	dall'articolo 21, il diritto di	1. Except what provided for in		Art. 27.1 of the Directive
	Union citizens and their family members,	Art. 20.1 D.Lgs n. 30/07	ingresso e soggiorno dei cittadini	Article 21, the right of entry and		In general, the reference made by the
	irrespective of nationality, on grounds of	1110 2011 212gs in 20707	dell'Unione o dei loro familiari,	the right of residence of Union		Italian transposing provision, to a
	public policy, public security or public		qualsiasi sia la loro cittadinanza,	citizens and their family		number of other Laws, decrees,
	health.		puo' essere limitato con apposito	members, irrespective of		codes, articles, etc, makes it difficult
			provvedimento solo per: motivi di	nationality, may be restricted by		to comprehensibly understand for
			sicurezza dello Stato; motivi	suitable measure only on		which crimes exactly an EU national
			imperativi di pubblica sicurezza;	grounds of State security;		may be expelled.
			altri motivi di ordine pubblico o di	imperative public security; other		, ,
			pubblica sicurezza.	public order (public policy) or		Several behaviours might fit in the
			•	public security grounds.		definitions and situations that are
						described and referred to by the
		Art. 20.2 D.Lgs n. 30/07	2. I motivi di sicurezza dello	2. State security grounds are		Italian transposing provision.
		- Art. 18 Law n. 152/75	Stato sussistono anche quando la	also when the person who has to		
			persona da allontanare appartiene	be expelled belongs to one of the		Below there is an analysis of the
		- Art. 18 Law n. 152/75	ad una delle categorie di cui	categories referred to in Article		grounds that may be considered as
		then refers to:	all'articolo 18 della legge 22	18 of Law 22 May 1975, n. 152,		public policy and public security (for
		- Law 1965, n.575 on provisions	maggio 1975, n. 152, ovvero vi	or when there are sounds		public health see Article 29). These
		against Mafia	sono fondati motivi di ritenere che	grounds to believe that his/her		laws apply to both EU citizens and
		- part I, title VI of book II of the	la sua permanenza nel territorio	permanence in the territory of		Nationals but different punitive
		criminal code	dello Stato possa in qualsiasi	the State may in anyway		measures apply to EU citizens
		- Articles 284,285,286,306,438,	modo agevolare organizzazioni o	facilitate terrorist organisations		(namely expulsion is the penalty
		439,605 and 630 of the criminal	attività terroristiche, anche	or activities (that might be also		applied to EU citizens). This is not in
		code	internazionali.	international ones).		itself against EU law, since the ECJ
		- Law 1952,n. 645 on provisions	TEGTI DIGILIAN AND DALLA	PROTUGIONS PEREBBER TO		has ruled in Ministere de l'Interieur
		transposing the XII temporary	TESTI RICHIAMATI DALL' Art	PROVISIONS REFERRED TO		v. Olazabal ² that EU law does not
		and final provisions (par 1) of	20.2 D.Lgs n. 30/07	BY Art. 20.2 D.Lgs n. 30/07		require that identical measures are
		the Constitution): Article 1 Law	/I 22 : 1075 152	(I 22 M 1075 152		taken against nationals and EU
		1952,n. 645	(Legge 22 maggio 1975, n. 152, disposizioni a tutela dell'ordine	(Law 22 May 1975, n. 152,		citizens. Furthermore the ECJ stated
		- Law 2 October 1967, n.895 on		provisions on the protection of		that MS may adopt "with respect to
		provisions for the control of	pubblico). Articolo 18	the public order). Article 18		nationals of other Member States, and in particular on the grounds of
		weapons - Articles 8 and following of	le disposizioni della legge 31	Provisions of Law 1965, n.575		public policy, measures which they
		Law 14 October 1974,n.497 on	maggio 1965,n.575 [riguardanti	[on provisions against Mafia]		cannot apply to their own nationals,
		new provisions against	disposizioni contro la mafia], si	will also apply to:		inasmuch as they have no authority to
		criminality	applicano anche a coloro che:	will also apply to.		expel the latter from the territory or
		Cimmunty	1) operanti in gruppi o	1) who acting within a group or		to deny them access thereto".
			isolatamente,pongano in essere	alone, does preparatory acts that		to delly them access thereto.
L	l	l	isolatamente,pongano in essere	arone, does preparatory acts that		

⁻

² See Case C-100/01 *Ministere de l'Interieur* v. *Olazabal*. In particular par. 40 Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	
			Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
			atti preparatori,obiettivamente	are objectively relevant (i.e.,		However, despite the fact the MS
			rilevanti,diretti a sovvertire	important), directed to disturb		have authority to take different
			l'ordinamento dello stato,con la			measures (including expulsion of EU
			commissione di uno dei reati	one the crimes foreseen in part I,		citizens), these have to comply with
			previsti dal capo I titolo VI ,del	title VI of book II of the criminal		the Directive in particular with the
			libro II del codice penale o dagli	code or one of the crimes		principle of proportionality. The
			articoli 284,285,286,306,438,	foreseen in articles		analysis below takes into account the
			439,605 e 630 dello stesso codice;	284,285,286,306,438, 439,605		ECJ jurisprudence and the Directive
				and 630 of the same code;		requirements to determine whether
						the grounds referred to by the Italian
			2) abbiano fatto parte di			legislation and for which an
			associazioni politiche disciolte ai	political associations that		expulsion measure may be adopted
			sensi della legge 20 giugno			are in conformity with the Directive:
			1952,n.645 ,e nei confronti dei			
			quali debba ritenersi,per il			1. State Security grounds (Public
			comportamento successivo,che	1 2		security):
			continuino a svolgere una attività	-		
			analoga a quella precedente;	Constitution) have been		The definition given by the Italian
				dissolved and it is believed that		provisions of "State security"
				for their subsequent behaviour,		grounds cannot be considered in
				they continue carrying out an		conformity with Directive. Each
				activity that is equivalent to the		situation defined as grounds of state
				previous one;		security are analysed in this section.
			2) commisses atti managatari	2) who does managetow, esta that		Art 20.2 of D.Los n. 20/07 defines
			3) compiano atti preparatori,			Art. 20.2 of D.Lgs n. 30/07, defines
			obiettivamente rilevanti, diretti alla	3 3		State security grounds by reference to
			ricostituzione del partito fascista	important), directed to the		several Italian acts, including the

³ Case C-50/06 Commission v Netherlands par, 43. In this regard also Rutili, paragraph 28; Bouchereau, paragraph 35.

Milieu Ltd ITALY 71/130

⁴ Case C-50/06 *Commission v Netherlands* par, 29 ("[...] the expulsion of such a citizen on grounds of public policy must be based on his personal conduct and **may not be justified by previous criminal convictions in themselves**), 41 ([...] "A previous criminal conviction can therefore be taken into account only in so far as the circumstances which gave rise to that conviction are evidence of personal conduct constituting a present threat to the requirements of public policy"), 44 ("According to the Court, Community law also precludes provisions of national law based on a presumption that nationals of other Member States who have received a particular sentence for specific offences must be expelled"), Case C- 493/01Orfanopoulos par 93, joint cases C- 482/01 and C- 493/01, par. 67. 5 See XII provisional and final provision of the Italian Constitution that says: "The reorganisation of the dissolved fascist party, under whatever form, is banned/prohibited".

[[]In deroga all'articolo 48, sono stabilite con legge, per non oltre un quinquennio dalla entrata in vigore della Costituzione, limitazioni temporanee al diritto di voto e alla eleggibilità per i capi responsabili del regime fascista.]

⁶ E.g., C-348/96: *Calfa* par 23"However, as the Court has repeatedly stated, the public policy exception, like all derogations from a fundamental principle of the Treaty, must be interpreted restrictively".

⁷ Case C- 100/01 *Ministere de l'Interieur v. Olazabal*. In that case, M. Olazabal, convicted of being a member of ETA (the Basque terrorist group) was prevented from staying on French territory because his presence was considered to be a menace for the public order. The court accepts this idea but curtails the rules France imposed upon Mr. Olazabal and only accepts some of them, the others being considered as encroaching too much on his fundamental right of freedom of circulation as a European citizen.

⁸ As Case C-50/06 Commission v Netherlands par 43, Commission v. Spain, par. 46, C-441/02 Commission v. Germany, par 35.

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	
			Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
			ai sensi dell'articolo 1 della citata	reconstitution of the fascist party		CPP and CP. Three situations are
			legge n.645 del 1952,in	according to Article 1 of the		considered as grounds of State
			particolare con l'esaltazione o la	mentioned Law 1952,n. 645, in		Security:
			pratica della violenza;	particular using exaltation or		
				violence;		1.1 Article 18 of Law 152/1975
						which is the law against Mafia. This
			4) fuori dei casi indicati nei	4) the persons who, excluded the		provision further refers to several
			numeri precedenti,siano stati	cases referred to in the previous		crimes of the Criminal Code. The
			condannati per uno dei delitti	numbers, have been convicted		crimes referred by Art. 18 Law
			previsti nella legge 2 ottobre	for one of the crimes foreseen in		152/75 are the following which can
			1967,n.895 ,e negli articoli 8 e	the Law 2 October 1967, n.895		be grouped in 3 situation:
			seguenti della legge 14 ottobre	and in articles 8 and following of		
			1974,n.497 ,e successive modificazioni,quando debba	the Law 14 October 1974, n. 497 and further amendments, and it		a) preparatory acts (in group or alone) that are objectively relevant,
			ritenersi,per il loro	is believed that, for their		aiming at subverting State order, by
			comportamento successivo,che	subsequent behaviour, they are		committing the following crimes of
			siano proclivi a commettere un	inclined to commit a crime of		the CP:
			reato della stessa specie col fine	the same kind with the aim		Article 422 - Slaughter
			indicato nel precedente n.1).	indicated in the previous n.1.		Article 423 – Fire
			le disposizioni di cui al	The provisos of the previous par		Art. 423 bis Forest fire
			precedente comma si applicano	shall also apply to instigators, to		Article 424 – Damage followed by
			altresì agli istigatori,ai mandanti e	principals and sponsors		fire
			ai finanziatori.	(financing!)		Article 425 – Aggravating
			è finanziatore colui il quale	Sponsor is who gives an amount		circumstances
			fornisce somme di denaro o altri	of money or other goods		Article 426 – Floods, landslides and
			beni,conoscendo lo scopo a cui	knowing the purpose to which		avalanches
			sono destinati.	there are destined.		Article 427 – Damage followed by
						flood, landslide or avalanche
						Article 428 - Shipwreck, sinking or
			TESTI RICHIAMATI DALL' Art	PROVISIONS REFERRED TO		aviation disaster
			18 Legge 152/75	BY Art. 18 Law n. /75		Article 429 – Damage followed by
						shipwreck
			- Legge 1965, n.575	- Law 1965, n.575		Article 430 – Railway disaster
			- capo I titolo VI ,del libro II del	- Chapter I Heading VI of		Art. 431 – Danger of railway disaster
			codice penale: Articoli 422 fino a 437:	Book II of the Criminal Code: Article 422 to 437:		caused by damage
			437: Art. 422 - Strage			Article 432 – Attacks on the safety of transportation systems
			Chiunque, fuori dei casi preveduti	Article 422 - Slaughter Anyone who, except in the cases		Article 433 – Attacks on the safety
			dall'articolo 285, al fine di	specified in Article 285, with		of electricity, gas and public
			uccidere, compie atti	the intention to kill, performs		communications installations
			tali da porre in pericolo la	acts which endanger public		Article 434 – Collapse of
<u> </u>			tan da pone in pencolo la	acts which changes public	J	Article 454 - Collapse of

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
1110		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	
		F (g	Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
			pubblica incolumità è punito, se	safety, shall be punished, if the		constructions or other malicious
			dal fatto deriva la morte	act leads to the death of more		disasters
			di più persone, con [la morte].	than one person, to [death].		Article 435 – Manufacture or
			Se è cagionata la morte di una	If this results in the death of one		ownership of explosives
			sola persona si applica l'ergastolo.	person, the punishment shall be		Article 436 – Removal, concealment
			In ogni altro caso	life imprisonment. In all other		or damage to public safety equipment
			si applica la reclusione non	cases, imprisonment shall be for		Article 437 – Malicious removal or
			inferiore a quindici anni.	no less than fifteen years.		omission of protection against injury
			Art. 423 - Incendio	Article 423 - Fire		in the workplace
			Chiunque cagiona un incendio è	Anyone who causes a fire shall		Crimes against the State
			punito con la reclusione da tre a	be punished from three to seven		Article 284 CP. Armed insurrection
			sette anni.	years of imprisonment. The		against the powers of the State.
			La disposizione precedente si	above provision shall also apply		Article 285 CP. Devastation,
			applica anche nel caso d'incendio	if the person causes a fire on his		pillaging and slaughter.
			della cosa propria, se dal fatto deriva pericolo per la	own property, if the fire constitutes a danger to public		Article 286 CP. Civil war.
			incolumità pubblica.	safety.		Article 306. Armed gangs: formation and participation.
			Art. 423-bis. Incendio boschivo.	Art. 423 bis Forest fire		Crimes against public safety
			Chiunque cagioni un incendio su	Anyone who causes a fire on		Article 438. Epidemic.
			boschi, selve o foreste ovvero su	forests, woods or forests or at the		Article 439. Poisoning water or
			vivai forestali destinati al	forest nurseries destined to		foodstuffs.
			rimboschimento, propri o altrui, è	reforestation, [own or others] is		Crimes against the person
			punito con la reclusione da quattro	punished with imprisonment		Article 605. Kidnapping
			a dieci anni.	from four to ten years.		Crimes against property
			Se l'incendio di cui al primo	If the fire referred to in the first		Article 630. Kidnapping for
			comma è cagionato per colpa, la	par is caused by guilt (colpa),		purposes of robbery or extortion
			pena è della reclusione da uno a	the sanction is imprisonment		(as per Article 18 of Law 22 May
			cinque anni.	from one to five years.		1975, n. 152)
			Le pene previste dal primo e dal	The penalties provided by the		
			secondo comma sono aumentate	first and second paragraph are		b) having being member of a
			se dall'incendio deriva pericolo	increased if from fire derives		dissolved fascist organisation, he
			per edifici o danno su aree	danger to buildings or damage		continues carrying out an activity that
			protette.	on protected areas.		may be considered equivalent to
			Le pene previste dal primo e dal	The penalties provided by the		those carried out by the dissolved
			secondo comma sono aumentate	first and second paragraph of		organisation (fascist meaning having
			della metà, se dall'incendio deriva	increased met if from fire		antidemocratic objectives);
			un danno grave, esteso e	derives serious harm, extensive		
			persistente all'ambiente.	and persistent environment.		c) carrying out preparatory acts aiming at the reconstitution of a
			Art. 424 - Danneggiamento	Article 424 – Damage followed by fire		fascist party (with antidemocratic
			88			
L			seguito da incendio	Anyone who, with the sole		objectives). In particular using

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	
			Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
			Chiunque, al solo scopo di	intention of damaging others'		exaltation or violence; The following
			danneggiare la cosa altrui, appicca	property, starts a fire on his or		activities are considered as
			il fuoco a una cosa	her own or another's property		reconstitution of a fascist party:
			propria o altrui è punito, se del	shall be punished from six		an attempt by an association,
			fatto sorge pericolo di un	months to two years'		movement or group of no less than
			incendio, con la	imprisonment if the act results in		five people to pursue the anti-
			reclusione da sei mesi a due anni.	a fire hazard.		democratic ends of the fascist party,
			Se segue l'incendio, si applicano	If a fire is caused, the provisions		praising, threatening or using
			le disposizioni dell'articolo	of the previous Article shall		violence as a method of political
			precedente, ma la pena	apply, but reduced by one third		struggle, promoting suppression of
			è ridotta da un terzo alla metà.	to one half.		the freedoms guaranteed by the
			Se al fuoco appiccato a boschi,	Article 424 – Damage followed		Constitution or denigrating
			selve e foreste, ovvero vivai	by fire		democracy, its institutions and the
			forestali destinati al	Anyone who, with the sole		values of the Resistance, distributing
			rimboschimento, segue incendio, si applicano le pene previste	intention of damaging others' property, starts a fire on his or		racist propaganda, directing its activities toward praise of the
			dall'articolo 423-bis.	her own or another's property		members, principles, acts and
			dan articolo 423-bis.	shall be punished from six		methods of the fascist party or
			Art. 425 - Circostanze	months to two years'		conducting external manifestations of
			aggravanti	imprisonment if the act results in		a fascist character.
			Nei casi preveduti dai due articoli	a fire hazard.		a raseist character.
			precedenti, la pena è aumentata se	If a fire is caused, the provisions		d) somebody not covered under (a)-
			il fatto è	of the previous Article shall		(c) who has been convicted for a
			commesso:	apply, but reduced by one third		series of crimes (see below) and his
			1) su edifici pubblici o destinati a	to one half.		subsequent behaviour it is believed
			uso pubblico, su monumenti,	If the fire given to woods,		that he aims at subvert State Order.
			cimiteri e loro	woods and forests or forest		
			dipendenze;	nurseries for reforestation,		The crimes committed are those
			2) su edifici abitati o destinati a	follows fire, the sanctions under		referred to in Law n.895/1967
			uso di abitazione, su impianti	Article 423-bis apply.		reproduced in the ToC which are
			industriali o	Article 425 – Aggravating		basically crimes related to the
			cantieri, o su miniere, cave,	circumstances		detention of weapons, war weapons,
			sorgenti, o su acquedotti o altri	Under the circumstances		chemical explosive materials and
			manufatti destinati	identified in Article 423 and		related trade or elaboration etc. and in
			a raccogliere e condurre le	424, the penalty shall be		Article 8 and following of Law
			acque;	increased if the act is performed:		49/1974.
			3) su navi o altri edifici natanti, o	1) in a public building or a		This is a sum and 1 of
			su aeromobili; 4) su scali ferroviari o marittimi, o	building for public use, in a		This is a very good example of how intricate and malicious is the
			4) su scali ferroviari o marittimi, o aeroscali, magazzini generali o	monument, in a cemetery or in their appurtenances;		transposition made by Italy. Article 8
L			altri depositi di	2) in buildings that are inhabited		and <i>altera</i> of Law 49/1974 is actually

Comments/Problems
001111101109,77700000
modifying another Law, 1423/1956
(on measures against persons
dangerous to public security and
morality). Even then, Article 8 refer
to Article 9 of Law 1423/1956 which
simply states the sanctions but not the
actual crimes that have to be
committed to trigger the application
of point d) above discussed that will
lead to an expulsion measure. When
analysing Article 9, the crimes are
those listed in Article 1 of Law
1423/1956 which includes:
- crimes including offences to
physical or moral integrity of minors
and public health, safety or
tranquillity (and who is habitually
dedicated to unlawful dealings, who
habitually lives, even in part, on
income from criminal activities)
[ANALYSIS: based on
proportionality and so on]
As shown above any crimes may lead
to expulsion measure.
Points (a) to (c) discussed above
could be considered as complying
with the principle of proportionality
since it is related to a form of
organised crime (Mafia) that is one of
the main concerns in Italy and is
heavily fought against. However, as
seen above (d) includes all types of
crimes, including those that could be
considered petty criminality.
Almost anything could therefore be
considered as a crime against State
Security. Basically, the law (in
As to Po con wir sim organism critical control con Alice con Alice con Alice con Control c

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
1220		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	
		r · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
			aeromobile, di altrui proprietà, è	term shall be from three to ten		particular Law 1423/1956) refers to
			punito con la	years.		any type of illegal traffic (which may
			reclusione da cinque a dodici	Article 428 - Shipwreck,		be drugs but also waste, wild life and
			anni.	sinking or aviation disaster		any other activity that could be
			La pena è della reclusione da	Anyone guilty of causing a		considered as illegal traffic). Of
			cinque a quindici anni se il fatto è	shipwreck or the sinking of a		course this is linked to the aim of
			commesso	ship or other waterborne craft, or		subverting the State order. However,
			distruggendo, rimuovendo o	the fall of aircraft owned by		there is no definition of State order
			facendo mancare le lanterne o altri	another, shall be punished to five		and some of the behaviours listed in
			segnali, ovvero	to twelve years' imprisonment.		Law 1423/1956 imply a very broad
			adoperando falsi segnali o altri	The prison term shall be from		understanding of State order. For
			mezzi fraudolenti.	five to fifteen years if the act is		example, one of the behaviours is to
			Le disposizioni di questo articolo	committed by destroying,		live from the benefits obtained from
			si applicano anche a chi cagiona il	removing or eliminating lanterns		the commission of crimes. This could
			naufragio o la sommersione di una nave o di un	or other signals, or by using false signals or other fraudulent		easily include thieves whose main living resources come from stealing
			altro edificio natante, ovvero la	means.		(thus a crime). Similarly, the law also
			caduta di un	The provisions of this Article		includes acts against the physical and
			aeromobile, di sua proprietà, se	shall also apply to anyone guilty		moral integrity of persons. Again,
			dal fatto deriva pericolo per la	of causing a shipwreck or the		this shows that State order could be a
			incolumità pubblica.	sinking of a ship or other		simply alteration of the public social
			Art. 429 - Danneggiamento	waterborne craft, or the fall of		order in Italy. This is clearly against
			seguito da naufragio	aircraft owned by himself, if the		the ECJ case law ³ that in the Case
			Chiunque, al solo scopo di	act results in a danger to public		50/06, ruled that not a simple
			danneggiare una nave, un'edificio	safety.		"perturbation of the social order" as
			natante o un aeromobile,	Article 429 – Damage followed		the Court rules in the Case 50/06,
			ovvero un apparecchio prescritto	by shipwreck		"reliance by a national authority on
			per la sicurezza della navigazione,	Anyone who, with the sole		the concept of public policy
			lo deteriora,	intention of damaging a ship,		presupposes, in any event, the
			ovvero lo rende in tutto o in parte	other waterborne craft or		existence, in addition to the
			inservibile, è punito, se dal fatto	aircraft, or an item of equipment		perturbation of the social order which
			deriva pericolo	intended to permit safe		any infringement of the law involves,
			di naufragio, di sommersione o di	navigation, causes deterioration		of a genuine and sufficiently serious
			disastro aviatorio, con la	or makes it wholly or partly		threat to one of the fundamental
			reclusione da uno a cinque	unserviceable shall be punished		interests of society".
			anni.	to one to five years'		
			Se dal fatto deriva il naufragio, la	imprisonment if the act results in		Moreover, although the convictions
			sommersione o il disastro, la pena	danger of shipwreck, sinking or		for the crimes referred are not (from
			è della	aviation disaster.		the literal analysis of the text) a
			reclusione da tre a dieci anni.	If the shipwreck, sinking or		ground of expulsion themselves, it is
				aviation disaster occurs, the		difficult to know how in practice

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
1110	010000000000000000000000000000000000000	provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	C GALLACOLOGY I T GOLDENS
		F (ga	Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
			Art. 430 - Disastro ferroviario	prison term shall be from three	V ,	those convictions are considered
			Chiunque cagiona un disastro	to ten years.		while deciding whether to expel an
			ferroviario è punito con la	Article 430 – Railway disaster		EU national. In this regard settled
			reclusione da cinque a	Anyone guilty of causing a		case law has confirmed that previous
			quindici anni.	railway disaster shall be		criminal convictions cannot
			Art. 431 - Pericolo di disastro	punished from five to fifteen		themselves constitute a justification
			ferroviario causato da	years' imprisonment.		for expulsion on public policy
			danneggiamento	Art. 431 – Danger of railway		ground. ⁴
			Chiunque, al solo scopo di	disaster caused by damage		
			danneggiare una strada ferrata	Anyone who, with the sole		No particular issue arise concerning
			ovvero macchine, veicoli,	intention of damaging a railway		the grounds specified in point b) and
			strumenti, apparecchi o altri	or machines, vehicles,		c) such as carrying out and activity
			oggetti che servono all'esercizio di	instruments, devices or other		equivalent to that carried out by the
			essa, li distrugge	objects for the operation of the		dissolved fascist organisation and the
			in tutto o in parte, li deteriora o li	railway, destroys them entirely		reconstruction of the fascist party ⁵
			rende altrimenti in tutto o in parte	or in part, causes deterioration or		itself since it is reasonable to
			inservibili, è punito, se dal fatto	makes them wholly or partly		consider them as a state security
			deriva il pericolo di un disastro	inoperable shall be punished to		reason having antidemocratic
			ferroviario, con	two to six years' imprisonment if		objectives and the use violence.
			la reclusione da due a sei anni.	the act results in the risk of		
			Se dal fatto deriva il disastro, la	railway disaster.		
			pena è della reclusione da tre a	If the railway disaster occurs, the		1.2. Facilitate terrorist
			dieci anni.	prison term shall be from three		organisations or activities
			Per "strade ferrate" la legge	to ten years.		TI (4 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1
			penale intende, oltre le strade	For the purposes of criminal law,		The "sounds grounds" "reasonable
			ferrate ordinarie, ogni altra strada con rotaie metalliche,	the term "railway" includes not only ordinary railways but all		grounds" (<i>fondati motivi</i>) [to believe that the permanence in the territory of
			sulla quale circolino veicoli mossi	other metal tracks on which		the State may in anyway facilitate
			dal vapore,	vehicles powered by steam,		terrorist organisations or activities],
			dal vapore, dalla elettricità o da altro mezzo	electricity or other mechanical		referred by Art. 20.2 as a State
			di trazione meccanica.	means of traction travel.		security ground for expulsion implies
			Art. 432 - Attentati alla	Article 432 – Attacks on the		that not just a "suspect" is enough to
			sicurezza dei trasporti	safety of transportation		take an expulsion measure; the
			Chiunque, fuori dei casi preveduti	systems		behaviour will be assessed
			dagli articoli precedenti, pone in	Anyone who, except in the cases		restrictively, in accordance with the
			pericolo la	identified in the previous Article		scope of the Directive's provision
			sicurezza dei pubblici trasporti per	s, endangers the safety of public		and the ECJ case law. ⁶
			terra, per acqua o per aria, è	transportation by land, sea or air		
			punito con la	shall be punished to one to five		In relation to terrorist activities the
			reclusione da uno a cinque anni.	years' imprisonment.		court in the case Ministere de
			Si applica la reclusione da tre	Anyone who casts a blunt		l'Interieur v. Olazabal ⁷ accepted the

ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
1214		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	
		F	Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
			mesi a due anni a chi lancia corpi	instrument or projectile against a		fact that the person concerned who
			contundenti o	moving vehicle intended for		was a member of the ETA (terrorist
			proiettili contro veicoli in	public transportation by land, sea		organisation) was a threat to public
			movimento, destinati a pubblici	or air shall be punished to three		policy.
			trasporti per terra, per	months' to two years'		
			acqua o per aria.	imprisonment.		
			Se dal fatto deriva un disastro, la	If the act causes a disaster, the		
			pena è della reclusione da tre a	prison term shall be three to ten		1.3. The open clause
			dieci anni.	years.		On top of that the Italian Law
			Art. 433 - Attentati alla	Article 433 – Attacks on the		includes an open clause when
			sicurezza degli impianti di	safety of electricity, gas and		defining State security grounds since
			energia elettrica e del gas,	public communications installations		it says "State security grounds are ALSO []". This is very ambiguous
			ovvero delle pubbliche comunicazioni	Anyone who attacks the safety		since it is not clear which should
			Chiunque attenta alla sicurezza	of workshops, works, devices or		be/are those other grounds (apart
			delle officine, delle opere, degli	equipment for the generation or		from those commented above which
			apparecchi o di	transmission of electrical energy		are already very general and broad).
			altri mezzi destinati alla	or natural gas, for lighting or for		are arready very general and broad).
			produzione o alla trasmissione di	industries, shall be punished to		This implies that the person applying
			energia elettrica o di	one to five years' imprisonment		the legislation has an enormous
			gas, per la illuminazione o per le	if the act endangers public		flexibility to include any other crime
			industrie, è punito, qualora dal	safety.		a State Security issues. This is a
			fatto derivi	The same sentence shall apply to		crucial issue that renders
			pericolo alla pubblica incolumità,	persons who attack the safety of		transposition incorrect.
			con la reclusione da uno a cinque	public telegraph		
			anni.	communications, if the attack		
			La stessa pena si applica a chi	constitutes a danger to public		1.4. The recent reform
			attenta alla sicurezza delle	safety.		
			pubbliche comunicazioni	If the act causes a disaster, the		In addition, the recent reform adopted
			telegrafiche, qualora dal fatto	prison term shall be from three		23 May 2008 as amended by Law n.
			derivi pericolo per la pubblica	to ten years.		125/2008 has modified the Criminal
			incolumità.	Article 434 – Collapse of		code (Article 235 and 312) to include
			Se dal fatto deriva un disastro, la	constructions or other		EU citizens.
			pena è della reclusione da tre a dieci anni.	malicious disasters Anyone who, except in the cases		The two mentioned provisions are establishing an automatic expulsion
			uicci aiiii.	described in the previous Article		which is in conflict with the Directive
			Art. 434 - Crollo di costruzioni o	s, commits an act aimed at		and the ECJ ruling in <i>Calfa</i> and
			altri disastri dolosi	causing collapse of a		Commission v Netherlands).
			Chiunque, fuori dei casi preveduti	construction or part thereof or		Commission v ivemerianas).
			dagli articoli precedenti,	another disaster shall be		
			commette un fatto diretto	punished from one to five years'		Amongst the other amendments made
U			commence un ranto unento	pariished from one to five years		ranongst the other amendments made

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national	Translation into English of national	Fully in accord?	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal rel. & art.)	provision (in language of Member State)	nauonai provision	(y/n)	
			a cagionare il crollo di una	imprisonment if the act results in	V /	by the recent reform there is a
			costruzione o di una parte di essa	a danger to public safety.		paragraph added to Article 61 of the
			ovvero un altro	If the collapse or disaster occurs,		CP on aggravating circumstances. In
			disastro è punito, se dal fatto	the prison term shall be from		particular par. 11-bis that has been
			deriva pericolo per la pubblica	three to twelve years.		added creates an aggravating
			incolumità, con la	Article 435 – Manufacture or		circumstance for persons committing
			reclusione da uno a cinque anni. La pena è della reclusione da tre a	ownership of explosives Anyone who manufactures,		a crime who are illegally in the territory of Italy. This provision can
			dodici anni se il crollo o il disastro	purchases or possesses dynamite		have a significant impact on EU
			avviene.	or other explosive, asphyxiating,		citizens and their family members
			Art. 435 - Fabbricazione o	blinding, toxic or inflammable		(For a more detailed analysis of the
			detenzione di materie esplodenti	materials or substances included		non conformity problems see CS).
			Chiunque, al fine di attentare alla	in the composition thereof or		non comornity problems see es).
			pubblica incolumità, fabbrica,	which may be used to		
			acquista o detiene	manufacture them with the aim		
			dinamite o altre materie	of attacking public safety shall		The other problem with the Italian
			esplodenti, asfissianti, accecanti,	be punished from one to five		transposing provision is the lack of
			tossiche o infiammabili,	years' imprisonment.		reference to "sufficiently serious
			ovvero sostanze che servono alla	Article 436 – Removal,		threat" when referring to the personal
			composizione o alla fabbricazione	concealment or damage to		conduct of the individual concerned.
			di esse, è punito	public safety equipment		The importance of such requirement
			con la reclusione da uno a cinque	Anyone who removes, conceals		has also been confirmed by several
			anni.	or renders unusable any		ECJ case law ⁸ . This omission renders
			Art. 436 - Sottrazione,	materials, equipment or other		the transposition of the whole Article
			occultamento o guasto di	items intended for extinguishing		27 as incorrect and incomplete.
			apparecchi a pubblica difesa	fire or for protection, rescue and		-
			da infortuni	aid during a fire, flood, sinking,		
			Chiunque, in occasione di un	shipwreck or other disaster or		Another issue that is important to
			incendio, di una inondazione, di	danger to public safety or acts in		mention when assessing the incorrect
			una sommersione, di un	any way to prevent or hinder the		transposition of Article 27 of the
			naufragio, o di un altro disastro o	extinguishing of a fire or the		Directive and that will be discussed
			pubblico infortunio, sottrae,	provision of protection and		under Art. 28(3), is the definition
			occulta o rende	assistance services shall be		given by the Italian legislation to
			inservibili materiali, apparecchi o	punished from two to seven		"imperative public security grounds".
			altri mezzi destinati all'estinzione	years' imprisonment.		For instance the crimes of the Law
			dell'incendio o all'opera di difesa, di	Article 437 – Malicious removal or omission of		1423/56 (that is crimes consisting of
			o all'opera di difesa, di salvataggio o di soccorso, ovvero	removal or omission of protection against injury in the		offences to physical and moral
			in qualsiasi modo	workplace		integrity of minors, and public
			impedisce, od ostacola, che	Anyone who omits to install		security, and public health, safety or
			l'incendio sia estinto, o che sia	systems, equipment or signals		tranquillity), are also considered when adopting an expulsion measure
<u>U</u>			Theehelo sia estilito, o che sia	systems, equipment of signals		when adopting an expulsion measure

ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
AIT	Citation of the Article of the Directive	provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	Comments/110blems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
			prestata opera di difesa	intended to prevent disasters or	(3/22)	on imperative public security
			o di assistenza, è punito con la	injuries in the workplace, or		grounds. And this represents even a
			reclusione da due a sette anni.	removes or damages them, shall		bigger issue of incorrectness leading
			Art. 437 - Rimozione od	be punished from six months' to		to take measures that are not
			omissione dolosa di cautele	five years' imprisonment.		proportionate.
			contro infortuni sul lavoro	If the act causes disaster or		
			Chiunque omette di collocare	injury, the prison term shall be		
			impianti, apparecchi o segnali	from three to ten years.		
			destinati a prevenire			Finally, there is a minor incorrectness
			disastri o infortuni sul lavoro,			since Art. 20 of the transposing act
			ovvero li rimuove o li danneggia,			fails to mention "public health" that
			è punito con la			is however transposed in the relevant
			reclusione da sei mesi a cinque			Article (Article 20.6 of D.Lgs n.
			anni.			30/07).
			Se dal fatto deriva un disastro o			
			un infortunio, la pena è della			T
			reclusione da tre a			It can therefore be concluded that
			dieci anni.			considering the wideness of the circumstances that are relevant for
						taking an expulsion measure, the
			- Articoli 284,285,286,306,438,	- Article 284,285,286,306,438,		authority/person applying the
			439,605 and 630 del CP:	439,605 and 630 of the CP:		legislation has a flexibility that will
			Delitti contro la personalita'	Crimes against the State		allow him to very easily expel EU
			della Stato	Article 284 CP. Armed		nationals.
			Art. 284. CP Insurrezione armata	insurrection against the powers		Autonato.
			contro i poteri dello Stato.	of the State.		
			Chiunque promuove	Anyone who promotes armed		
			un'insurrezione armata contro i	insurrection against the powers		
			poteri dello Stato è punito con	of the State shall be punished to		
			l'ergastolo e, se l'insurrezione	life imprisonment and, if the		
			avviene, con la morte (1).	insurrection takes place, to death		
			Coloro che partecipano	(1). Anyone who participates in		
			all'insurrezione sono puniti con la	an insurrection shall be punished		
			reclusione da tre a quindici anni;	to three to fifteen years'		
			coloro che la dirigono, con la	imprisonment; those who lead it		
			morte.	shall be punished to death.		
			L'insurrezione si considera armata	An insurrection is considered		
			anche se le armi sono soltanto	armed even if the arms are kept		
			tenute in un luogo di deposito.	in storage.		
			(1) La pena di morte per i delitti	(1) The death penalty was		
			previsti dal codice penale è stata	abolished for offences for which		

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
2111	Citation of the Article of the Birective	provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	Commence/11001cms
		provision (regin resi es urus)	Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
			abolita dal D.Lgs.Lgt. n.	it is specified in the criminal	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	
			224/1944.	code under Legislative Decree		
			Art. 285. CP Devastazione,	no. 224/1944.		
			saccheggio e strage.	Article 285 CP. Devastation,		
			Chiunque, allo scopo di attentare	pillaging and slaughter.		
			alla sicurezza dello Stato	Anyone who attacks the security		
			commette un fatto diretto a	of the State with attempted		
			portare la devastazione, il	devastation, pillaging and		
			saccheggio o la strage nel	slaughter within the territory of		
			territorio dello Stato o in una parte	the State or a part thereof shall		
			di esso è punito con la morte (¹).	be punished by death (1).		
			(1) La pena di morte per i delitti	Article 286 CP. Civil war.		
			previsti dal codice penale è stata	Anyone who attempts to		
			abolita dal D.Lgs.Lgt. n. 224/1944.	instigate civil war in the territory of the State shall be punished to		
			Art. 286. CP Guerra civile.	life imprisonment.		
			Chiunque commette un fatto	(1) The death penalty was		
			diretto a suscitare la guerra civile	abolished for offences for which		
			nel territorio dello Stato è punito	it is specified in the criminal		
			con l'ergastolo.	code under Legislative Decree		
			Se la guerra civile avviene, il	no. 224/1944.		
			colpevole è punito con la morte	Article 306. Armed gangs:		
			(1).	formation and participation.		
			(1) La pena di morte per i delitti	Anyone who promotes,		
			previsti dal codice penale è stata	establishes or organises an		
			abolita dal D.Lgs.Lgt. n.	armed gang in order to commit		
			224/1944.	one of the offences identified in		
			Art. 306.Banda armata:	Article 302 shall be subject to		
			formazione e partecipazione.	five to fifteen years'		
			Quando, per commettere uno dei	imprisonment solely for this		
			delitti indicati nell'articolo 302, si	crime.		
			forma una banda armata, coloro	The sole fact of participation in		
			che la promuovono o	an armed gang shall be		
			costituiscono od organizzano,	punishable by three to nine		
			soggiacciono, per ciò solo alla	years' imprisonment.		
			pena della reclusione da cinque a quindici anni.	The leaders or financers of the armed gang shall be subject to		
			Per il solo fatto di partecipare alla	the same sentence as the		
			banda armata la pena è della	promoters thereof.		
			reclusione da tre a nove anni.	Crimes against public safety		
			I capi o i sovventori della banda	Article 438. Epidemic.		
L			1 capi o i sovvenion ucha banda	riticie 436. Epidenne.		

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	
		F (g	Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
			armata soggiacciono alla stessa	Causing an epidemic by	* /	
			pena stabilita per i promotori.	disseminating pathogenic germs		
			Delitti contro l'incolumita'	shall be punishable with life		
			pubblica	imprisonment. If the event		
			Art. 438. Epidemia.	results in death of more than one		
			Chiunque cagiona un'epidemia	person, the punishment will be		
			mediante la diffusione di germi	death. (1)		
			patogeni è punito con l'ergastolo.	Article 439. Poisoning water or		
			Se dal fatto deriva la morte di più	foodstuffs.		
			persone, si applica la pena di	Anyone who poisons water or		
			morte. (1)	foodstuffs before they are		
			La pena di morte per i	obtained or distributed for		
			delitti previsti dal codice penale è	consumption shall be punished		
			stata abolita dall'art. 1 del	to no less than fifteen years'		
			D.Lgs.Lgt. 10 agosto 1944, n.	imprisonment.		
			224.	If the act results in death of any		
			Art. 439. Avvelenamento di acque	person, imprisonment shall be		
			o di sostanze alimentari.	for life; if the act results in death		
			Chiunque avvelena acque o	of more than one person, it shall		
			sostanze destinate	be punishable with death. (1)		
			all'alimentazione, prima che siano	Crimes against the person		
			attinte o distribuite per il	Article 605. Kidnapping		
			consumo, è punito con la	Anyone who deprives a person		
			reclusione non inferiore a quindici	of their personal freedom shall		
			anni.	be punished to six months' to		
			Se dal fatto deriva la morte di	eight years' imprisonment. Imprisonment shall be for one to		
			alcuno, si applica l'ergastolo; e,	ten years if the act is committed:		
			nel caso di morte di più persone,	1. against a parent or		
			si applica la pena di morte. (1)	grandparent, child or grandchild,		
			(1) La pena di morte per i delitti	or a spouse; 2. by a public		
			previsti dal codice penale è stata	official abusing the powers		
			abolita dall'art. 1 del D.Lgs.Lgt.	inherent in his or her position.		
			10 agosto 1944, n. 224.	Crimes against property		
			Delitti contro la persona	Article 630. Kidnapping for		
			Art. 605. Sequestro di persona	purposes of robbery or extortion		
			Chiunque priva taluno della	Anyone who unlawfully detains		
			libertà personale è punito con la	a person in order to obtain undue		
			reclusione da sei mesi a otto anni.	gains for himself or another		
			La pena è della reclusione da uno	person as the price for releasing		
			a dieci anni, se il fatto è	the hostage shall be punished		

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

provision (legal ref. & art.) provision (in language Member State) commesso: 1. in danno di un ascende un discendente, o del co 2. da un pubblico ufficial abuso dei poteri inerenti a funzioni.	provision (y/n) from twenty-five to thirty years' imprisonment. If unlawful imprisonment results in death of the hostage, as an unintended consequence, the guilty party shall be punished from thirty years' imprisonment. If the guilty party causes the
commesso: 1. in danno di un ascende un discendente, o del co 2. da un pubblico ufficial abuso dei poteri inerenti a funzioni.	from twenty-five to thirty years' ente, di imprisonment. If unlawful imprisonment results le, con in death of the hostage, as an elle sue unintended consequence, the guilty party shall be punished from thirty years' imprisonment. esona a If the guilty party causes the
1. in danno di un ascende un discendente, o del co 2. da un pubblico ufficial abuso dei poteri inerenti a funzioni.	inte, di imprisonment. If unlawful imprisonment results in death of the hostage, as an unintended consequence, the guilty party shall be punished from thirty years' imprisonment. If the guilty party causes the
un discendente, o del co 2. da un pubblico ufficial abuso dei poteri inerenti a funzioni.	oniuge; If unlawful imprisonment results le, con in death of the hostage, as an unintended consequence, the guilty party shall be punished from thirty years' imprisonment. If the guilty party causes the
2. da un pubblico ufficial abuso dei poteri inerenti a funzioni.	le, con in death of the hostage, as an lle sue unintended consequence, the guilty party shall be punished from thirty years' imprisonment. If the guilty party causes the
abuso dei poteri inerenti a funzioni.	lle sue unintended consequence, the guilty party shall be punished from thirty years' imprisonment. If the guilty party causes the
funzioni.	guilty party shall be punished from thirty years' imprisonment. sona a If the guilty party causes the
	from thirty years' imprisonment. If the guilty party causes the
	sona a If the guilty party causes the
Delitti contro il patromoni	
Art. 630. Sequestro di per	
scopo di rapina o di estorsic	
Chiunque sequestra una p	
allo scopo di conseguire, p	
per altri, un ingiusto profitto	
prezzo della liberazione, è	
con la reclusione da ventici	
trenta	anni. restore the freedom of the
Se dal sequestro deriva con	
la morte, quale conseguen	
voluta dal reo, della p	
sequestrata, il colpevole è	
con la reclusione di anni	
Se il colpevole cagiona la	
del sequestrato si applica l	
dell'ergastolo. Al concorrente che, dissoc	six to fifteen years' iandosi imprisonment.
	*
dagli altri, si adopera in mo il soggetto passivo riacqu	
libertà, senza che tale risult	
conseguenza del prezzo	
liberazione, si applicano l	
previste dall'articolo 60	
tuttavia il soggetto passivo	
in conseguenza del seq	
dopo la liberazione, la p	
della reclusione da sei a q	
anni.	the identification or capture of
Nei confronti del concorrer	
dissociandosi dagli alt	
adopera, al di fuori de	
previsto dal comma prec	
per evitare che l'attività del	
sia portata a conseguenze u	

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	
			Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
			ovvero aiuta concretamente l'autorità di polizia o l'autorità	If there are attenuating circumstances, the penalty		
			giudiziaria nella raccolta di prove	identified in the second		
			decisive per l'individuazione o la	paragraph shall be replaced with		
			cattura dei concorrenti, la pena	imprisonment from twenty to		
			dell'ergastolo è sostituita da quella	twenty-four years; the penalty		
			della reclusione da dodici a venti	identified in the third paragraph		
			anni e le altre pene sono diminuite	shall be replaced with		
			da un terzo a due terzi.	imprisonment from twenty-four		
			Quando ricorre una circostanza	to thirty years. In the presence of		
			attenuante, alla pena prevista dal	several attenuating		
			secondo comma è sostituita la	circumstances, the penalty		
			reclusione da venti a ventiquattro	applicable as a result of		
			anni; alla pena prevista dal terzo	decreasing the sentence may not		
			comma è sostituita la reclusione	be less than ten years, under the		
			da ventiquattro a trenta anni. Se	circumstances envisaged in the		
			concorrono più circostanze	second paragraph, or fifteen		
			attenuanti, la pena da applicare	years, under the circumstances		
			per effetto delle diminuzioni non può essere inferiore a dieci anni,	envisaged in the third paragraph.		
			nell'ipotesi prevista dal secondo	The limits on the penalty set in the previous paragraph may be		
			comma, ed a quindici anni,	exceeded in the presence of the		
			nell'ipotesi prevista dal terzo	attenuating circumstances		
			comma.	identified in the fifth paragraph		
			I limiti di pena preveduti nel	of this Article.		
			comma precedente possono essere	or tims rittere.		
			superati allorché ricorrono le			
			circostanze attenuanti di cui al			
			quinto comma del presente			
			articolo.			
			be considered dedicated to			
			committing crimes that offend or			
			endanger the physical or moral			
			integrity of minors and public			
			health, safety or tranquillity			
			Lagge 1052 n 645	Low of 20 June 1052 n 645		
			- Legge 1952, n. 645	- Law of 20 June 1952, n. 645		
			Articolo 1	Article 1		

A4	Citation of the Anticle of the Direction	Commending metional	Commists tout of notional	Translation into English of	E11 :	Commonte/Ducklesse
Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	
			Member State) 1. Riorganizzazione del disciolto	provision 1. Reorganisation of the	(y/n)	
			partito fascista.	dissolved fascist party.		
			Ai fini della XII disposizione	For the purposes of the XII		
			transitoria e finale (comma primo)	temporary and final provision		
			della Costituzione, si ha	(paragraph one) of the		
			riorganizzazione del disciolto	Constitution, the reorganisation		
			partito fascista quando una	of the dissolved fascist party is		
			associazione, un movimento o	defined as an attempt by an		
			comunque	association, movement or group		
			un gruppo di persone non	of no less than five people to		
			inferiore a cinque persegue	pursue the anti-democratic ends		
			finalità antidemocratiche proprie	of the fascist party, praising,		
			del partito	threatening or using violence as		
			fascista, esaltando, minacciando o	a method of political struggle,		
			usando la violenza quale metodo	promoting suppression of the		
			di lotta politica o propugnando	freedoms guaranteed by the		
			la soppressione delle libertà	Constitution or denigrating		
			garantite dalla Costituzione o	democracy, its institutions and		
			denigrando la democrazia, le sue	the values of the Resistance,		
			istituzioni e i valori della	distributing racist propaganda,		
			Resistenza, o svolgendo	directing its activities toward		
			propaganda razzista, ovvero	praise of the members,		
			rivolge la sua attività	principles, acts and methods of		
			alla esaltazione di esponenti,	the fascist party or conducting		
			principi, fatti e metodi propri del	external manifestations of a		
			predetto partito o compie	fascist character.		
			manifestazioni esteriori di			
			carattere fascista.			
			Legge del 1967, n.895	- Law 2 October 1967, n.895		
			Art. 1.	Article 1.		
			Chiunque senza licenza	Anyone who manufactures,		
			dell'autorità fabbrica o introduce	introduces into the State, sells or		
			nello Stato o pone in vendita o	transfers weapons of war or parts		
			cede a qualsiasi titolo armi da	thereof suitable for use, war		
			guerra o tipo guerra, o parti di	ammunition, explosives of all		
			esse, atte all'impiego, munizioni	kinds, chemical weapons or		
			da guerra, esplosivi di ogni	other lethal devices without a		
			genere, aggressivi chimici o altri	licence from the authorities or		
			congegni micidiali, ovvero ne fa	collects them shall be punished		

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

A 4	C'4-4'	G1'1	C1-4- 44 - C4'1	Toronda Aran Sada Essallala e	E-II- '	C
Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national provision	accord?	
			Member State)	to three to twelve years'	(y/n)	
			raccolta, è punito con la reclusione da tre a dodici anni e	imprisonment and a fine of		
			con la multa da lire 800.000 a lire	800,000 lire to 4,000,000 lire (1)		
			4.000.000 .	(2).		
			4.000.000 . Art. 2.	(1) The fine was raised to this		
			Chiunque illegalmente detiene a	amount by Article 113,		
			qualsiasi titolo le armi o parti di	paragraph four of law no. 689 on		
			esse, le munizioni, gli esplosivi,	November 24 1981. The		
			gli aggressivi chimici e i congegni	sanction may not be		
			indicati nell'articolo precedente è	decriminalised under Article 32,		
			punito con la reclusione da uno a	paragraph two of the above-		
			otto anni e con la multa da lire	mentioned law 689/1981.		
			400.000 a lire 3.000.000 ((2) Article so replaced by Article		
			Art. 2 bis (1)	9 of law no. 497 on October 14		
			1. Chiunque fuori dei casi	1974.		
			consentiti da disposizioni di legge	Article 2.		
			o di regolamento addestra taluno o	Anyone who illegally possesses		
			fornisce istruzioni in qualsiasi	arms or parts thereof, munitions,		
			forma, anche anonima, o per via	explosives, chemical weapons or		
			telematica sulla preparazione o	other lethal devices identified in		
			sull'uso di materiali esplosivi, di	the previous Article shall be		
			armi da guerra, di aggressivi	punished to one to eight years'		
			chimici o di sostanze	imprisonment and a fine of		
			batteriologiche nocive o	400,000 lire to 3,000,000 lire (1)		
			pericolose e di altri congegni	(2).		
			micidiali è punito, salvo che il	(1) The fine was increased to		
			fatto costituisca più grave reato,	this amount by Article 113,		
			con la reclusione da uno a sei	paragraph four of law no. 689 on		
			anni.	November 24 1981. The		
			Art. 3.	sanction may not be		
			Chiunque trasgredisce all'ordine,	decriminalised under Article 32,		
			legalmente dato dall'autorità, di	paragraph two of the above-		
			consegnare nei termini prescritti	mentioned law 689/1981.		
			le armi o parti di esse, le	(2) Article thus replaced by		
			munizioni, gli esplosivi, gli	Article 10 of law no. 497 on		
			aggressivi chimici e i congegni	October 14 1974.		
			indicati nell'articolo 1, da lui	Article 2 b (1).		
			detenuti legittimamente sino al	1. Anyone who, other than in		
			momento dell'emanazione	those cases permitted by		
			dell'ordine, è punito con la	provisions of the law or		
L			reclusione da uno a otto anni e	regulations, trains people or		

A4	C'4-4'	C		The state of the state of	E-11- '	Community (Decide)
Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of national	Fully in	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national provision	accord?	
			Member State) con la multa da lire 400.000 a lire		(y/n)	
				provides instructions in any		
			3.000.000 Art. 4.	form, even in anonymous form		
				or via telecommunications,		
			Chiunque illegalmente porta in	regarding the preparation and		
			luogo pubblico o aperto al	use of explosives, weapons of		
			pubblico le armi o parti di esse, le	war, chemical weapons, harmful		
			munizioni, gli esplosivi, gli	or dangerous bacteriological		
			aggressivi chimici e i congegni	substances or other lethal		
			indicati nell'articolo 1, è punito	devices shall be punished to one		
			con la reclusione da due a dieci	to six years' imprisonment,		
			anni e con la multa da lire	unless their actions constitute a		
			400.000 a lire 4.000.000	more serious crime.		
			La pena è aumentata se il fatto è	(1) Article added by Article 8		
			commesso da due o più persone o	of Decree Law no. 144 on July		
			in luogo in cui sia concorso o	27 2005, converted into law.		
			adunanza di persone o di notte in	Article 3.		
			luogo abitato	Anyone who transgresses the		
			Art. 5.	authorities' legally given order to		
			Le pene stabilite negli articoli	turn in weapons or parts thereof,		
			precedenti possono essere	munitions, explosives, chemical		
			diminuite in misura non eccedente	weapons or other lethal devices		
			i due terzi quando per la quantità	identified in Article 1		
			o per la qualità delle armi, delle	legitimately possessed until the		
			munizioni, esplosivi o aggressivi	order is issued shall be punished		
			chimici, il fatto debba ritenersi di	to one to eight years'		
			lieve entità. In ogni caso, la	imprisonment and a fine of		
			reclusione non può essere	400,000 lire to 3,000,000 lire (1)		
			inferiore a sei mesi.	(2).		
			Art. 6.	(1) The fine was increased to		
			Chiunque, al fine di incutere	this amount by Article 113,		
			pubblico timore o di suscitare	paragraph four of law no. 689		
			tumulto o pubblico disordine o di	on November 24 1981. The		
			attentare alla sicurezza pubblica,	sanction may not be		
			fa esplodere colpi di arma da	decriminalised under Article 32,		
			fuoco o fa scoppiare bombe o altri	paragraph two of the above-		
			ordigni o materie esplodenti, è	mentioned law 689/1981.		
			punito, se il fatto non costituisce	(2) Article thus replaced by		
			più grave reato, con la reclusione	Article 11 of law no. 497 on		
			da uno a otto anni	October 14 1974.		
			Art. 7.	Article 4.		
			Le pene rispettivamente stabilite	Anyone who illegally takes arms		

A4	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Commists to the first one	Tuonalation into English of	F11 :	Comments/Problems
Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of	Translation into English of national	Fully in accord?	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
			negli articoli precedenti sono	or parts thereof, munitions,	(y/II)	
			ridotte di un terzo se i fatti ivi	explosives, chemical weapons or		
			previsti si riferiscono alle armi	other lethal devices identified in		
			comuni da sparo, o a parti di esse,	Article 1 into a public place or a		
			atte all'impiego, di cui all'articolo	place open to the public shall be		
			44 del regio decreto 6 maggio	punished to two to ten years'		
			1940, n. 635.	imprisonment and a fine of		
			Le pene stabilite nel codice penale	400,000 lire to 4,000,000 lire		
			per le contravvenzioni alle norme	(1).		
			concernenti le armi non	The sentence shall be increased		
			contemplate dalla presente legge	if the offence is committed by		
			sono triplicate. In ogni caso	two or more people or in a place		
			l'arresto non può essere inferiore a	in which there are crowds or		
			tre mesi	groups of people or by night in		
			Art. 8.	an inhabited place (2).		
			Non è punibile chi, entro trenta	(1) The fine was increased to		
			giorni dall'entrata in vigore della	this amount by Article 113,		
			presente legge e prima	paragraph four of law no. 689 on		
			dell'accertamento del reato,	November 24 1981. The		
			consegna le armi o parti di esse, le	sanction may not be		
			munizioni, gli esplosivi e gli altri	decriminalised under Article 32,		
			congegni micidiali illegalmente	paragraph two of the above-		
			detenuti, indicati nel precedente	mentioned law 689/1981.		
			art. 1 o nell'art. 695 del Codice	(2) Article thus replaced by		
			penale.	Article 12 of law no. 497 on		
			Art. 9.	October 14 1974.		
			Per i reati previsti dalla presente	Article 5.		
			legge si procede a giudizio	The penalties set forth in the		
			direttissimo.	previous Articles may be		
				decreased by no more than two		
				thirds if the quantity or quality		
				of the arms, munitions,		
				explosives or aggressive		
				chemicals make the offence less		
				grave. In all cases imprisonment		
				shall be for no less than six		
				months.		
				Article 6.		
				Anyone who shoots a firearm or		
				detonates bombs or other		
				explosives in order to create		

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord? (y/n)	Comments/Problems
				panic among the public or to		
				give rise to a riot or public		
				disorder or to attack public		
				safety shall, if the act does not		
				constitute a more serious crime,		
				be punished with imprisonment		
				from one to eight years(1).		
				(1) Article thus replaced by		
				Article 13 of law no. 497 on		
				October 14 1974.		
				Article 7.		
				The sentences established in		
				each of the above Articles shall		
				be reduced by one third if the		
				acts identified in them are		
				performed with ordinary		
				firearms or parts thereof which		
				were approved for use under		
				Article 44 of Royal Decree no.		
				635 on May 6 1940.		
				The penalties established in the		
				criminal code shall be multiplied		
				by three in the event of violation		
				of the laws concerning firearms		
				not contemplated by this law. In		
				all cases imprisonment shall be		
				for no less than three months.		
				(1) Article thus replaced by Article 14 of law no. 497 on		
				October 14 1974.		
				Article 8.		
				Anyone who turns in illegally		
				held arms or parts thereof,		
				munitions, explosives and other		
				lethal devices identified in		
				Article 1 or in Article 695 of		
				the Criminal Code within thirty		
				days of the entry into force of		
				this law and before they are		
				accused of an offence shall not		
				be punishable.		

A 4		0 1 1 1			E 11 ·	G 4/P 11
Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of Member State)	national provision	accord? (y/n)	
			Wiember State)	Article 9.	(y/II)	
				Offenders under this law shall be		
				tried summarily (<i>direttissimo</i>).		
				tried summarily (attentissimo).		
			- Gli Articoli 8 e seguenti della	Articles 8 and following of the		
			Legge 14 ottobre 1974,n. 497:	Law 14 October 1974,n. 497:		
			sono modifiche alle leggi 1423/56	(These provision concern		
			e Law 895/67	amendments to Law 1423/56		
				and Law 895/67)		
			Art. 8.			
			(Omissis) (1).	Art. 8.		
			(1) Sostituisce il primo comma	(Omissis) (1).		
			dell'art. 9, l. 27 dicembre 1956, n.	(1) Replacing par. 1 of art. 9, 1.		
			1423.	of law 27 December 1956, n.		
			Art. 9.	1423.		
			(Omissis) (1).	Art. 9.		
			(1) Sostituisce l'art. 1, 1. 2 ottobre	(Omissis) (1).		
			1967, n. 895.	(1) Replacing art. 1, l. 2 October		
			Art. 10.	1967, n. 895.		
			(Omissis) (1).	Art. 10.		
			(1) Sostituisce l'art. 2, l. 2 ottobre	(Omissis) (1).		
			1967, n. 895.	(1) Replacing art. 2, l. 2 October		
			Art. 11.	1967, n. 895. Art. 11.		
			(Omissis) (1). (1) Sostituisce l'art. 3, l. 2 ottobre	(Omissis) (1).		
			1967, n. 895.	(1) Replacing art. 3, l. 2 October		
			Art. 12.	1967, n. 895.		
			(Omissis) (1).	Art. 12.		
			(1) Sostituisce l'art. 4, l. 2 ottobre	(Omissis) (1).		
			1967, n. 895.	(1) Replacing art. 4, l. 2 October		
			Art. 13.	1967, n. 895.		
			(Omissis) (1).	Art. 13.		
			(1) Sostituisce l'art. 6, l. 2 ottobre	(Omissis) (1).		
			1967, n. 895.	(1) Replacing art. 6, l. 2 October		
			Art. 14.	1967, n. 895.		
			(Omissis) (1).	Art. 14.		
			(1) Sostituisce l'art. 7, l. 2 ottobre	(Omissis) (1).		
			1967, n. 895.	(1) Replacing art. 7, l. 2 October		
			Art. 15.	1967, n. 895.		
			Le disposizioni contenute nel	Art. 15.		
			precedente articolo non si	The provisions contained in the		

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of Member State)	national provision	accord? (y/n)	
			applicano nell'ipotesi di reato di	previous article do not apply in	(y / n)	
			porto d'armi abusivo per	case of the crime consisting in		
			mancanza di validità della licenza	illegal gun licence because of the		
			di porto d'armi anche per uso di	lack of validity of the gun		
			caccia conseguente all'omesso	licence, also related to the use in		
			pagamento della tassa di concessione governativa.	hunt, as a consequence of the non payment of the excise		
			Art. 16.	government tax		
			Le norme processuali della	Art. 16.		
			presente legge valgono fino	The provisions of this law are in		
			all'entrata in vigore del nuovo	force until the entry into force of		
			codice di procedura penale.	the new criminal procedural		
				code.		
			Legge 27 dicembre 1956, n. 1423	Law 27 December 1956, n. 1423		
				Eaw 27 Becomeer 1930, ii. 1123		
			ARTICOLO 1	ARTICLE 1		
			I provvedimenti previsti dalla presente legge si applicano a:	The provisions of this law shall		
			1) coloro che debba ritenersi, sulla	apply to.		
			base di elementi di fatto, che sono	1) those who must, on the basis		
			abitualmente dediti a traffici	of factual information, be		
			delittuosi;	considered habitually dedicated		
			2) coloro che per la condotta ed il	to unlawful dealings;		
			tenore di vita debba ritenersi, sulla	2) those whose lifestyle and		
			base di elementi di fatto, che	behaviour must, on the basis of		
			vivono abitualmente, anche in parte, con i proventi di attività	factual information, be considered a result of habitually		
			delittuose;	living, even in part, on income		
			3) coloro che per il loro	from criminal activities;		
			comportamento debba ritenersi,	3) those whose behaviour must,		
			sulla base di elementi di fatto, che	on the basis of factual		
			sono dediti alla commissione di	information, be considered		
			reati che offendono o mettono in	dedicated to committing crimes		
			pericolo l'integrità fisica o morale	that offend or endanger the		
			dei minorenni, la sanità, la	physical or moral integrity of		
			sicurezza o la tranquillità pubblica (1).	minors and public health, safety or tranquillity (1).		
			(1). (1) Articolo sostituito dall'articolo	(1) Article replaced by Article		
			2 della legge 3 agosto 1988, n.	2 of Law no. 327 on August 3		

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord?	Comments/Problems
			327.	1988	(y /11)	
			ARTICOLO 9	ARTICLE 9		
			1. Il contravventore agli obblighi	1. Those who violate the		
			inerenti alla sorveglianza speciale	obligations inherent in police		
			è punito con l'arresto da tre mesi	supervision shall be punished to		
			ad un anno.	three months' to one year's		
			2. Se l'inosservanza riguarda gli	imprisonment.		
			obblighi e le prescrizioni inerenti	2. Failure to comply with the		
			alla sorveglianza speciale con	obligations and prescriptions		
			l'obbligo o il divieto di soggiorno,	involved in police supervision		
			si applica la pena della reclusione	with an obligation or prohibition		
			da uno a cinque anni ed è	to stay in a certain place shall be		
			consentito l'arresto anche fuori dei	punished to one to five years'		
			casi di flagranza (1).	imprisonment, and arrest shall be		
			3. Nell'ipotesi indicata nel comma	permitted even in cases other than <i>in flagrante delicto</i> (1).		
			2 gli ufficiali ed agenti di polizia giudiziaria possono procedere	3. In the case identified in		
			all'arresto anche fuori dei casi di	paragraph 2, the judicial police		
			flagranza.	officials and officers may arrest		
			4. Salvo quanto è prescritto da	anyone even if not caught <i>in</i>		
			altre disposizioni di legge, il	flagrante delicto.		
			sorvegliato speciale che, per un	4. Unless stated by other		
			reato commesso dopo il decreto di	provisions of the law, a person		
			sorveglianza speciale, abbia	under police supervision who is		
			riportato condanna a pena	punished to no less than six		
			detentiva non inferiore a sei mesi,	months' imprisonment for a		
			può essere sottoposto a libertà	crime committed after the police		
			vigilata per un tempo non	supervision order is issued may		
			inferiore a due anni (2).	be put on probation for no less than two years (2).		
			(1) Comma sostituito dall'articolo 14 del D.L. 27 luglio 2005, n.	(1) Article replaced by Article		
			14 dei <i>D.L.</i> 27 luglio 2003, ii.	14 of Decree Law no. 144 on		
			(2) Articolo modificato	July 27 2005.		
			dall'articolo 8 della legge 14	(2) Article amended by Article		
			ottobre 1974, n. 497, dall'articolo	8 of law no. 497 on October 14		
			12 della legge 13 settembre 1982,	1974, Article 12 of law no. 646		
			n. 646, e successivamente	of September 13 1982, and then		
			sostituito dall'articolo 23 del D.L.	replaced by Article 23 of		
			8 giugno 1992, n. 306.	Decree Law no. 306 on June 8		
				1992.		

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord? (y/n)	Comments/Problems
		New Art. 235 CP as amended by Law Decree 92/08(as amended by Law n. 125/08)	Art. 235 (Espulsione od allontanamento dello straniero dallo Stato) Il giudice ordina l'espulsione dello straniero ovvero l'allontanamento dal territorio dello Stato del cittadino appartenente ad uno Stato membro dell'Unione europea, oltre che nei casi espressamente preveduti dalla legge, quando lo straniero o il cittadino appartenente ad uno Stato membro dell'Unione europea sia condannato alla reclusione per un tempo superiore ai due anni. Ferme restando le disposizioni in materia di esecuzione delle misure di sicurezza personali, l'espulsione e l'allontanamento dal territorio dello Stato sono eseguiti dal questore secondo le modalita' di cui, rispettivamente, all'articolo 13, comma 4, del testo unico di cui al decreto legislativo 25 luglio 1998, n. 286, e all'articolo 20, comma 11, del decreto legislativo 6 febbraio 2007, n. 30. Il trasgressore dell'ordine di espulsione od allontanamento pronunciato dal giudice è punito con la reclusione da uno a quattro anni»; In tal caso e' obbligatorio l'arresto dell'autore del fatto, anche fuori dei casi di flagranza, e si procede con rito direttissimo»;	Art. 235 (Expulsion of the foreign national from the Sate) The judge orders the expulsion of the foreigner or the expulsion from the territory of the State of the citizen of a EU Member State, in addition to cases expressly referred to by the law, when the foreigner or the EU citizen has been convicted for more than 2 years of prison. Without prejudice to the provisions on personal security measures, the expulsion and the "allontanamento" (this is the term used for EU citizens) from the territory of the State are executed by the questore according to the procedures referred to in Art. 13.4 of D.Lgs 286/98 and Art. 20.11 of D.Lgs 30/2007. The person no not complying with an expulsion or "allontanamento" order pronounced by the judgeis punished with imprisonment from 1 to 4 years. In this case it is compulsory to arrest the person concerned even outside the cases of flagrancy and it is proceeded with the direttissimo proceeding.		

			-			G
Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national 	accord?	
			Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
		Non And 212 CD as an all the	4 4 212	A 4 212 (F - 1		
		New Art. 312 CP as amended by Law Decree 92/08(as amended	Art. 312	Art. 312 (Expulsion of the		
		-	(Espulsione od allontanamento	foreign national from the State)		
		by Law n. 125/08)	dello straniero dallo Stato)	The judge orders the expulsion		
			Il giudice ordina l'espulsione dello straniero ovvero	of the foreigner or the expulsion from the territory of the State of		
			dello straniero ovvero l'allontanamento dal territorio	the citizen of a EU Member		
			dello Stato del cittadino	State, in addition to cases		
			appartenente ad uno Stato	expressly referred to by the law,		
			membro dell'Unione europea,	when the foreigner or the EU		
			oltre che nei casi espressamente	Member State citizen has been		
			preveduti dalla legge, quando lo	convicted for crimes against the		
			straniero o il cittadino	personality of the State and		
			appartenente ad uno Stato	punished with a penalty		
			membro dell'Unione europea sia	involving restrictions of freedom		
			condannato ad una pena	for one of the offences of this		
			restrittiva della libertà personale	title.		
			per taluno dei delitti preveduti da	Without prejudice to the		
			questo titolo.	provisions on personal security		
			Ferme restando le disposizioni in	measures, the expulsion and the		
			materia di esecuzione delle	"allontanamento" (this is the		
			misure di sicurezza personali,	term used for EU citizens)from		
			l'espulsione e l'allontanamento	the territory of the State are		
			dal territorio dello Stato sono	executed by the questore		
			eseguiti dal questore secondo le	according to the procedures		
			modalita' di cui, rispettivamente,	referred to in Art. 13.4 of D.Lgs		
			all'articolo 13, comma 4, del testo	286/98 and Art. 20.11 of D.Lgs		
			unico di cui al decreto legislativo	30/2007.		
			25 luglio 1998, n. 286, e	The person no not complying		
			all'articolo 20, comma 11, del	with an expulsion or		
			decreto legislativo 6 febbraio	"'allontanamento" order		
			2007, n. 30.	pronounced by the judgeis		
			Il trasgressore dell'ordine di	punished with imprisonment		
			espulsione od allontanamento	from 1 to 4 years.		
			pronunciato dal giudice è punito	In this case it is compulsory to		
			con la reclusione da uno a quattro	arrest the person concerned		
			anni.	even outside the cases of		
			In tal caso e' obbligatorio l'arresto dell'autore del fatto,	flagrancy and it is proceeded		
			anche fuori dei casi di flagranza,	with the direttissimo proceeding.		
			e si procede con rito			

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord? (y/n)	Comments/Problems
		New Art. 61.1 n. 11 bis CP as introduced by Law Decree 922/08 (as amended by Law n. 125/08)	direttissimo»; Art 61-11bis Se il fatto è commesso da soggetto che si trovi illegalmente sul territorio nazionale.	Art 61-11bis If the fact has been committed by the person who is illegally in the national territory. (the article concerns the aggravating circumstances)		
	These grounds shall not be invoked to serve economic ends.	Art. 20.4 D.Lgs n. 30/07	4. I provvedimenti di allontanamento [] e non possono essere motivati da ragioni di ordine economico []	4. The expulsion decisions [] and the grounds shall not be invoked to serve economic ends []	Y	Effective transposition Article 27.2 second indent of the Directive. Par. 4 correctly transposes the last part of Art. 27.1 of the Directive which indicates that these grounds cannot be invoked to serve economic reasons.
Art.27.2	2. Measures taken on grounds of public policy or public security shall comply with the principle of proportionality and shall be based exclusively on the personal conduct of the individual concerned. Previous criminal convictions shall not in themselves constitute grounds for taking such measures.	Art. 20.2 D.Lgs n. 30/07	4. I provvedimenti di allontanamento sono adottati nel rispetto del principio di proporzionalità e non possono essere motivati, [] né da ragioni estranee ai comportamenti individuali dell'interessato [] L'esistenza di condanne penali non giustifica di per se' l'adozione di tali provvedimenti.	4. Expulsion measures shall comply with the principle of proportionality and shall not be based, [] nor on grounds extraneous to the personal conduct of the individual concerned, [] Previous criminal convictions shall not constitute grounds for taking such measures.	Y	Although the provision is literally transposed, it should be considered what explained under transposition of Art. 27 (1); so finally expulsion measures do not appear to be proportionate since the circumstances that can lead to expulsion are very broad (see the example above e.g., one of the behaviours taken into consideration is to live from the benefits obtained from the commission of crimes. This could easily include thieves whose main living resources come from stealing (thus a crime). Or the new added provisions amending the Criminal Code that expressly provide that a EU citizen will be expelled if convicted for more than 2 years of prison).
	The personal conduct of the individual	New Art. 20.4, 20.2 and 20.3 of	4. [] e non possono essere	4. [] on the personal conduct	N,	Incorrect and incomplete

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
Ait	Citation of the Africe of the Directive	provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	Comments/11obiems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
	concerned must represent a genuine,	D.Lgs n. 30/07 as replaced by	motivati [] né da ragioni	of the individual concerned that	Incorrect	transposition
	present and sufficiently serious threat	Art. 1.1 c) D.Lgs n. 32/08	estranee ai comportamenti	represent a genuine and present	and	
	affecting one of the fundamental interests	, ,	individuali dell'interessato che	threat to the public policy or	Incomplet	Art. 20.4 does not refer to
	of society. Justifications that are isolated		rappresentino una minaccia	public security.	e	"sufficiently serious" threat that, as
	from the particulars of the case or that		concreta e attuale all'ordine			confirmed by to settled ECJ case law ⁹
	rely on considerations of general		pubblico o alla pubblica sicurezza.			it is an important concept to take into
	prevention shall not be accepted.					consideration in order to assess the
						conduct of the individual concerned.
						In the Italian case, the conduct seems
						to be assessed more widely as
						compared to the Directive being
						possible <i>de facto</i> to order an
						expulsion for a
						behaviours/conducts/actions that
						represent a "threat" but not to the
						extend ("sufficiently serious") to be a ground of expulsion. In this regard
						there is a recent case law of the
						Italian Court of Cassation ¹⁰ that says
						that expulsion shall not be
						automatically adopted but after an
						assessment of the "pericolosità" that
						is the "dangerousness" of the person
						concerned. However this is not the
						same and cannot be considered as
						enough to fill the gap left by the
						Italian transposing provision.
						Also settled ECJ case law confirmed
						the importance of the requirement of
						"sufficiently serious threat" stating
						that "public policy exception, like all
						derogations from a fundamental
						principle of the Treaty, must be
						interpreted restrictively". In the
						Case Commission v Netherlands the
						ECJ also highlights that "in addition

Milieu Ltd

Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

 ⁹ See, e.g., Case C-50/06 Commission v Netherlands par 43, Case 36/75 Rutili, par 28, Case 30/77 Bouchereau, par 35, Case C-493/01 Orfanopoulos, par 66.
 ¹⁰ Sent n. 22511 Cassazione Penale Sez. IV, 3 May 2007
 ¹¹ Case C-348/96, Calfa par 23. See also Case C-50/06 Commission v Netherlands par 42 and 43.

Art Citation of the Article of the Directive Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.) Complete text of national provision Complete text of national provision In anguage of Member State)
Member State) Description Description
which any infringement of involves, of a genuir sufficiently serious threat to the fundamental interests of In this regard transposi therefore incorrect. The omission renders transposition of the whole A as incorrect and this even th Italian transposing legislation transposes the provisions state measures taken as a proportional, shall be based personal conduct of the concerned, previous convictions shall not the represent a ground of expal although the expulsion mean notified to the individual of in accordance with the Dire although some procedural sa are guaranteed). However grounds that could be actually expel a EU citizen do not with the principle of propor as shown in previous rows.
The legislation is a contradictory and this confir said above under Art. 27 (1) been transposed, incorrectly, a legislation that is very broad Moreover, instead of refe "affecting one of the function interests of society" the

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of Member State)	national provision	accord? (y/n)	
				,	())	what stated under Art. 27 (1); in particular the definition given to State security is so broad that finally almost "everything" can violate "fundamental interests of society".
						Instead of saying "genuine" ("reale" in Italian), the national provision says "concreta" ("concrete" in English); this might not represent a problem since the two term are to be considered as equivalent.
Art.27.3	3. In order to ascertain whether the person concerned represents a danger for public policy or public security, when issuing the registration certificate or, in the absence of a registration system, not later than three months from the date of arrival of the person concerned on its territory or from the date of reporting his/her presence within the territory, as provided for in Article 5(5), or when issuing the residence card, the host Member State may, should it consider this essential, request the Member State of origin and, if need be, other Member States to provide information concerning any previous police record the person concerned may have. Such enquiries shall not be made as a matter of routine. The Member State consulted shall give its reply within two months.				NT	Not transposed
Art.27.4	4. The Member State which issued the passport or identity card shall allow the holder of the document who has been expelled on grounds of public policy, public security, or public health from another Member State to re-enter its territory without any formality even if the document is no longer valid or the				Y	Effective transposition Not transposed However, Italy is a party of the ECHR and has incorporated its provisions by Law 848 of 1955. Therefore Italy is obliged to readmit nationals.

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of Member State)	national provision	accord? (y/n)	
	nationality of the holder is in dispute.			•		
Art.28	Protection against expulsion 1. Before taking an expulsion decision on grounds of public policy or public security, the host Member State shall take account of considerations such as how long the individual concerned has resided on its territory, his/her age, state of health, family and economic situation, social and cultural integration into the host Member State and the extent of his/her links with the country of origin.	New Art. 20.5 D.Lgs n. 30/07 as replaced by Art. 1.1 c) D.Lgs n. 32/08	5. Nell'adottare un provvedimento di allontanamento si tiene conto della durata del soggiorno in Italia dell'interessato, della sua età, del suo stato di salute, della sua situazione familiare e economica, della sua integrazione sociale e culturale nel territorio nazionale e dell'importanza dei suoi legami con il Paese d'origine.	5. Before taking an expulsion decision, it shall be taken into account considerations such as how long the individual concerned has resided in Italy, his/her age, state of health, family and economic situation, social and cultural integration into the national territory and the extent of his/her links with the country of origin.	Y	Almost literal transposition Actually, since the Italian legislation does not specify the grounds, then for any ground of expulsion the elements indicated in the Directive are taken into account. Therefore in this regard the transposing provision is even more favourable.
	2. The host Member State may not take an expulsion decision against Union citizens or their family members, irrespective of nationality, who have the right of permanent residence on its territory, except on serious grounds of public policy or public security.	New Art. 20.6 D.Lgs n. 30/07 as replaced by Art. 1.1 c) D.Lgs n. 32/08	6. I titolari del diritto di soggiorno permanente di cui all'articolo 14 possono essere allontanati dal territorio nazionale solo per motivi di sicurezza dello Stato, per motivi imperativi di pubblica sicurezza o per altri gravi motivi di ordine pubblico o di pubblica sicurezza.	6. An expulsion decision against persons having the right of permanent residence according Article 14, cannot be taken, except on grounds of State security; imperative public security; other serious public order or public security grounds.	N, Incorrect	Incorrect transposition The Italian Decree does not specify "Union citizens or their family members, irrespective of nationality" but directly refers to its Art. 14 (on the right of permanent residence) where the reference made by the Directive exist. The transposing Decree refers to a wider range of grounds as compared to the Directive, namely: - State security; - imperative public security; - other serious public order or public security grounds. As derived from the structure of the Italian provisions, State security is considered as serious public policy/public security ground. However, as explained in the analysis of Art. 27(1) the scope of State security covers almost "everything" so finally transposition is incorrect. Because there is no such thing as qualification of seriousness in the

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord? (y/n)	Comments/Problems
						Italian transposition in practice.
	3. An expulsion decision may not be taken against Union citizens, except if the decision is based on imperative grounds of public security, as defined by Member States, if they: (a) have resided in the host Member State for the previous 10 years; or	New Art. 20.7 D.Lgs n. 30/07 as replaced by Art. 1.1 c) D.Lgs n. 32/08	7. I beneficiari del diritto di soggiorno che hanno soggiornato nel territorio nazionale nei precedenti dieci anni [] possono essere allontanati solo per motivi di sicurezza dello Stato o per motivi imperativi di pubblica sicurezza, []	right of residence and who have resided in the national territory for the previous 10 years [] may only be expelled on State security or imperative public	N, Incorrect	Incorrect transposition The Directive only refers to "imperative grounds of public security", while the transposing Decree also refers to "State security" grounds putting an "OR", so a choice between State security and imperative public security grounds, that the Directive does not leave. From the literal point of view this represents an incorrectness itself (in this regard the Italian provision might seem to be more stringent). This means that Italy might expel e.g. a person residing for 10 years in Italy even only on State security grounds which however, cover a broad range of circumstances.
		New Art. 20.3 D.Lgs n. 30/07 as replaced by Art. 1.1 c) D.Lgs n. 32/08 - Art. 8 (on compulsory	3. I motivi imperativi di pubblica sicurezza sussistono quando la persona da allontanare abbia tenuto comportamenti che	grounds are when the conduct of the person concerned		Paragraph 3 of New Art. 20 defines imperative public security grounds that the Directive leaves to the Member States to define.

¹² For full text of Article 8 of the Law, refer to the Annex

Milieu Ltd ITALY 100/130

¹³ Art. 13.5 **5 bis.** In the cases identified in paragraphs 4* and 5* the chief of police shall notify the judge of peace (giudice di pace) with territorial jurisdiction of the order to accompany the foreign citizen to the border immediately, and in all cases within forty-eight hours of giving the order. Execution of the chief of police's order to leave national territory shall be suspended until a decision is passed validating the order. The validation hearing shall be held in the council chambers, with the essential participation of a defence attorney, who shall be notified in sufficient time. The person involved shall likewise be notified in sufficient time and accompanied to the place where the hearing is held. The provisions of the sixth and seventh sentences of paragraph 8 shall apply where compatible. The judge shall validate the order with motivation within forty-eight hours, having checked compliance with the deadlines and the existence of the requirements stated under this Article and consulted the person concerned, if this person appears in court. While awaiting conclusion of the validation procedure, the expelled foreign citizen shall be detained in facilities for temporary accommodation and assistance as stated in Article 14, unless the proceedings may be completed in the place in which the expulsion order was adopted prior to transfer to one of the available facilities. If validation is granted, the order to accompany the foreign citizen to the border shall become enforceable. If validation is not granted or the deadline for decision is not met, the order issued by the chief of police shall become entirely ineffective. The validation order may be appealed in the court of cassation. The appeal shall not suspend execution of expulsion from national territory. The forty-eight hour deadline within which the justice of the peace must validate the order is calculated from the time at which the order is served to the office of the clerk.

^{*} PAR 4 Expulsion is always performed by the chief of police with accompaniment to the border by the police except in the cases identified in paragraph 5.

^{*} PAR 5 In the case of foreign citizens who remain in the territory of the State when their permit to stay expired more than sixty days previously without requesting renewal, the expulsion order contains an order to leave the territory of the State within fifteen days. The chief of police shall immediately accompany the foreign citizen to the border if the prefect finds that there is clear danger that the person will not obey the order.

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
1110	Citation of the influence of the Birective	provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	Comments/1100icms
		provision (regaries & arts)	Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
		surrender of the	costituiscono una minaccia	serious threat to the fundamental	(3)	The Italian provision does not refer to
		person) of Law n. 69	concreta, effettiva e grave ai diritti	right of the person or to the		"murder" as a ground of expulsion
		of 22 April 2005 on	fondamentali della persona ovvero	public safety, so that his/her		(that would not be to consider as
		provisions to transpose	all'incolumità pubblica, rendendo	expulsion becomes urgent		"imperative ground"): it says that
		Council Framework	urgente l'allontanamento perche'	because his/her stay in the		"the expulsion decision is issued (if
		Decision	la sua ulteriore permanenza sul	territory is incompatible with the		relevant) taking into account
		2002/584/JHA of the	territorio è incompatibile con la	civil and save coexistence. The		possible convictions (for
		of 13 June 2002, on	civile e sicura convivenza. Ai fini	expulsion decision is issued		"old"/previous committed crimes)
		the European arrest	dell'adozione del provvedimento,	taking into account possible		given by an Italian or foreign/alien
		warrant and the	si tiene conto anche di eventuali	convictions given by an Italian		judge for one or more non culpable
		surrender procedures	condanne, pronunciate da un	or foreign/alien judge for one or		offence []" (so not the criminal
		between Member	giudice italiano o straniero, per	more non culpable offences (non		conviction itself).
		States.	uno o più delitti non colposi,	colposi: may be translated as non		What is relevant for an expulsion
		- Article 444 of CPP on	consumati o tentati, contro la vita	culpable offences/with no		decision to be taken in this context is
		plea bargain	o l'incolumità della persona, o per	intention or non negligent		the "conduct of the person
		- Article 1 of Law n.	uno o più delitti corrispondenti	offence), attempted or		concerned" that has to represent" a
		1423/1956 on	alle fattispecie indicate	consummated, against the life or		concrete, real and serious threat to the
		prevention measures against persons	nell'articolo 8 della legge 22 aprile 2005, n. 69, di eventuali	the personal safety of a person, or for one or more offences that		fundamental right of the person or to the public safety,[]". This is in line
		dangerous for public	ipotesi di applicazione della pena	correspond to the ones referred		with the ECJ settled case law. 14
		security and morality	su richiesta a norma dell'articolo	to in Article 8 of Law n. 69 of 22		with the ECJ settled case law.
		- Article 1 of Law n.	444 del codice di procedura	April 2005, of possible cases of		However, the definition also specifies
		575 /1965 on	penale per i medesimi delitti,	sentences' enforcement upon		that the expulsion (on imperative
		Provisions against	ovvero dell'appartenenza a taluna	request, according to Article 444		public security grounds) is "urgent
		Mafia	delle categorie di cui all'articolo 1	of the criminal procedural code,		because the stay of the person
			della legge 27 dicembre 1956, n.	of possible cases of plea		concerned in the territory is
			1423, e successive modificazioni,	bargain, according to		incompatible with the "civil and save
			o di cui all'articolo 1 della legge	(applicazione della pena su		coexistence". This last sentence is
			31 maggio 1965, n. 575, e	richiesta) Article 444 of the		again broad and generic and quite a
			successive modificazioni, nonche'	criminal procedural code,		number of circumstances may be
			di misure di prevenzione o di	foreseen for the same crimes, or		included; in principle even robbery or
			provvedimenti di allontanamento	the belonging to one of the		rape may be considered as an
			disposti da autorità straniere.	categories referred to in Article 1		imperative ground for expulsion.
				of Law n. 1423 of 27 December		
				1956 and its further		Moreover, past convictions issued by
				amendments, or referred to in		an Italian or foreign judge are also
				Article 1 of Law n. n. 575 of 31		taken into account as an element to
				May 1965 and its further		decide on a expulsion:

¹⁴ See e.g., C-493/01 Orfanopoulos par. 67 [...] the existence of a previous criminal conviction can justify an expulsion only in so far as the circumstances which gave rise to that conviction are evidence of personal conduct constituting a present threat [...]. The same is stated in Case C-50/60 Commission v Netherlands, par 41, and others (Case C-384/96 Calfa..). Milieu Ltd **ITALY**

Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
			Wiember State)	amendments, as well as	(y /11)	- convictions for one or more non
				prevention measures given by		culpable offences, attempted or
				foreign/alien authorities or		consummated, against the life/
				expulsion measures given by		personal safety of a person, or
				foreign/alien authorities.		-for one or more offences that
						correspond to the ones referred to in
						Article 8 of Law n. 69/2005 (so
			TESTI RICHIAMATI DALL'	PROVISIONS REFERERD TO		basically participating in an
			Art. 20.3 D.Lgs n. 30/07	BY Art. 20.3 D.Lgs n. 30/07		association having the objective of
				_		committing crimes, do acts of threat
			- Articolo 8 legge n. 69/2005 ¹²	- Article 8 of Law n. 69 of 22		against public safety)
			- Articolo 444 CPP	April 2005,		- of possible cases of sentences'
			1. L'imputato e il pubblico	- Article 444 CPP		enforcement upon request, according
			ministero possono chiedere al	1. The accused and the public		to Article 444 of CPP (plea bargain.
			giudice l'applicazione, nella	prosecutor may ask the judge to		This is a conviction judgment – the
			specie e nella misura indicata, di	apply, in the cases and to the		proceeding has been however
			una sanzione sostitutiva o di una	extent indicated, a substitute		shortened under certain
			pena pecuniaria, diminuita fino a	sanction or pecuniary penalty		circumstances);
			un terzo, ovvero di una pena	decreased by up to one third, or		- or the belonging to one of the
			detentiva quando questa, tenuto	a detention if, taking into		categories referred to in Article 1 of
			conto delle circostanze e	account the circumstances and		Law n. 1423/1956 on measures
			diminuita fino a un terzo, non	decreased by up to one third, the		against persons dangerous to public
			supera cinque anni soli o	detention does not exceed five		security and morality (crimes
			congiunti a pena pecuniaria.	years either alone or in		consisting of offences to physical and
			1-bis. Sono esclusi	conjunction with the pecuniary sanctions.		moral integrity of minors, and public security, and public health, safety or
			dall'applicazione del comma 1 i procedimenti per i delitti di cui	1-b. Paragraph 1 shall not apply		tranquillity
			all'articolo 51, commi 3-bis e 3-	to proceedings for the offences		- or referred to in Article 1 of Law n.
			quater, i procedimenti per i delitti	identified in Article 51,		n. 575/1965 namely to persons
			di cui agli articoli 600-bis, primo	paragraphs 3-bis and 3-quater,		suspected to belong to mafia or
			e terzo comma, 600-quater, primo,	proceedings for the offences		similar organisations
			secondo, terzo e quinto comma,	identified in Article s 600-bis,		- as well as prevention measures
			600-quater, secondo comma, 600-	paragraphs one and three, 600-		given by foreign authorities or
			quater.1, relativamente alla	quater, paragraphs one, two,		expulsion measures given by foreign
			condotta di produzione o	three and five, 600-quater,		authorities.
			commercio di materiale	paragraph two, 600-quater.1, on		
			pornografico, 600-quinquies,	the production or sale of		
			nonché 609-bis, 609-ter, 609-	pornographic material, 600-		As per transposition of Article 27(1),
			quater e 609-octies del codice	quinquies, and 609-bis, 609-ter,		the Italian legislation refers to a
			penale, nonché quelli contro	609-quater and 609-octies of the		series of crimes that are not all
			coloro che siano stati dichiarati	criminal code, and those against		reasonable to consider so

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
1210	010000000000000000000000000000000000000	provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	00333303337 10030333
		,	Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
			delinquenti abituali, professionali	all those who have been declared		"important"- "imperative"- to be able
			e per tendenza, o recidivi ai sensi	habitual offenders, professional		to justify an expulsion decision. For
			dell'articolo 99, quarto comma,	offenders or offenders by		instance the crimes indicated in Art. 1
			del codice penale, qualora la pena	tendency, or repeat offenders		Law n. 1423/1956.
			superi due anni soli o congiunti a	under Article 99, paragraph four		
			pena pecuniaria.	of the criminal code, if the		The situation is therefore again
			2. Se vi è il consenso anche della	penalty exceeds two years alone		ambiguous and intricate and not
			parte che non ha formulato la	or in conjunction with the		straight forward to assess. But it is
			richiesta e non deve essere	pecuniary sentence.		the expert' opinion for all the above
			pronunciata sentenza di	2. In the event of consent by the		that the transposition is incorrect
			proscioglimento a norma dell'articolo 129, il giudice, sulla	party that did not make the		because not proportional.
			base degli atti, se ritiene corrette	request, if no acquittal need be pronounced under Article 129,		
			la qualificazione giuridica del	the judge may, on the basis of		
			fatto, l'applicazione e la	the documentation of the case, if		
			comparazione delle circostanze	he considers the legal		
			prospettate dalle parti, nonché	qualification of the act,		
			congrua la pena indicata, ne	application and comparison of		
			dispone con sentenza	circumstances set forth by the		Art. 20.3 D.Lgs n. 30/07 will be
			l'applicazione enunciando nel	parties to be correct and the		replaced if if the draft Legislative
			dispositivo che vi è stata la	sentence to be appropriate, order		decree amending and supplementing
			richiesta delle parti. Se vi è	application by stating that it has		D.Lgs n. 30/07 is finally adopted.
			costituzione di parte civile, il	been requested by the parties. If		
			giudice non decide sulla relativa	a civil case has been launched,		
			domanda; l'imputato è tuttavia	the judge shall not make a		
			condannato al pagamento delle	decision regarding the		
			spese sostenute dalla parte civile,	application; the accused shall in		
			salvo che ricorrano giusti motivi	any case by punished to pay the		
			per la compensazione totale o	expenses incurred by the party		
			parziale. Non si applica la	launching the civil case unless		
			disposizione dell'articolo 75,	there is just reason for total or		
			comma 3.	partial compensation. The		
			3. La parte, nel formulare la	provisions of Article 75,		
			richiesta, può subordinarne l'efficacia, alla concessione della	paragraph 3 shall not apply. 3. In making the request, the		
			sospensione condizionale della	party may make its efficacy		
			pena. In questo caso il giudice,	subject to concession of		
			seritiene che la sospensione	conditional suspension of the		
			condizionale non può essere	sentence. In this case the judge		
			concessa, rigota la ricinosta.			
			concessa, rigetta la richiesta.	will reject the request if he considers it impossible to grant		

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

A4	C'4-4'	G1'1	Complete to the first to the	The state of the state of	E-II- '-	C
Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of Member State)	national provision	accord? (y/n)	
			Member State)	conditional suspension.	(y/II)	
				conditional suspension.		
			Art. 1 Legge 27 dicembre 1956, n.	- Article 1 of Law n. 1423 of 27		
			1423 Misure di prevenzione nei	December 1956		
			confronti delle persone pericolose	The provisions of this Law shall		
			per la sicurezza e per la pubblica	apply:		
			moralità.(1) [(1) Vedi, ora, l'art. 1,	1) when on the basis of factual		
			L. 3 agosto 1988, n. 327, che ha	elements it is believed that the		
			soppresso l'istituto della diffida	persons concerned, are habitual		
			del questore della presente legge.]	to criminal traffic/trade;		
			Art. 1.	2) when on the basis of factual		
			I provvedimenti previsti dalla	elements it is believed that the		
			presente legge si applicano a:	persons concerned, for the		
			1) coloro che debba ritenersi, sulla	behaviour they have and the		
			base di elementi di fatto, che sono	standard of living, they normally		
			abitualmente dediti a traffici	live, even if only partly, with		
			delittuosi; 2) coloro che per la condotta ed il	criminal activities' gains; 3) when on the basis of factual		
			tenore di vita debba ritenersi, sulla	elements it is believed that the		
			base di elementi di fatto, che	persons concerned, for the		
			vivono abitualmente, anche in	behaviour they have, they are		
			parte, con i proventi di attività	involved in criminal activities		
			delittuose;	that offend or threat moral or		
			3) coloro che per il loro	physical integrity, the healthcare,		
			comportamento debba ritenersi,	public security or peace.		
			sulla base di elementi di fatto, che			
			sono dediti alla commissione di			
			reati che offendono o mettono in			
			pericolo l'integrità fisica o morale			
			dei minorenni, la sanità, la			
			sicurezza o la tranquillità pubblica			
			(1).			
			(1) Articolo sostituito dall'articolo 2 della legge 3 agosto 1988, n.			
			2 dena legge 3 agosto 1988, n. 327.			
			341.			
			Art. 1 Legge 31 maggio 1965 n.	- Art. 1 of Law n. 575 of 31 May		
			575 Disposizioni contro la mafia.	1965		
			Art 1	The present Law shall apply to		
			1. La presente legge si applica agli	persons suspected to belong to		
			indiziati di appartenere ad	associations of mafia style, to		

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord? (y/n)	Comments/Problems
			associazioni di tipo mafioso, alla camorra o ad altre associazioni, comunque localmente denominate, che perseguono finalità o agiscono con metodi corrispondenti a quelli delle associazioni di tipo mafioso.	however locally called, that have objectives equal to the associations of mafia style or act with methods that correspond to		
		New Art. 20.11 D.Lgs n. 30/07 as replaced by Art. 1.1 c) D.Lgs n. 32/08 Art. 9 Law Decree 92/08	11. Il provvedimento di allontanamento per motivi di sicurezza dello Stato e per motivi imperativi di pubblica sicurezza è immediatamente eseguito dal questore e si applicano le disposizioni di cui all'articolo 13, comma 5-bis, del decreto legislativo 25 luglio 1998, n. 286	public security grounds is immediately executed by the <i>Questore</i> and the provisions of Article 13.5bis ¹³ of Legislative		According to Article 13.5bis of Legislative Decree n. 286/1998, the enforcement of the expulsion measure is suspended until the decision validating of the judge. The person concerned is kept in Detention centres for the immigrants (centri di permanenza temporanea). After the validation of the measure concerning the accompanying to the border becomes executive. The person concerned may appeal the measure of validation before the court of cassation; so there is a certain procedural guarantee that is recognised although the fact of being kept in the mentioned centres represents a privation of the liberty of the person concerned. This provision is therefore not in compliance with the scope of the Directive. (to bear in mind that in the hearing of validation of the judge (giudice di pace) always assess the legitimacy of the requirements for the expulsion).
						Law Decree 92/08 has changed the names of the Detention centres for the immigrants (<i>centri di permanenza temporanea e assistenza</i>). They are

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord? (y/n)	Comments/Problems
						now called "centro di identificazione ed espulsione", that is "Identification and expulsion centres". This does not change the assessment since in any case they represent a privation of the liberty of the person concerned. Art. 20.11 D.Lgs n. 30/07 will be amended if the draft Legislative decree amending and supplementing D.Lgs n. 30/07 is finally adopted.
	(b) are a minor, except if the expulsion is necessary for the best interests of the child, as provided for in the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child of 20 November 1989.	New Art. 20.7 D.Lgs n. 30/07 as replaced by Art. 1.1 c) D.Lgs n. 32/08	[] o che siano minorenni possono essere allontanati solo per motivi di sicurezza dello Stato o per motivi di imperativi di pubblica sicurezza salvo l'allontanamento sia necessario nell'interesse stesso del minore, secondo quanto contemplato dalla Convenzione sui diritti del fanciullo del 20 novembre 1989, ratificata con legge 27 maggio 1991, n. 176.	[] or are a minor, may only be expelled on grounds of security of the State or imperative public security that threaten the security of the State except if the expulsion is necessary for the best interests of the minor, as provided for in the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child of 20 November 1989.	N, Incorrect	Incorrect transposition The Directive only refers to "imperative grounds of public security", while the transposing Decree also refer to "State security" grounds. In this regard refer to the comment made under Article 28 (3).
Art. 29.1	Public health 1. The only diseases justifying measures restricting freedom of movement shall be the diseases with epidemic potential as defined by the relevant instruments of the World Health Organisation and other infectious diseases or contagious parasitic diseases if they are the subject of protection provisions applying to nationals of the host Member State.	New Art. 20.8 D.Lgs n. 30/07 as replaced by Art. 1.1 c) D.Lgs n. 32/08	8. Le malattie o le infermità che possono giustificare limitazioni alla libertà di circolazione sul territorio nazionale sono solo quelle con potenziale epidemico individuate dall'Organizzazione mondiale della sanità, nonché altre malattie infettive o parassitarie contagiose, sempreche' siano oggetto di disposizioni di protezione che si applicano ai cittadini italiani. []	8. The diseases or illnesses/infirmities justifying measures restricting freedom of movement in the national territory shall be the diseases with epidemic potential as defined by the relevant instruments of the World Health Organisation and other infectious diseases or contagious parasitic diseases if they are the subject of protection provisions applying to Italian citizens [].	Y	Almost literal transposition The transposing Decree also refers to illnesses/infirmities. This however, cannot be considered as a problem because according to the dictionary "infirmity" is defined as a disease (person who is ill); moreover the Italian provision specifies, as the Directive, that those diseases and illnesses [] are those defined by the World Health Organisation [] and that therefore have an "epidemic potential"[].
Art.29.2	2. Diseases occurring after a three-month period from the date of arrival shall not				Y	Effective transposition

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of	Translation into English of national	Fully in accord?	Comments/Problems
	constitute grounds for expulsion from the territory.	32/08	Member State) territorio nazionale non possono giustificare l'allontanamento.	provision grounds for expulsion.	(y/n)	The Italian Decree fails to specify the period of three-month. This implies that diseases occurring even before the three-month period from the date of arrival cannot constitute a ground for expulsion from the territory. In this regard the transposing provision is more favourable.
Art.29.3	3. Where there are serious indications that it is necessary, Member States may, within three months of the date of arrival, require persons entitled to the right of residence to undergo, free of charge, a medical examination to certify that they are not suffering from any of the conditions referred to in paragraph 1. Such medical examinations may not be required as a matter of routine.				NT	Not transposed
Art.30.1	Notification of decisions 1. The persons concerned shall be notified in writing of any decision taken under Article 27(1), in such a way that they are able to comprehend its content and the implications for them.	New Art. 20.9.Lgs n. 30/07 as replaced by Art. 1.1 c) D.Lgs n. 32/08	9. Il Ministro dell'interno adotta i provvedimenti di allontanamento [per motivi imperativi di pubblica sicurezza dei soggetti di cui al comma 7, nonche' i provvedimenti di allontanamento per motivi di ordine pubblico o di sicurezza dello Stato. Negli altri casi, i provvedimenti di allontanamento sono adottati dal prefetto del luogo di residenza o dimora del destinatario.	9. The Ministry of Interior adopts the expulsion measures based on imperative public security grounds of the persons referred to in paragraph 7 and it also adopts the expulsion measures based on public order or security of the State grounds. In the other cases, the expulsion measures are adopted by the <i>Prefetto</i> of the place of residence or <i>dimora</i> /address of the person concerned.	Y	Effective transposition Although the Italian Decree uses a different wording, the substance of the provision corresponds to the Directive. Art. 20.9 and 20.17 describe the procedure for the adoption of the expulsion measures. The obligation that the notification must be in written is not expressly mentioned since in Italy when it is
		New Art. 20.17 as introduced by Art. 1.1 c) D.Lgs n. 32/08	17. I provvedimenti di allontanamento di cui al presente articolo sono adottati tenendo conto anche delle segnalazioni motivate del sindaco del luogo di residenza o di dimora del destinatario del provvedimento.	17. Expulsion measures referred to in this Article are adopted taking also into account the grounded recommendations of the Major of the place of residence or of the dimora/address of the person concerned.		referred to notification this can only be in written, so it is implied. (Also refer to Articles 137-147 of the CPC regarding notifications). The Italian provision seems to be sufficiently detailed so to let comprehend the content and

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
1110	Charlon of the firefee of the Breetive	provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	Comments/11001ems
			Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
		New Art. 20.10 .Lgs n. 30/07 as replaced by Art. 1.1 c) D.Lgs n. 32/08	10. I provvedimenti di allontanamento [] Se il destinatario non comprende la lingua italiana, il provvedimento è accompagnato da una traduzione del suo contenuto, anche mediante appositi formulari, sufficientemente dettagliati, redatti in una lingua a lui comprensibile o, se cio' non e' possibile per indisponibilità di personale idoneo alla traduzione del provvedimento in tale lingua, comunque in una delle lingue francese, inglese, spagnola o tedesca, secondo la preferenza indicata dall'interessato. II provvedimento e' notificato all'interessato []	10. [] If the person concerned does not comprehend the Italian language, then the expulsion measure is accompanied by a translation of its content, also using suitable models, sufficiently detailed, written in a language that the person concerned is able to comprehend or if this is not possible for lack of translation's personnel, in any event in French, English, Spanish or German, according the preference indicated by the person concerned. The persons concerned shall be notified the expulsion measure.	(var)	implications of the measures. From the practical point of view, lawyers working on a daily basis on these issues, namely on expulsion of foreign nationals, have reported that the expulsion measure and all procedural documents are always translated or a translator is always present even when the person concerned understands very well Italian. This is an important guarantee.
		New Art. 20 <i>ter</i> as introduced by Art. 1.1 d) D.Lgs n. 32/08	(Art.20-ter Autorità giudiziaria competente per la convalida dei provvedimenti del questore) 1. Ai fini della convalida dei provvedimenti emessi dal questore ai sensi degli articoli 20 e 20-bis, e' competente il tribunale ordinario in composizione monocratica;	(Art. 20-ter Competent judicial authority for the validation of the measures adopted by the <i>questore</i>) 1. The ordinary court composed by one judge (monocratic) shall be competent for the validation of the measures given by the <i>questore</i> according to Articles 20 and 20-bis;		These are additional procedural norms added by the Italian Decree. (Also refer to Art. 30(3) of the Directive and in particular to Art.20-bis of the national legislation on pending criminal proceeding on the person concerned with expulsion measure).
Art.30.2	2. The persons concerned shall be informed, precisely and in full, of the public policy, public security or public health grounds on which the decision taken in their case is based, unless this is contrary to the interests of State security.	New Art. 20.10 D.Lgs n. 30/07 as replaced by Art. 1.1 c) D.Lgs n. 32/08	10. I provvedimenti di allontanamento sono motivati , salvo che vi ostino motivi attinenti alla sicurezza dello Stato. []	10. The expulsion measures explain the grounds of the decision, unless this is contrary to the interests of State security. []	N, Incorrect and Incomplet e	Incorrect and incomplete transposition New Art. 20.10 of D.Lgs n. 30/07 fails to specify that the grounds shall be precise and explained in full. This represents a gap and at the same time an issue of incorrect transposition of

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord? (y/n)	Comments/Problems
Art.30.3	The notification shall specify the court	New Art. 20.10 D.Lgs n. 30/07	[] Il provvedimento e' notificato	[] The persons concerned	N,	the provision. Incorrect transposition.
Alt.30.3	or administrative authority with which the person concerned may lodge an appeal, the time limit for the appeal and, where applicable, the time allowed for the person to leave the territory of the Member State. Save in duly substantiated cases of urgency, the time allowed to leave the territory shall be not less than one month from the date of notification.	as replaced by Art. 1.1 c) D.Lgs n. 32/08	all'interessato e riporta le modalità di impugnazione e, salvo quanto previsto al comma 11, indica il termine stabilito per lasciare il territorio nazionale che non puo' essere inferiore ad un mese dalla data della notifica e, nei casi di comprovata urgenza, puo' essere ridotto a dieci giorni. Il provvedimento indica anche la durata del divieto di reingresso che non puo' essere superiore a dieci anni nei casi di allontanamento per i motivi di sicurezza dello Stato e a cinque anni negli altri casi.	shall be notified the expulsion measure that shall also specify the appeal procedures and, except for what provided in par. 11, it shall specify the time allowed for the person to leave the national territory that cannot be less than one month from the date of notification, and in substantiated cases of urgency, the time can be reduced of ten days. The measure shall also specify the duration of the ban to entry that cannot be more than ten years when the expulsion is based on grounds of State security and five years in the other cases.	Incorrect	In general, the Directive has a more uniform structure as compared to the transposing provision. New Art. 20.10 of D.Lgs n. 30/07 does not mention the "the time limit for the appeal"; In Italy, all measures must indicate a time limit since the lack of mentioning the time limit is seen in Italy as a breach of the right of defence. Contrary to what said in the Directive, the transposing Decree refers to expulsions that are immediately enforced (in the case of State security or imperative public security grounds - par. 11 of Art. 20.10). For these expulsions there is therefore no time limit Parr 11 of Art. 20 of the Italian Decree says that in case of State security grounds - the expulsions measures are immediately enforced. Therefore the provision requiring the time allowed for the person to leave the territory of the Member State is obviously not inserted. The time limit "no less than a month and 10 days for urgent cases" are foreseen for measures other than the ones referred to in par. 11 of Art. 20.10: the case of State

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of Member State)	national provision	accord? (y/n)	
					-	security or imperative public security grounds.
						In this sense the Italian provision appears to be incorrect since Italy seems to require less condition to take an immediate expulsion decision. (Directive says "duly substantiated cases of urgency" while The Italian Decree refers simply to "case of State security or imperative public security grounds". As explained when analysing Art. 27 those can be anything.
						The Italian provisions also specifies the duration of the ban (5 years and 10 years). The Directive does not refer to the duration of the ban but this does not create problems of compatibility with the text of the Directive because it actually provides legal certainty.
		New Art. 20 bis as introduced by Art. 1.1 d) D.Lgs n. 32/08	(Art.20-bis Procedimento penale pendente a carico del destinatario del provvedimento di allontanamento) 1. Qualora il destinatario del provvedimento di allontanamento di cui all'articolo 20, commi 11 e 12, sia sottoposto a procedimento	(Art.20-bis Pending criminal proceeding on the person concerned with expulsion measure) 1. When the person concerned with the expulsion measure referred to in Art. 20.11 and 20.12, is subject to a criminal		Art.20-bis sets several procedural rules by referring to the provisions of D.Lgs n. 286/98 that will apply when the expulsion measure of a person who is subject to a criminal proceeding is based on: - State security - imperative public security grounds
			penale, si applicano le disposizioni di cui all'articolo 13, commi 3, 3-bis, 3-ter, 3-quater e quinquies, del decreto legislativo 25 luglio 1998, n. 286. 2. Il nulla osta di cui all'articolo 13, comma 3, del decreto	proceeding, provisions of Art. 13 par. 3, 3-bis, 3-ter, 3-quater e quinquies, of Legislative Decree 25 July 1998, n. 286 shall apply. 2. The authorisation referred to in Art. 13.3 of Legislative Decree 25 July 1998, n. 286, is		The expulsion is always taken by a decree that contains the reasons of it and that is immediately executive. The Decree however, can be challenged or appealed by the interested person. If it is needed for procedural reasons,

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
AIt	Citation of the Article of the Directive	provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	Comments/1 Toblems
		Provision (regar rest es ares)	Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
			legislativo 25 luglio 1998, n. 286,	considered as granted when the		then the Questore shall obtain an
			si intende concesso qualora	judicial authority does not act		authorisation from the judicial
			l'autorita' giudiziaria non	within 48 hours from the date of		authority before expelling the person
			provveda entro quarantotto ore	receiving the request. 3.		concerned (Art. 13.3 D.Lgs n.
			dalla data di ricevimento della			286/98); in case of arrest <i>flagrante</i>
			richiesta.			delicto the authorisation is given
				3. The judgment refereed to in		when confirming the arrest (precisely after the validation of the judge)
			3. Non si da' luogo alla sentenza	Art. 13.3- quarter of the		(13.3. bis D.Lgs n. 286/98).
			di cui all'articolo 13, comma 3-	mentioned Legislative Decree 25		(13.3. 018 D.Lgs II. 200/76).
			quater, del citato decreto	July 1998, n. 286 is not given if		Par. 3 Art. 20 bis provides that a
			legislativo n. 286 del 1998,	a proceeding is started for crimes		judgment stating "not to proceed" is
			qualora si proceda per i reati di	referred to in Art. 380 of the		not given when a proceeding is
			cui all'articolo 380 del codice di	Criminal procedural Code.		started for crimes referred to in Art.
			procedura penale.			380 CPP, e.g., arrest flagrante delicto
				4. When the pending criminal		for crimes against the State, against
			4. Quando il procedimento penale	proceeding relates crimes		public safety, etc
			pendente sia relativo ai reati di cui	referred to in Art. 380 of the		The crimes referred to in Art. 380
			all'articolo 380 del codice di procedura penale, si può	Criminal Procedural Code, then the expulsion is only possible		CPP, are considered as particularly serious since they require an
			procedura penale, si può procedere all'allontanamento solo	when the person concerned is		immediate arrest of the person
			nell'ipotesi in cui il soggetto non	not subject to a precautionary		concerned (e.g., crimes against the
			sia sottoposto a misura cautelare	detentive measure for any		personality of the State, the crime of
			detentiva per qualsiasi causa.	reason.		devastation and pillaging, crimes
						against the public safety, the crime of
						enslavement, crimes committed for
						the purposes of terrorism or
						subversion of the constitutional order,
						etc.).
			5. In deroga alle disposizioni sul	5. By way of derogation from		
			divieto di reingresso, il	the provisions concerning the		Par.5 Art. 20 bis recognises the right
			destinatario del provvedimento di	ban on re-entry in the territory,		of the person concerned with the
			allontanamento, sottoposto ad un	the person concerned with the		expulsion measure and who is subject
			procedimento penale ovvero parte	expulsion measure, who is		to a criminal proceeding or offended
			offesa nello stesso, puo' essere	subject to a criminal proceeding		party in the same proceeding, to enter
			autorizzato a rientrare nel	or offended party in the same		the territory of the State for the time
			territorio dello Stato, dopo	proceeding, may be authorised		that is strictly necessary to exercise
			l'esecuzione del provvedimento,	to enter the territory of the		the right of defence. This is an
			per il tempo strettamente	State, after the enforcement of		important safeguard that is
			necessario all'esercizio del diritto	the measure, for the time that is		recognised.

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
AIL	Citation of the Article of the Directive	provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	Comments/11 objects
		Provision (regulation or unit)	Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
			di difesa, al solo fine di	strictly necessary to exercise		
			partecipare al giudizio o di	the right of defence., and on the		
			compiere atti per i quali e'	only purpose to participate to the		
			necessaria la sua presenza. Salvo	judgment or to do acts for which		
			che la presenza dell'interessato	his/her presence is necessary.		
			possa procurare gravi turbative o	Unless the presence of the		
			grave pericolo all'ordine pubblico	interested party may cause		
			o alla sicurezza pubblica,	serious disturbance/troubles or		
			l'autorizzazione e' rilasciata dal	serious danger to the public		
			questore, anche per il tramite di	order or public security, the		
			una rappresentanza diplomatica o consolare, su documentata	authorisation is given by the <i>questore</i> , also through a consular		
			richiesta del destinatario del	or diplomatic representation,		
			provvedimento di allontanamento,	following a request of the person		
			o del suo difensore.	concerned with the expulsion		
			der sao arrensore.	measure, or of his/her defending		
				counsel.		
			TESTI RICHIAMATI DALL Art.	PROVISIONS REFERRED TO		
			Art. 20 <i>bis</i>	BY Art. New Art. 20 bis		
			-Art. 13 par. 3, 3-bis, 3-ter, 3-	-Art. 13 par. 3, 3-bis, 3-ter, 3-		
			quater e quinquies, of Legislative	quater e quinquies, of		
			Decree 25 July 1998, n. 286	Legislative Decree 25 July 1998,		
			Art. 13	n. 286		
			Espulsione amministrativa []	Art. 13 Administrative expulsion		
			3. L'espulsione é disposta in	[]		
			ogni caso con decreto motivato	3. Expulsion is always		
			immediatamente esecutivo, anche	ordered with a motivated,		
			se sottoposto a gravame o	immediately executive decree,		
			impugnativa da parte	even if subject to encumbrances		
			dell'interessato. Quando lo	or challenges by the party		
			straniero é sottoposto a	involved. If a foreign citizen is		
			procedimento penale e non si	subject to criminal proceedings		
			trova in stato di custodia cautelare	and is not held in custody, the		
			in carcere, il questore, prima di	chief of police (questore) will,		
			eseguire l'espulsione, richiede il	before expelling the foreign		
			nulla osta all'autorità giudiziaria,	citizen, request a waiver from		
			che può negarlo solo in presenza	the court authority, which will		

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
1110	Citation of the fitties of the Birecuive	provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	
		provision (regarier et arti)	Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
			di inderogabili esigenze	only deny it if there is an	(j,)	
			processuali valutate in relazione	essential need to ascertain the		
			all'accertamento della	responsibility of any other		
			responsabilità di eventuali	parties involved in the office or		
			concorrenti nel reato o imputati in	accused of related offences in		
			procedimenti per reati connessi, e	court and in relation to the		
			all'interesse della persona offesa.	interests of the victim.		
			In tal caso l'esecuzione del	In this case execution of the		
			provvedimento é sospesa fino a	order is suspended until the court		
			quando l'autorità giudiziaria	authorities state that the person		
			comunica la cessazione delle	concerned is no longer needed in		
			esigenze processuali. Il questore,	relation to the court case. Having		
			ottenuto il nulla osta, provvede	obtain a waiver, the chief of		
			all'espulsione con le modalità di	police will proceed with		
			cui al comma 4. Il nulla osta si	expulsion as stated under		
			intende concesso qualora l'autorità	paragraph 4. The waiver shall be		
			giudiziaria non provveda entro	considered granted if the judicial		
			quindici giorni dalla data di	authorities do not issue it within		
			ricevimento della richiesta. In	fifteen days of receiving a		
			attesa della decisione sulla	request to do so. While awaiting		
			richiesta di nulla osta, il questore	a decision regarding the request		
			può adottare la misura del	for a waiver, the chief of police		
			trattenimento presso un centro di	may adopt the measure of		
			permanenza temporanea, ai sensi	detainment in a temporary		
			dell'art. 14.	holding centre pursuant to		
			3 bis. Nel caso di	Article 14.		
			arresto in flagranza o di fermo, il	3 bis. In the event of		
			giudice rilascia il nulla osta	arrest in flagrancy or provisional		
			all'atto della convalida, salvo che	arrest, the judge will issue a		
			applichi la misura della custodia	waiver upon validation, unless		
			cautelare in carcere ai sensi	the measure of precautionary		
			dell'art. 391, comma 5, del codice	custody is applied pursuant to		
			di procedura penale, o che ricorra	Article 391, paragraph 5 of the		
			una delle ragioni per le quali il	code of criminal proceedings or		
			nulla osta può essere negato ai	there are grounds for denial of		
			sensi del comma 3.	waiver under paragraph 3.		
			3 ter. Le disposizioni di	3 ter. The provisions		
			cui al comma 3 si applicano anche	of paragraph 3 shall also apply		
			allo straniero sottoposto a	to foreign citizens subjected to criminal proceedings after		
			procedimento penale, dopo che sia			
			stata revocata o dichiarata estinta	precautionary custody of the		

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

A4	Citation of the Auticle of the Discoting	Commenceding	Commists tout of motional	Translation into Eurolish of	E-11 :	Comments/Ducklesses
Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	
			Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
			per qualsiasi ragione la misura	person in prison has been		
			della custodia cautelare in carcere	revoked or declared extinguished		
			applicata nei suoi confronti. Il	for any reason. In the order in		
			giudice, con lo stesso	which the measure is revoked or		
			provvedimento con il quale	declared extinguished, the judge		
			revoca o dichiara l'estinzione della	shall also decide whether to		
			misura, decide sul rilascio del	issue a waiver for execution of		
			nulla osta all'esecuzione	expulsion. The order shall be		
			dell'espulsione. Il provvedimento	served to the chief of police		
			é immediatamente comunicato al	immediately.		
			questore.	3 quater. Under the		
			3 quater. Nei casi	circumstances described in		
			previsti dai commi 3, 3-bis e 3-ter,	paragraphs 3, 3-bis and 3-ter, the		
			il giudice, acquisita la prova	judge will, having acquired		
			dell'avvenuta espulsione, se non é	proof that expulsion has		
			ancora stato emesso il provvedimento che dispone il	occurred, issue an order not to		
				proceed if no order has yet been		
			giudizio, pronuncia sentenza di non luogo a procedere. E' sempre	issued regarding the sentence. Confiscation of the items		
			disposta la confisca delle cose	indicated in paragraph two of		
			indicate nel secondo comma	Article 240 of the Criminal		
			dell'art. 240 del codice penale. Si	Code shall still apply. The		
			applicano le disposizioni di cui ai	provisions of Article s 13, 13-		
			commi 13, 13-bis, 13-ter e 14.	bis, 13-ter and 14 will apply.		
			3 quinquies. Se lo	3 quinquies. If a		
			straniero espulso rientra	foreigner who has been expelled		
			illegalmente nel territorio dello	returns to the territory of the		
			Stato prima del termine previsto	State illegally before the		
			dal comma 14 ovvero, se di durata	deadline specified in paragraph		
			superiore, prima del termine di	14 or before the term specified		
			prescrizione del reato più grave	for the most serious offence with		
			per il quale si era proceduto nei	which the foreigner is charged, if		
			suoi confronti, si applica l'art. 345	longer, the provisions of Article		
			del codice di procedura penale. Se	345 of the Code of Criminal		
			lo straniero era stato scarcerato	Procedure shall apply. If the		
			per decorrenza dei termini di	foreign citizen was released		
			durata massima della custodia	from prison due to spending the		
			cautelare, quest'ultima é	maximum term of detention in		
			ripristinata a norma dell'art. 307	custody, this term shall be		
			del codice di procedura penale.	restored under Article 307 of		
			der estates at procedura politic.			
			dei codice di procedura penale.	the Code of Criminal Procedure.		

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord? (y/n)	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	Art. 380. CPP Arresto obbligatorio in flagranza. 1. Gli ufficiali e gli agenti di polizia giudiziaria procedono all'arresto di chiunque è colto in flagranza di un delitto non colposo, consumato o tentato, per il quale la legge stabilisce la pena dell'ergastolo o della reclusione non inferiore nel minimo a cinque anni e nel massimo a venti anni. 2. Anche fuori dei casi previsti dal comma 1, gli ufficiali e gli agenti di polizia giudiziaria procedono all'arresto di chiunque è colto in flagranza di uno dei seguenti delitti non colposi, consumati o tentati: a) delitti contro la personalità dello Stato previsti nel titolo I del libro II del codice penale per i quali è stabilita la pena della reclusione non inferiore nel minimo a cinque anni o nel massimo a dieci anni; b) delitto di devastazione e saccheggio previsto dall'articolo 419 del codice penale; c) delitti contro l'incolumità pubblica previsti nel titolo VI del libro II del codice penale per i quali è stabilita la pena della reclusione non inferiore nel minimo a tre anni o nel massimo a dieci anni; d) delitto di riduzione in schiavitù previsto dall'articolo	Art. 380. CPP Obligatory arrest in flagrante delicto. 1. The judicial police officials and officers shall arrest anyone who is caught in flagrante delicto in a non-negligible crime, whether committed or attempted, for which the law lays down a penalty of life imprisonment or five to twenty years' imprisonment. 2. Other than in the cases identified in paragraph 1, the judicial police officials and officers shall arrest anyone who is caught in flagrante delicto in one of the following nonnegligible crimes, whether committed or attempted: a) crimes against the personality of the State identified under Heading I of Book II of the Criminal Code for which the penalty is imprisonment for no less than five and no more than ten years; b) the crime of devastation and pillaging under Article 419 of the criminal code; a) crimes against the public safety identified under Heading VI of Book II of the Criminal Code for which the penalty is imprisonment for no less than three and no more than ten years; d) the crime of enslavement under Article 600, the crime of		
			600, delitto di prostituzione minorile previsto dall'articolo	under-aged prostitution under Article 600-bis, paragraph one,		

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord?	Comments/Problems
Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	•)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	Comments/Problems
			e di estorsione previsto dall'articolo 629 del codice penale;	number 4) of the criminal code; b) the crime of robbery under Article 628 of the criminal code		
			g) delitti di illegale fabbricazione, introduzione nello Stato, messa in vendita, cessione, detenzione e porto in luogo pubblico o aperto al pubblico di armi da guerra o	and extortion under Article 629 of the criminal code; g) the crimes of illegal manufacture, introduction into the State, sale, transfer,		
			tipo guerra o parti di esse, di esplosivi, di armi clandestine nonché di più armi comuni da	possession and bearing in a public place or a place open to the public weapons of war or		

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national provision	accord?	
			sparo escluse quelle previste	similar weapons or parts thereof,	(y/n)	
			dall'articolo 2, comma terzo, della	explosives, illegal weapons and		
			legge 18 aprile 1975, n. 110;	ordinary firearms other than		
			h) delitti concernenti sostanze	those identified in Article 2,		
			stupefacenti o psicotrope puniti a	paragraph three of law no. 110		
			norma dell'art. 73 del testo unico	of April 18 1975;		
			approvato con D.P.R. 9 ottobre	h) crimes regarding narcotics		
			1990, n. 309,[Produzione e	and psychotropic drugs		
			traffico illecito di sostanze	punishable under Article 73 of		
			stupefacenti o psicotrope] salvo	the sole text approved by		
			che ricorra la circostanza prevista	Presidential Decree no. 309 on		
			dal comma 5 del medesimo	October 9 1990 [Production and		
			articolo;	illegal trafficking in narcotics		
			i) delitti commessi per finalità di	and psychotropic substances]		
			terrorismo o di eversione	except in the presence of the		
			dell'ordine costituzionale per i	circumstances envisaged in		
			quali la legge stabilisce la pena	paragraph 5 of the same Article;		
			della reclusione non inferiore nel	i) crimes committed for the		
			minimo a quattro anni o nel massimo a dieci anni;	purposes of terrorism or subversion of the		
			l) delitti di promozione,	constitutional order for which		
			costituzione, direzione e	the law establishes a sentence of		
			organizzazione delle associazioni	imprisonment for no less than		
			segrete previste dall'articolo 1	four and no more than ten years;		
			della legge 25 gennaio 1982, n. 17	l) crimes of promotion,		
			, delle associazioni di carattere	constitution, direction and		
			militare previste dall'articolo 1	organisation of secret		
			della legge 17 aprile 1956, n. 561,	associations of the type		
			delle associazioni, dei movimenti	identified in Article 1 of law no.		
			o dei gruppi previsti dagli articoli	17 of January 25 1982, of		
			1 e 2, della legge 20 giugno 1952,	military associations of the type		
			n. 645, delle organizzazioni,	identified in Article 1 of law no.		
			associazioni, movimenti o gruppi	561 of April 17 1956, of the		
			di cui all'art. 3, comma 3, della L.	associations, movements or		
			13 ottobre 1975, n. 654;	groups identified in Articles 1		
			l-bis) delitti di partecipazione,	and 2 of law no. 645 of June 20		
			promozione, direzione e	1952, and of organisations,		
			organizzazione della associazione	associations, movements or		
			di tipo mafioso prevista	groups of the kind identified in		
			dall'articolo 416-bis del codice	Article 3, paragraph 3 of Law		
			penale;	no. 654 of October 13 1975;		

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord? (y/n)	Comments/Problems
			m) delitti di promozione, direzione, costituzione e organizzazione della associazione per delinquere prevista dall'articolo 416 commi 1 e 3 del codice penale, se l'associazione è diretta alla commissione di più delitti fra quelli previsti dal comma 1 o dalle lettere a), b), c), d), f), g), i) del presente comma. 3. Se si tratta di delitto perseguibile a querela, l'arresto in flagranza è eseguito se la querela viene proposta, anche con dichiarazione resa oralmente all'ufficiale o all'agente di polizia giudiziaria presente nel luogo. Se l'avente diritto dichiara di rimettere la querela, l'arrestato è posto immediatamente in libertà.	l-bis) crimes of participation, promotion, direction and organisation of mafia associations of the type identified in Article 416-bis of the criminal code; m) crimes of promotion, direction, establishment and organisation of criminal association under Article 416 paragraphs 1 and 3 of the criminal code, if the association's aim is committing crimes included among those identified in paragraph 1 or letters a), b), c), d), f), g), i) of this paragraph. 3. In the case of crimes which are prosecutable upon filing of a complaint, arrest may be conducted in flagrante if the complaint is filed, even in the form of an oral statement to the police officer or agent present on the scene. If the entitled party declares that he or she withdraws the complaint, the person arrested will be freed immediately.		
Art.31.1	Procedural safeguards 1. The persons concerned shall have access to judicial and, where appropriate, administrative redress procedures in the host Member State to appeal against or seek review of any decision taken against them on the grounds of public policy, public security or public health.	New Art. 22.1 and 22.2 D.Lgs n. 30/07 as replaced by Art. 1.1 e) D.Lgs n. 32/08	Art. 22 (Ricorsi contro i provvedimenti di allontanamento) 1. Avverso il provvedimento di allontanamento per motivi di sicurezza dello Stato di cui all'articolo 20, commi 1 e 2, e per motivi di ordine pubblico puo' essere presentato ricorso al Tribunale amministrativo regionale del Lazio, sede di Roma.	Art. 22 (Appeals against expulsion measures) 1. The measure referred to in Article 20.1 and 20.2 based on grounds of State security and public order, can be appealed/challenged before the Regional Administrative Court of Lazio, with seat in Rome.	Y	Effective transposition Effective transposition although the transposing Decree does not refer to "public health" grounds meaning that an appeal on public health grounds is not possible. This is because in Italy expulsions on grounds of public health do not seem to be possible.

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord?	Comments/Problems
			2. Avverso il provvedimento di allontanamento per motivi di pubblica sicurezza, per motivi imperativi di pubblica sicurezza e per i motivi di cui all'articolo 21 puo' essere presentato ricorso entro venti giorni dalla notifica, a pena di inammissibilità, al tribunale ordinario in composizione monocratica in cui ha sede l'autorità' che lo ha adottato. La parte puo' stare in giudizio personalmente. 3. I ricorsi di cui ai commi 1 e 2, sottoscritti personalmente dall'interessato, possono essere presentati anche per il tramite di una rappresentanza diplomatica o consolare italiana; in tale caso l'autenticazione e l'inoltro all'autorità giudiziaria italiana sono effettuati dai funzionari della rappresentanza. La procura speciale al patrocinante legale è rilasciata avanti all'autorita' consolare, presso cui sono eseguite le comunicazioni relative al procedimento.	2. The appeal against the expulsion measure based on public security, imperative public security and on Article 21's grounds shall be appealed/challenged within 20 days from the notification of the measure of expulsion (otherwise it becomes inadmissible) before the ordinary court in (monocratic composition) of the place where the authority that has issued it has its seat. 3. The appeal might also be brought an Italian diplomatic or consular representation; in this case the functionaries of the diplomatic representation certify the authenticity of the		
		Art. 8 D.Lgs n. 30/07	Art. 8 (Ricorsi avverso il mancato riconoscimento del diritto di soggiorno) 1. Avverso il provvedimento di rifiuto e revoca del diritto di cui agli articoli 6 e 7, e' ammesso ricorso al tribunale in composizione monocratica del	Art. 8 (Appeal against non recognition of the right of residence) 1. The measures refusing or revokes the rights provided for in Article 6 and 7, can be appealed before the monocratic Court of the place where the		Art. 8: This provision refers to redress procedures against the non recognition of the right of residence.

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
			luogo ove dimora il richiedente, il	person concerned resides		(Refer also to the comment inserted
			quale provvede, sentito	(dimora); the Court decides		above in correspondence with Article
			l'interessato, nei modi di cui agli	according to the procedures		27(1) of the Directive, concerning the
			articoli 737 e seguenti del codice di procedura civile.	referred to in Articles 737 and following of the civil procedural		more specific grounds of expulsion of the Italian Decree).
			di procedura civile.	code, after having heard the		the Italian Decree).
				person concerned.		
Art.31.2	2. Where the application for appeal	New Art. 22.4 D.Lgs n. 30/07 as	4. I ricorsi di cui ai commi 1 e 2		N,	Incorrect transposition
11100112	against or judicial review of the	replaced by Art. 1.1 e) D.Lgs n.	possono essere accompagnati da	paragraphs 1 and 2 may be	Incorrect	-
	expulsion decision is accompanied by an	32/08	una istanza di sospensione	accompanied by an application		The transposing provision fails to
	application for an interim order to		dell'esecutorietà del			refer to "where the persons concerned
	suspend enforcement of that decision,		provvedimento di allontanamento.	enforcement of the expulsion		have had previous access to judicial
	actual removal from the territory may not take place until such time as the decision		Fino all'esito dell'istanza di cui al presente comma, l'efficacia del	measure. Until the decision on the interim order has been taken,		review". In this regard the Italian Decree is more favourable.
	on the interim order has been taken,		provvedimento impugnato resta	the efficacy if the appealed		Decree is more ravourable.
	except:		sospesa, salvo che il	measure is suspended, except		Also, the reference to paragraphs 1
	— where the expulsion decision is based		provvedimento di allontanamento	when the expulsion is based		and 2 is incorrect as a consequence of
	on a previous judicial decision; or		si basi su una precedente	upon a previous judicial decision		the incorrectness described above in
	— where the persons concerned have		decisione giudiziale ovvero sia			correspondence of Art. 31.1 of the
	had previous access to judicial review; or		fondato su motivi di sicurezza	security or imperative public		Directive: the transposing provision
	— where the expulsion decision is based		dello Stato o su motivi imperativi	security.		fails to refer to "any decision" that
	on imperative grounds of public security under Article 28(3).		di pubblica sicurezza.			can undergo an appeal or review as it not includes public health grounds
	under Article 28(3).					But the provision appears to be more
						favourable since expulsion is not
						possible on public health grounds.
						The Directive only refers to
						"imperative grounds of public
						security", while the transposing
						Decree also refer to "State security" grounds. As already explained, State
						security grounds are very broad and
						therefore is a risk that the expulsion
						decision will never be suspended.
						Art. 22.4 D.Lgs n. 30/07 will be
						replaced if the draft Legislative
						decree amending and supplementing
						D.Lgs n. 30/07 is finally adopted.

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord? (y/n)	Comments/Problems
Art.31.3	3. The redress procedures shall allow for an examination of the legality of the decision, as well as of the facts and circumstances on which the proposed measure is based. They shall ensure that the decision is not disproportionate, particularly in view of the requirements laid down in Article 28.				Y	Not transposed as such, but effective However both the legality of the decision, as well as the facts and circumstances on which the proposed measure is based are made the object of redress procedures in Italy according to the general principles contained in the Civil Procedural Code.
Art.31.4	4. Member States may exclude the individual concerned from their territory pending the redress procedure, but they may not prevent the individual from submitting his/her defence in person, except when his/ her appearance may cause serious troubles to public policy or public security or when the appeal or judicial review concerns a denial of entry to the territory.	New Art. 22.2 D.Lgs n. 30/07 as replaced by Art. 1.1 e) D.Lgs n. 32/08 New Art. 22.6 D.Lgs n. 30/07 as replaced by Art. 1.1 e) D.Lgs n. 32/08	[] La parte può stare in giudizio personalmente. [] 6. Al cittadino comunitario o al suo familiare, qualunque sia la sua cittadinanza, cui è stata negata la sospensione del provvedimento di allontanamento sono consentiti, a domanda, l'ingresso ed il soggiorno nel territorio nazionale per partecipare al procedimento di ricorso, salvo che la sua presenza possa procurare gravi turbative o grave pericolo all'ordine pubblico o alla sicurezza pubblica. L'autorizzazione e' rilasciata dal questore anche per il tramite di una rappresentanza diplomatica o consolare su documentata richiesta dell'interessato.	appear in court. [] 6. The Union citizen or his/her family member, irrespective of nationality, who has been denied the suspension of the enforcement of the expulsion,	Y	Effective transposition The combination of the two provisions leads to an effective transposition.
		New Art. 22. 5D.Lgs n. 30/07 as replaced by Art. 1.1 e) D.Lgs n. 32/08	5. Sul ricorso di cui al comma 2, il tribunale decide a norma degli articoli 737, e seguenti, del codice	to Articles 737 and further of the		To summarise: General principle: the person concerned may submit his/her

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	
			Member State)	provision	(y/n)	defence in person.
			di procedura civile. Qualora i tempi del procedimento dovessero	appeals referred to in paragraph 2. When the proceeding exceed		defence in person.
			superare il termine entro il quale	the period of time within which		If this person has made a request for
			l'interessato deve lasciare il	the person concerned shall leave		suspension of the enforcement of the
			territorio nazionale ed e' stata	the national territory and an		expulsion that has been accepted, this
			presentata istanza di sospensione	application for an interim order		person is not obliged to leave the
			ai sensi del comma 4, il giudice	of suspension has been made,		territory and can therefore participate
			decide con priorità sulla stessa prima della scadenza del termine	according paragraph 4, the judge decide by priority on that		to the proceeding.
			fissato per l'allontanamento.	application before the deadline		If the request for suspension of the
			Tassato per ranomanamento.	for expulsion.		enforcement of the expulsion is
				•		denied, then the person concerned
		New Art. 22. D.Lgs n. 30/07 as	7. Nel caso in cui il ricorso e'	7. If the appeal is rejected the		must leave the territory but upon a
		replaced by Art. 1.1 e) D.Lgs n.	respinto, l'interessato presente sul	concerned person who is in the		request to the <i>Questore</i> can renter the
		32/08	territorio dello Stato deve lasciare immediatamente il territorio	territory of the State shall immediately leave the national		territory in order to participate to the appeal proceeding, "except when
			nazionale.	territory.		his/her appearance may cause serious
			nuzionare.	territory.		troubles or serious threat to public
						order and security".
						These are procedural norms.
						This provision in part also refer to the
						personal appearance of the individual
						concerned in the hearing, giving the
						time limits for the judge to decide in
						the merit of the application for an interim order of suspension and the
						immediate expulsion of the
						individual concerned (who is in the
						territory of the State) when the
						appeal is denied.
						Art. 22.5 D.Lgs n. 30/07 will be
						amended if the draft Legislative
						decree amending and supplementing D.Lgs n. 30/07 is finally adopted.
Art.32.1	Duration of exclusion orders	New Art. 20.13 D.Lgs n. 30/07	13. Il destinatario del	13. The persons concerned may	N,	Incorrect transposition
		as replaced by Art. 1.1 c) D.Lgs	provvedimento di allontanamento	submit an application for lifting	Incorrect	
	1. Persons excluded on grounds of public	n. 32/08	può presentare domanda di revoca	of the exclusion order after at		More stringent transposition since
	policy or public security may submit an		del divieto di reingresso dopo che,	least half of the duration of the		referring to "at least half of the

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national	Complete text of national	Translation into English of	Fully in	Comments/Problems
7111	Citation of the firedee of the Birective	provision (legal ref. & art.)	provision (in language of	national	accord?	Commency Fronting
			Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
	application for lifting of the exclusion		dall'esecuzione del	ban or in any event after three		duration of the ban "limit does not
	order after a reasonable period,		provvedimento, sia decorsa	years from enforcement of the		imposed by the Directive, which
	depending on the circumstances, and in any event after three years from		almeno la metà della durata del divieto, e in ogni caso decorsi tre	final exclusion order. The application shall put forward		refers to a change in circumstances, which could occur before that half
	enforcement of the final exclusion order		anni. Nella domanda devono	arguments to establish that there		elapsed.
	which has been validly adopted in		essere addotti gli argomenti intesi	has been a material change in the		ciapsed.
	accordance with Community law, by		a dimostrare l'avvenuto oggettivo	circumstances which justified		
	putting forward arguments to establish		mutamento delle circostanze che	the decision ordering their		
	that there has been a material change in		hanno motivato la decisione di	exclusion from the national		
	the circumstances which justified the		vietare il reingresso nel territorio	territory. []		
	decision ordering their exclusion.		nazionale. []			
	The Member State concerned shall reach	New Art. 20.13 D.Lgs n. 30/07	[] Sulla domanda, entro sei	[] The Authority that given the	Y	Correct transposition
	a decision on this application within six	as replaced by Art. 1.1 c) D.Lgs	mesi dalla sua presentazione,	expulsion measure shall reach a		
	months of its submission.	n. 32/08	decide con atto motivato l'autorità	decision on this application		
			che ha emanato il provvedimento di allontanamento. []	within six months of its submission, by an act giving the		
				grounds of it. []		
Art.32.2	2. The persons referred to in paragraph 1	New Art. 20.13 D.Lgs n. 30/07	[] Durante l'esame della		Y	Almost literal transposition
	shall have no right of entry to the	as replaced by Art. 1.1 c) D.Lgs	domanda l'interessato non ha			
	territory of the Member State concerned while their application is being	n. 32/08	diritto di ingresso nel territorio	territory of the Member State concerned while their		
	considered.		nazionale.	application is being considered.		
	considered.			application is being considered.		
Art.33.1	Expulsion as a penalty or legal consequence				NT	Not transposed
	consequence					Exclusion order as penalty can be
	1. Expulsion orders may not be issued by					imposed only when the crime is a
	the host Member State as a penalty or					breach of the provisions on
	legal consequence of a custodial penalty,					immigration. So if a non Italian
	unless they conform to the requirements					citizen commits another kind of
	of Articles 27, 28 and 29.					crime but he /she is legally in the
						national territory then he/she cannot be expelled but is subject to the same
						sanctions provided for Italian
						citizens.
						However, it is preferable to assess a
						non transposition since, as already
						commented in correspondence to Art.

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of	Translation into English of national	Fully in accord?	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
						28 (1) to the Directive, there is no expulsion when the crime committed is serious (as murder etc). However in practice, in relation to non EU citizens, for less serious crimes the
						judge often takes expulsion measures. It needs to be checked in practice if this does not apply to EU citizens.
Art.33.2	2. If an expulsion order, as provided for in paragraph 1, is enforced more than				NT	Not transposed
	two years after it was issued, the Member State shall check that the individual					If the first part does not apply, then no need to transpose this one since it
	concerned is currently and genuinely a threat to public policy or public security					refers to limits according to first paragraph.
	and shall assess whether there has been					paragraph.
	any material change in the circumstances since the expulsion order was issued.					
Art.34	Publicity Member States shall disseminate information concerning the rights and obligations of Union citizens and their family members on the subjects covered by this Directive, particularly by means of awareness-raising campaigns conducted through national and local media and other means of communication.	Art. 25.1 D.Lgs n. 30/07	Art. 25 (Norme finali e abrogazioni) 1. Le amministrazioni competenti provvederanno, senza nuovi o maggiori oneri a carico della finanza pubblica, a diffondere tramite i propri siti internet i contenuti del presente decreto. []	Art. 25 (Final provisions and repeals) 1. The competent authorities shall disseminate through their internet websites the content of this decree, with no new or additional burden for the public finance. []	Y	Effective transposition
Art.35	Abuse of rights				NT	Not transposed
	Member States may adopt the necessary measures to refuse, terminate or withdraw any right conferred by this Directive in the case of abuse of rights or fraud, such as marriages of convenience. Any such measure shall be proportionate and subject to the procedural safeguards provided for in Articles 30 and 31.					It seems that Italy until 2002 has not regulated this issue (Cons Stato 22 May 2002, n. 1225: convenience marriage does not impede the right to have the Italian nationality for the foreigner national). There may be more cases in the next future.
						There is a project of Law that has been discussed at the Italian Council

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of	Translation into English of national	Fully in accord?	Comments/Problems
		provision (legal ref. & art.)	Member State)	provision	(y/n)	
						of Ministers on 21 May 2008 and that intends to change the provision on marriages of convenience amending Art. 5 Law 91/1992. In particular it will be more difficult to obtain the Italian nationality by marriage.
Art.36	Member States shall lay down provisions on the sanctions applicable to breaches of national rules adopted for the implementation of this Directive and shall take the measures required for their application. The sanctions laid down shall be effective and proportionate. Member States shall notify the Commission of these provisions not later than 30 April 2006 and as promptly as possible in the	New Art. 20.12 D.Lgs n. 30/07 as replaced by Art. 1.1 c) D.Lgs n. 32/08	12. Nei casi di cui al comma 10, se il destinatario del provvedimento di allontanamento si trattiene oltre il termine fissato, il questore dispone l'esecuzione immediata del provvedimento di allontanamento dell'interessato dal territorio nazionale. Si applicano, per la convalida del provvedimento del questore, le disposizioni del comma 11.	12. In the cases referred to in paragraph 10, if The person concerned with the expulsion decision remain in the territory of the State for longer than what provided for in the expulsion measure the <i>Questore</i> gives immediate execution/enforces to the expulsion measure from the national territory. Provisions of paragraph 11 apply to the validation of the measure adopted by the <i>Questore</i> .	Y	Effective transposition Only sanctions against breach of ban on entry have been applied in Italy. New Art. 20.12 foresees the sanction of expulsion if the person concerned with the expulsion decision remain in the territory of the State.
	case of any subsequent changes.	New Art. 21.4 D.Lgs n. 30/07 as replaced by Art. 1.1 e) D.Lgs n. 32/08	4. Qualora il cittadino dell'Unione o il suo familiare allontanato sia individuato sul territorio dello Stato oltre il termine fissato nel provvedimento di allontanamento, senza aver provveduto alla presentazione dell'attestazione di cui al comma 3, e' punito con l'arresto da un mese a sei mesi e con l'ammenda da 200 a 2.000 euro.	4. If the Union citizen or his/her family member expelled is located in the territory of the State for longer than what provided for in the expulsion measure, without having produced the certificate referred to in paragraph 3, is punished by arrest from one to six months and by a fine from 200 to 2.000 Euro.		As for the second part of the Directive's provision, Italy cannot have notified these sanctions by the 30 April 2006 since the Directive has only been transposed on 11 April 2007. It goes beyond the scope of this study to determine whether the sanctions mentioned in the national transposing provision constitute an effective, and proportional penalties. We assume conformity of transposition. However, looking at the possible range of sanctions provided, it is possible to conclude that they are
		New Art. 20.14 D.Lgs n. 30/07 as replaced by Art. 1.1 c) D.Lgs n. 32/08	14. Il destinatario del provvedimento di allontanamento, che rientra nel territorio nazionale in violazione del divieto di reingresso è punito con la	14. The person concerned with the expulsion decision, who enters the national territory, breaching the ban on entry, is punished by imprisonment until		reasonable. Art. 20.14 D.Lgs n. 30/07 will be amended if the draft Legislative decree amending and supplementing

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord? (y/n)	Comments/Problems
			reclusione fino a due anni nell'ipotesi di allontanamento per motivi di sicurezza dello Stato, ovvero fino ad un anno, nelle altre ipotesi. Il giudice puo' sostituire la pena della reclusione con la misura dell'allontanamento immediato con divieto di reingresso nel territorio nazionale, per un periodo da cinque a dieci anni. L'allontanamento e' immediatamente eseguito dal questore, anche se la sentenza non e' definitiva.	two years in the case of expulsion on State security grounds or imprisonment until one year in the other cases. The judge may replace imprisonment by the measure of immediate expulsion with the ban on re-entry in the national territory for a period from five to ten years. The expulsion is immediately enforced by the <i>Questore</i> even though the judgment is not yet final.		D.Lgs n. 30/07 is finally adopted.
		New Art. 20.15 D.Lgs n. 30/07 as replaced by Art. 1.1 c) D.Lgs n. 32/08	15. Si applica la pena della reclusione fino a tre anni, in caso di reingresso nel territorio nazionale in violazione della misura dell'allontanamento disposta ai sensi del comma 14, secondo periodo.	15. The person concerned with the expulsion decision is punished by imprisonment until thee years, if he/she has breached the expulsion order given according to paragraph 14, second indent.		Art. 20.15 D.Lgs n. 30/07 will be amended if the draft Legislative decree amending and supplementing D.Lgs n. 30/07 is finally adopted.
		New Art. 20.16 D.Lgs n. 30/07 as replaced by Art. 1.1 c) D.Lgs n. 32/08	16. Nei casi di cui ai commi 14 e 15 si procede con rito direttissimo. In caso di condanna, salvo che il giudice provveda ai sensi del comma 14, secondo periodo, e' sempre adottato un nuovo provvedimento di allontanamento immediatamente esecutivo, al quale si applicano le norme del comma 11.	16. In the cases referred to in paragraphs 14 and 15 it is proceed by a "direttissimo" proceeding. In case of conviction, except when the judge acts in accordance with paragraph 14, second indent, a new immediately enforceable expulsion measure is adopted; provisions of paragraph 11 shall apply.		Direttissimo proceeding (is a sort of summary procedure) allows for a quick procedure in specific cases i.e., when the person concerned is arrested in flagrance or the person confesses the commission of a crime.
Art.37	More favourable national provisions The provisions of this Directive shall not affect any laws, regulations or administrative provisions laid down by a	Art. 23 D.Lgs n. 30/07	Art. 23 (Applicabilità ai soggetti non aventi la cittadinanza italiana che siano familiari di cittadini italiani) 1. Le disposizioni del presente	Art. 23 (The Decree applies to persons with no Italian nationality who are family member of an Italian citizen)	Y	Effective transposition The Italian Decree expressly says that its provisions shall apply if more favourable as compared to other

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of	Translation into English of national	Fully in accord?	Comments/Problems
	Member State which would be more favourable to the persons covered by this Directive.		Member State) decreto legislativo, se più favorevoli, si applicano ai familiari di cittadini italiani non aventi la cittadinanza italiana.	provision legislative decree, if more favourable, are applied to family members of Italian citizens who do not have the Italian nationality.	(y/n)	existing provisions. As mentioned in the ToC sent to the Commission by the Italian Ministry of Interior Affairs, the transposing Decree has integrally replaced the previous provisions on residence and movement of Union citizens. Moreover, for the principle lex specialis derogates lex generalis, if more favourable provisions on specific sectors would exist then those latter provisions would apply.
Art.38	1. Articles 10 and 11 of Regulation (EEC) No 1612/68 shall be repealed with effect from 30 April 2006. 2. Directives 64/221/EEC, 68/360/EEC, 72/194/EEC, 73/148/EEC, 75/34/EEC, 75/35/EEC, 90/364/EEC, 90/365/EEC and 93/96/EEC shall be repealed with effect from 30 April 2006. 3. References made to the repealed provisions and Directives shall be construed as being made to this Directive.	Art. 25.2 D.Lgs n. 30/07	2. Alla data di entrata in vigore del presente decreto sono o restano abrogati il decreto del Presidente della Repubblica 30 dicembre 1965, n. 1656, il decreto legislativo 18 gennaio 2002, n. 52, il decreto del Presidente della Repubblica 18 gennaio 2002, n. 53, il decreto del Presidente della Repubblica 18 gennaio 2002, n. 54. 3. Il comma 4 dell'articolo 30 del decreto legislativo 25 luglio 1998, n. 286, e' abrogato.	2. At the date of entry into force of this decree, Presidential Decree of 30 December 1965, n. 1656, Legislative Decree 18 January 2002, n. 52, Presidential Decree 18 January 2002, n. 53, Presidential Decree 18 January 2002, n. 54, are or remain repealed 3. Paragraph 4 of Article 30 of Legislative Decree of 25 July 1998, n. 286, is repealed.		It has not been checked every single transposing Act of the mentioned Directives.
Art.39	No later than 30 April 2008 the Commission shall submit a report on the application of this Directive to the European Parliament and the Council, together with any necessary proposals, notably on the opportunity to extend the period of time during which Union citizens and their family members may reside in the territory of the host Member State without any conditions. The Member States shall provide the Commission with the information needed to produce the report.					

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University ITALY 127/130

Art	Citation of the Article of the Directive	Corresponding national provision (legal ref. & art.)	Complete text of national provision (in language of Member State)	Translation into English of national provision	Fully in accord? (y/n)	Comments/Problems
Art.40	Transposition 1. Member States shall bring into force the laws, regulations and administrative provisions necessary to comply with this Directive by 30 April 2006.				N	Late transposition: the Decree came into force on 11 April 2007, almost one year after the date indicated in the Directive. Following two different Law Decrees that were supposed to be converted into Law within 60 days from their adoption and were finally not converted, a new Legislative Decree has been adopted on the 6 February 2008 that entered into force on 2 March 2008.
	When Member States adopt those measures, they shall contain a reference to this Directive or shall be accompanied by such a reference on the occasion of their official publication. The methods of making such reference shall be laid down by the Member States.				Y	This provision can be considered as transposed, since the transposing Decree expressly refers to the transposition of Directive 2004/38/EC.
	2. Member States shall communicate to the Commission the text of the provisions of national law which they adopt in the field covered by this Directive together with a table showing how the provisions of this Directive correspond to the national provisions adopted.				N	The Commission has received the text of the main transposing Act (i.e., Legislative Decree 30/2007) and of further amendments; however, those latter (in particular Law Decree 181/2007) have not been finally approved by the Parliament. The last adopted Law Decree n. 249/2007 was not communicated and it has not finally b converted into Law by the Italian Parliament. A table showing how the provisions of this Directive correspond to the national provisions adopted has been prepared; however, the table is not updated with the newly adopted

Art. 8 f Law n. 69 of 22 April 2005 Article 8 (Obligatory extradition).

- 1. Extradition shall be implemented on the basis of the European arrest warrant, whether or not the accused is doubly incriminated, for the following acts, provided that, any aggravating circumstances excluded, the maximum sentence or security measures depriving the accused of personal liberty is three years or more:
- a) participation in an association of three or more people aimed at committing a series of crimes; b) performing acts threatening the public safety or acts of violence against people or property to the damage of a State, institution or international organisation with the purpose of subverting the constitutional order of a State or destroying or weakening national or supra-national political, economic or social structures;
- c) forcing or inducing one or more people, by violence, threat, deception or abuse of authority, to enter, stay in or leave the territory of a State, or move within the territory of a State, in order to subject them to slavery, forced labour, begging or exploitation of sexual services; d) inducing a child to prostitution or performing acts aimed at sexual exploitation or aiding and abetting of sexual exploitation of a child; performing acts aimed at exploitation of a child in order to produce pornographic material by any means; selling, distributing, disclosing or advertising pornographic material portraying a minor; e) selling, offering, transferring, distributing, marketing, purchasing, transporting, exporting, importing or procuring for others any substance considered narcotic or psychotropic under the law of European countries;
- f) marketing, purchasing, transporting, exporting or importing arms, munitions and explosives in violation of current legislation;
- g) receiving, accepting a promise of, giving or promising money or other profits in relation to performing or abstinence from performing an act involved in a public office;
- h) performing any act or intentional omission in relation to the use or presentation of false, inaccurate or incomplete declarations or documents leading to unlawful receiving or holding of funds or illegitimate subtraction of resources appearing in the budget of a State, in the overall budget of the European Communities or in budgets managed by the European Communities or on their behalf; performing any act or intentional omission regarding the misappropriation of such funds for purposes other than those for which they were initially granted; performing the same acts or omissions against a private person, a legal entity or a public institution; i) replacing or transferring money, goods or other utilities resulting from a crime, or conducting other transactions in relation to them, hindering identification of their illicit origin; l) counterfeiting national or foreign currency that is legal tender in the State or outside it or altering legal tender in any way so that it appears to be of greater value;
- m) commit, with the intention of procuring a profit for oneself or others or causing damage to others, an act aimed at entering or staying in a computer system or telecommunications system protected by security measures without authorisation, or damaging or destroying information or telecommunications systems, data, information or programmes contained in them or pertaining to them;
- n) endangering the environment with unauthorised dumping of hydrocarbons, waste oil or sludge from water treatment, releasing hazardous substances into the atmosphere, onto the ground or in water, treatment, transportation, storage or elimination of hazardous wastes, releasing wastes into the soil or water or illegally operating a landfill; possessing, capturing and dealing in protected animal and plant species;
- o) performing, with the aim of obtaining profit, acts directed at procuring illegal entry into the territory of a State of a person who is not a citizen of that State and is not entitled to permanent residency; p) intentionally causing the death of a man or personal injury of the same degree of severity as that identified in Article 583 of the criminal code:
- q) illegally procuring human organs or tissues or dealing in them in order to make a profit; r) depriving a person of personal liberty or holding a person in one's power by threatening death or injury or continuing to hold a person hostage in order to force a third party, whether it be a State, an international organisation among governments, a physical person or legal entity or a group of physical persons to perform any act or abstain from performing any act, subjecting the release of the person held to this act or omission;
- s) publicly inciting violence as an expression of racial hatred directed at a group of people, or a member of a group of people, because of the colour of their skin, their race, professed religion, or national or ethnic origin; promoting crimes against humanity inspired by racism or xenophobia;
- t) taking over possession of others' moveable property, removing it from its owner in order to gain a profit from it for oneself or for others, using arms or as a result of the activity of an organised group; u) unlawfully dealing in objects of cultural value, including antiques and works of art; v) inducing someone to commit an error, by artifice or deceit, to procure an unjust profit for oneself or others at another's expense;
- z) demanding by threat, use of force or any other form of intimidation, goods or promises or signature of any document containing or resulting in an obligation, alienation or receipt; aa) imitating or duplicating commercial products without authorisation in order to make a profit; bb) falsifying administrative deeds and trafficking in false documents;
- cc) falsifying documents of payment;
- dd) illegally trafficking hormonal substances and other growth factors; ee) illegally trafficking nuclear and radioactive materials;
- ff) purchasing, receiving or concealing stolen vehicles, or collaborating in any way in their purchase, reception and concealment in order procure a profit for oneself or others;
- gg) forcing someone to perform or be subjected to sexual acts with violence or threats or by abuse of authority; hh) causing a fire that endangers public safety;
- ii) committing crimes falling under the jurisdiction of the International Criminal Court;
- ll) taking over possession of a ship or aircraft;
- mm) illegally and intentionally causing damage to state structures, other public structures, public transportation systems or other infrastructures which result in or could result in significant economic loss.

Milieu Ltd ITALY 129/130
Europa Institute, Edinburgh University

- 2. The Italian judicial authorities shall determine the definition of crimes for which extradition is required under the law of the member State issuing the law, if it corresponds to the instance envisaged in paragraph 1.
- 3. If the act is not considered a crime under Italian law, an Italian citizen shall not be extradited if he or she was unaware, without fault, of the criminal law in the member state issuing the law on the basis of which the European arrest warrant was issued.

Milieu Ltd Europa Institute, Edinburgh University